Gig-jobs: Stepping stones or dead ends?☆

Adrian Adermon a,b, Lena Hensvik b,c

a IFAU, Box 513, Uppsala 75120, Sweden
b Uppsala University, Box 513, Uppsala 75120, Sweden

1. Introduction

In many countries, the labor market has become polarized, with marginal groups finding it increasingly difficult to find employment. In particular, low-skilled youth and migrants from refugee countries make up a large and increasing share of the unemployed (Förster et al., 2017). In parallel, there is a rise of a new form of non-traditional work—gig-jobs—with considerably lower entry barriers compared to most traditional wage jobs. An important question is therefore if these easily accessible—but low-paying—jobs provide labor market experience that is useful for marginal groups on the traditional labor market.

In this paper, we shed light on this question by studying how employees hiring on the traditional labor market value work experience from the gig-economy. We conducted a correspondence study in the Swedish labor market, submitting fictitious applications to entry-level vacancies. We compare the number of positive responses from employers for young applicants currently (i) employed by a well-known gig company; (ii) employed in a similar job in the traditional labor market; and (iii) in an ongoing unemployment spell lasting 7–15 months. We focus on young applicants since we are interested in the value of gig-job experience for labor market entrants. We also study the heterogeneous responses for applicants with Swedish vs. Arabic-sounding names, since abundant evidence shows that the latter group experiences particular difficulties of finding jobs on the traditional labor market. The choice of applicants is also relevant since youths and immigrant males are overrepresented in the gig-economy in our context (see Section 3).

Compared to unemployment, gig-experience could send a positive signal to employers about applicants’ motivation and effort. But, the low entry barriers in gig jobs, which are rarely preceded by a formal screening process, may lower the information value of such past work experience. Gig-experience could also signal a lack of options on the traditional labor market, and the solitary nature of many gig-jobs may make it more difficult for employers to verify the work experience. A priori, it is thus not clear how employers perceive experience from the gig-economy, and consequently if gig-jobs are useful as stepping stones

☆ We are grateful for comments from Stefan Eriksson, Martin Nybom, and Roland Rathelot, as well as seminar participants at IFAU, the 14th Nordic Summer Institute in Labor Economics in Uppsala, and the EALE/SOLE/AASLE World Conference 2020. Ulfhild Westin provided excellent research assistance. This experiment has been registered with the American Economic Association RCT Registry under number AEARCTR-0002766.

1 Corresponding author.

E-mail addresses: adrian.adermon@ifau.uu.se (A. Adermon), lena.hensvik@nek.uu.se (L. Hensvik).

2 IFAU, Uppsala Center for Labor Studies (UCLS), Uppsala Center for Fiscal Studies (UCFS).

3 Uppsala University, IFAU, Uppsala Center for Labor Studies (UCLS), CESifo and GEPR.

The term “gig jobs” refers to (predominantly service) jobs where workers are connected to consumers through a digital platform. Estimates of the size of the gig-economy vary substantially depending on exact definitions and measurement; survey evidence suggests that around 0.5–1 percent of the population in the US and Australia work through an online intermediary (Farrell and Greig, 2016b; Katz and Krueger, 2019; Minter, 2017; Stewart and Stanford, 2017). Using tax returns in the US, Collins et al. (2019) find that the share of earners participating in gig work mediated through online labor platforms grew by 1.9 percentage points from 2000 to 2016, and now accounts for 11.8 percent of the workforce. We describe the Swedish context in Section 3.

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.labeco.2022.102171

Received 14 September 2021; Received in revised form 8 April 2022; Accepted 13 April 2022
Available online 19 April 2022

0927-5371 © 2022 The Authors. Published by Elsevier B.V. This is an open access article under the CC BY license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)
to traditional employment or if workers are involuntarily stuck in these lower-paying working arrangements.\textsuperscript{4} Our findings suggest that for natives, experience in a gig job increases the call-back rate from employers compared to unemployment, but not as much as similar experience in the traditional labor market. More specifically, we find that gig-experience improves the contact rate by around 2 percentage points (or 11\%) compared to unemployment, while the impact of traditional experience is about twice as large. While this pattern suggests that participation in the gig-economy can lead to a slight improvement on the traditional labor market for the majority group (compared to unemployment), some caution is warranted, as only the difference between traditional employment and unemployment is statistically significant at the 5\% level.

Consistent with prior evidence from Sweden and elsewhere, we find that the callback rate of applicants with Swedish-sounding names is almost twice as high as the callback rate of applicants with Arabic-sounding names, indicating substantial ethnic discrimination in the Swedish labor market. The average callback rate across all three experience treatments is 10\% for applicants with Arabic-sounding names, and 19\% for applicants with Swedish-sounding names. But in stark contrast to the findings for the majority group, we find that no form of labor market experience (neither gig- nor traditional employment experience) increases the call-back rate compared to unemployment for applicants with Arabic-sounding names. This striking result is consistent with employers having such strong negative priors against this group that higher qualifications in terms of more experience do not improve the call-back rate. But it could also reflect that recruiters internalize the perceived circumstances faced by the job candidates (e.g., adverse labor market conditions for minorities), generating a less negative signal from past unemployment when the candidate belongs to a minority.\textsuperscript{5} While we have to leave further exploration of these mechanisms to future research, we conclude from our findings that gig-jobs do not seem to be an important stepping stone to traditional wage jobs for this group.

Our paper contributes to a growing literature (summarized in Section 2) on the extent and role of non-traditional work arrangements. Recent studies, mainly focusing on taxi drivers, suggest that workers value the flexibility and independence of gig-jobs (Chen et al., 2019; Hall and Krueger, 2018). At the same time, several studies indicate that many temporary and on-call workers would prefer permanent employment with regularly scheduled hours to their current employment arrangements (Boeri et al., 2020; Datta, 2019; Mas and Pallais, 2017).

Despite this, the question of how participation in the gig-economy impacts workers’ future labor market prospects has received surprisingly little attention. One reason is that gig-workers are difficult to identify in existing data sources (see Abraham et al., 2021, for a detailed discussion about measurement of non-traditional workers). However, even if participants in the gig-economy were easily distinguishable from other types of workers, an inherent concern is that it is difficult to separate the effects of working in a gig-job from the effects of other important worker characteristics which are observed by the recruiting firms but not by the researcher, potentially leading to biased estimates due to unobserved heterogeneity. In a recent study, Jackson (2020) combines variation in gig worker demand driven by the geographic roll-out of gig economy platforms, and individuals’ propensity for gig work to estimate the impact of gig work opportunities following job loss. Her results suggest that unemployed workers experience lower earnings losses in the short run, but that the availability of gig jobs is associated with earnings losses two to four years later.\textsuperscript{6} In relation to our study she also finds that take-up of platform-based gig work after unemployment leads to lower re-employment rates. Our main contribution is to document precisely the return to gig-experience in the job search process.

We also relate closely to the literature using correspondence experiments to estimate the impact of past unemployment and type of work on the likelihood of being contacted by employers (e.g., Eriksson and Rooth, 2014; Farber et al., 2019; Kroft et al., 2013). To our knowledge, this is the first paper in this vein to inform about employers’ valuation of gig vs. traditional wage job experience.

The paper is structured as follows: Section 2 gives an overview of the relevant literature; Section 3 provides a short description of the context—the Swedish labor market; Section 4 describes the experiment; Section 5 presents the empirical model and main results; and Section 6 concludes.

2. Related literature

Research on gig-workers is still relatively limited, but evidence suggests that some workers value the flexibility and independence of gig-jobs (Chen et al., 2019; Hall and Krueger, 2018). At the same time, there is a growing number of studies indicating that some groups engaged in non-traditional work would prefer permanent employment to their current jobs. In particular, Boeri et al. (2018) show that newly self-employed workers, and in particular gig workers, would like to work more hours. Their study is based on survey data across the US, UK, and Italy, suggesting that almost 20\% of the gig-workers in Italy, and 10–15\% in the UK state that working in the gig-economy is their only option. Datta (2019) uses an experimental design based on vignettes to estimate the willingness-to-pay over some of the most important characteristics of typical atypical work arrangements (wage, longevity, holiday and sick pay eligibility, flexibility of work hours, flexibility to work from home, ability to choose tasks performed on-the-job and tax implications). He shows that attributes typically associated with traditional employer-employee relationships are by far the most valued, and that these preferences hold even when analysing just the subsample of those in atypical work arrangements.\textsuperscript{7} Furthermore, Katz and Krueger (2017) show that workers with prior unemployment histories are over-represented in alternative work arrangements, and that workers in non-traditional jobs earn considerably less per week than do regular employees with similar characteristics and in similar occupations.

On the employer side, several papers have studied the impact of unemployment history on the likelihood of being contacted by employers. These suggest that employers recruiting to low-skilled jobs are insensitive to short unemployment spells but react negatively to longer ones (Eriksson and Rooth, 2014; Farber et al., 2019; Kroft et al., 2013). In particular, Eriksson and Rooth (2014) suggests that the callback rate is reduced by about 20\% for young, relatively well-qualified applicants for low skilled jobs in Sweden if they have been unemployed for at least 9 months. An interesting exception is Cahuc et al. (2021), who find no detrimental effects of past unemployment on the likelihood of being

---

\textsuperscript{4} Gig-jobs may in addition displace alternative job-search or skill building activities that might have larger long-run payoffs. They are also less likely to provide the sort of social networks that have been shown to help especially young workers find employment (Hensvik and Nordström Skans, 2014; 2016; Kramarz and Nordström Skans, 2014).

\textsuperscript{5} This mechanism is consistent with statistical discrimination models (e.g., Algren and Cain, 1977) in which the returns to applicant characteristics depend on their majority or minority status. It is also consistent with Behaghel et al. (2015), who study anonymous résumés to show that interrupted labor market histories (possibly signaling unemployment spells) are strongly negatively valued for majority candidates but not for minority candidates.

\textsuperscript{6} Consistent with this, Koutas (2019) uses personal finance data to show that household income and assets decline prior to entering the gig-economy; and Autor and Houseman (2016) show that temporary-help job placements yield earnings gains in the short-run, but these gains are offset by lower earnings and less frequent employment in the longer run.

\textsuperscript{7} Related to this, Mas and Pallais (2017) use a discrete choice experiment among applicants during the hiring process for a call centre in the US to estimate the willingness-to-pay distribution for flexibility attributes for jobs, such as flexibility of hours and work location. They find that the majority of workers are not willing to pay for flexible work arrangements.
called back by employers for high-school dropouts in the French labor market.

While no previous study has estimated the value of gig-experience on the likelihood of being contacted by employers, a few papers have looked at other aspects of the type of work experience included in the CV. Farber et al. (2016) and Farber et al. (2019) show that experience from low-level interim jobs lowers the callback rate for college educated women in the US. In addition, Nunley et al. (2017) show that underemployment is associated with lower callback rates for college educated job applicants. While related, these studies do not focus explicitly on gig jobs and also pertain to a different segment of the labor market.

3. Background: the labor market and gig economy in Sweden

The Swedish labor market is generally characterized by high labor force participation and employment rates by international standards. Unemployment among prime-aged workers is low, but low-performing youths and migrants from refugee countries make up a large and increasing share of the unemployed. Wages are more compressed in Sweden than in other EU countries, and minimum wages are particularly binding for young workers (Forslund et al., 2012). The fraction of entry-level jobs (i.e., those considered to be low-qualified) is lower than in any other EU country. Earnings differentials between the employed and the non-employed have increased dramatically since the beginning of the century. One major reason is that transfers to the non-employed have increased at a slower rate than wages. This means that there are strong incentives to find employment in Sweden, but also that the consequences for failing to enter the labor market can be severe (Nordström Skans et al., 2017).

Around one fifth of the Swedish population is foreign born, and in 2018, a quarter of the foreign-born population was from an Arab League member country (Statistics Sweden). Correspondence studies from Sweden suggest that the callback-rate of job applicants is twice as high for natives as for perceived immigrants. This effect appears very similar for first- and second generation immigrants (Carlsson, 2010).

Estimates of the size of the Swedish gig-economy vary across studies. Survey evidence in Huws et al. (2016) suggest that about twelve percent of all persons aged 16–65 in Sweden have worked through an online platform. Among these, a quarter reported the gig job as their main or single source of income. Another survey indicates that around four percent of working age Swedes had tried to get an assignment via a digital platform in 2016. Applying for gig-jobs through digital platforms was more common among men, youth, and people born outside of Sweden (Ministry of Employment, 2017). While it is hard to compare estimates of the size of the gig-economy across countries as they vary in representativeness, definitions and measurement, the most reliable estimates suggest that gig economy platforms’ employment share ranges between 1 and 3% of total employment in most western countries (Schwellnus et al., 2019).

Particularly useful for our study is a survey to high school graduates conducted by Statistics Sweden in 2020. The survey targeted a random sample of students who graduated in the Spring term of 2017, which is the graduation cohort of our fictitious applicants. Three years after completing high school, around 70% of students from vocational programs (as our fictitious applicants) reported work as their main activity and 50% had a job that was fully, or partly, in line with their program orientation. Furthermore, four out of ten graduates overall and five out of ten graduates with immigrant background had at least one unemployment spell during the follow-up period. Finally, four percent of the graduates had some form of gig experience, and the majority of those with gig experience were males (Statistics Sweden, 2020). Overall, these results indicate that a non-trivial share of young people experience difficulties upon labor market entry, and that the fraction of youth using the gig economy is similar to the fraction in the overall working age population.

4. Experimental design

Our study was conducted from March to October 2018. The Swedish economy was in a boom during this period, with an unemployment rate of around 6% and high labor demand (Arbetsförmedlingen, 2018).

The experiment was concentrated to the three largest cities of Sweden: Stockholm, Gothenburg and Malmö, because gig-economy jobs are relatively common there. In total, we sent approximately 10,000 job applications to 3,300 job vacancies posted at Sweden’s largest job board Platsbanken. The applications were sent by email and employer responses were registered through telephone and email. To reduce the inconvenience experienced by the employer, all invitations to job interviews were immediately declined.

4.1. The choice of job vacancies

The job vacancies chosen were low-skilled jobs, i.e., jobs without requirements of previous experience or post-secondary education. This choice was motivated by our focus on the usefulness of non-traditional work experience for entry into the traditional labor market. To this end, we sampled all employers in Stockholm, Gothenburg, and Malmö who posted vacancies without requirements of previous experience or post-secondary education on the Swedish job board Platsbanken. The experience requirement was indicated by the employers when uploading a job ad and could easily be filtered out by job seekers using the job board. The education requirement was specified in the text of the job ad.

Applications were sent by email. This implies that we restricted the sample to all vacancies that included an email-address in the job ad. Employers with their own application procedure on their external webpage were disregarded. Our final data set consists of 9,987 applications. Fig. 1 shows the distribution of our applications over broad occupation groups defined by the first digit in the Swedish Standard of Occupations (SSYK). The vast majority (almost 80%) of applications were sent to jobs belonging to the broad occupation groups “Service- and shop sales”, “Elementary occupations”, and “Clerks”. In Appendix Table B.1, we also show the 20 most common occupations at the 3-digit occupation level.

4.2. Details about the fictitious applicants

Since we are interested in the value of participation in the gig-economy for labor market entry on the traditional labor market, we designed job applications for young workers who search for a job a year after high school graduation. We also chose to focus on male applicants since men comprise the majority of the workers in the gig-economy.9

9 For further evidence see Carlsson and Rooth (2007) and Bursell (2007) for correspondence studies on the Swedish labor market; Holm (2001) and Ahmed (2005) for evidence from laboratory experiments; Eriksson and Lagerström (2012), who use an internet-based job search channel; and Åslund and Nordström Skans (2012) for evidence from anonymous job application procedures.

10 In our pre-analysis plan we specified a sample of 8,000 applications. Because the data collection went faster than expected, we decided to extend the experiment to 10,000 applications. This did not change our results in any substantial way — see Section 5.3, and the AEA RCT Registry, registration number AEARCTR-0002766, for further details.

11 In the end, we applied to approximately 12 percent of all job ads posted on Platsbanken that fulfilled the occupation and experience criteria. See Appendix A for additional details about data restrictions and construction.

12 The group elementary occupations includes jobs as helpers and cleaners, helpers in restaurants, doorkeepers, newspaper and package deliverers, garbage collectors, mining and construction laborers, manufacturing laborers and transport laborers.
To get a reasonably high callback rate, the applications were designed to signal a relatively well-qualified applicant (for their age). To this aim, place of residence and high school was chosen to signal a middle-class applicant with a completed high school degree from a vocational track aimed at the service sector. In the résumés we also included at least 12 weeks of workplace training in a traditional job, which is the mandated amount in vocational high school tracks, and having a driver’s license. The age was not stated explicitly in the application but could be inferred by the employer from the year of high school graduation.

We would like to emphasize that the job applications were not designed to reflect the average gig-worker but the type of job-seekers we hope to learn about (labor market entrants with/without foreign background). It could be problematic if our applicants appear unrealistic for their labor market history and the advertised type of job. Unfortunately information about the characteristics of gig-workers is scarce, both in Sweden and internationally. However, official statistics suggest that young and foreign born workers are over-represented in unskilled work in general on the Swedish labor market (Arbetsmarknadsekonomisk Rådet, 2018; Engdahl and Forslund, 2016). Survey evidence from other countries moreover indicates that gig-workers come from all age and education groups (Boeri et al., 2020). Finally, from the labor market survey to graduates in 2017 discussed above we learned that spells of unemployment and gig-work are not uncommon in the first three years upon graduation. Thus, while evidence on the composition of gig-workers is still very limited, we feel confident that the applicants appear realistic to the employers.

To achieve the desired sample size we followed Eriksson and Rooth (2014) and sent three applications to each posted vacancy in the sampling frame. To this end, we constructed three application templates for each city with a high school name, a vocational track, an address, a job training experience and an application layout, resulting in nine application templates. These are the applications to which the treatments were randomly assigned. The application templates consisted of a cover letter on the first page and a CV on the second page.15 We also gener-

4.3. Definition of treatment

We randomly assigned fictitious job applicants into (i) 7–15 months of non-traditional work experience in the gig-economy; (ii) 7–15 months of traditional work experience; or (iii) 7–15 months of unemployment. The 7–15 months duration corresponds to the time elapsed from August in the year of graduation to the start/end month of the experiment (March to October 2018). Survival analysis in Eriksson and Rooth (2014) suggests that after nine months, around 70% of low-skilled youth have left unemployment for work. In addition, their estimates suggest that employers care about contemporary unemployment lasting at least nine months.

Following earlier studies, unemployment was signalled through a time gap in the CV and by the phrase “right now I am looking for a job” in the cover letter. Hence, it should be kept in mind that some employers may perceive the gaps as signals of absence for other reasons, such as, e.g., travel.16 We wanted the job tasks in the gig-job to appear as similar as possible to the job-tasks in the traditional job. Therefore, we compared a gig-job where the task is to deliver food from restaurants to customers to a traditional job of delivering mail.17 Both these jobs are independent service jobs where the worker moves around the city on bike. The skills acquired on the job are local knowledge and being in good physical shape. However, the employer-worker relationship differs between the two. To work for the gig job company, the person needs to own a smartphone and a bike, have a temporary or permanent identification number, and be 18 or older.18 A typical job ad for the traditional employer states that applicants should: be at least 18 years old; have a completed high school degree and a driver’s license; be fluent in Swedish; be in good physical shape as well as be positive and service minded. Applicants are also obliged to provide an extract from the police register declaring the type and number of convictions. Thus, while no private gear is needed in the traditional job, the screening process is more formal compared to the gig job.19

An important aspect for the experimental design is whether the employers can identify the gig job employer. We chose the gig job food delivery company that had been on the Swedish market for the longest time, and that also operates in all three cities as well as on the international market. To further indicate the character of the company and the job experience, a sentence added to the CV explicitly stated that the company is an app-company: “Company X is the dominant app-company for food delivery in city Y”.

We did not include information about the number of hours worked in the gig/traditional job. Thus, it is possible, or even reasonable, that employers interpret the gig experience as more irregular and intermittent compared to the traditional job.20 Employer perceptions about the

---

15 Survey evidence from ILO suggests that around two out of three gig-workers are men (Berg et al., 2018).

16 Appendix C shows three examples of the CVs and cover letters, in the original Swedish as well as translated into English.

17 Unlike some gig jobs, the gig-job we use does not have a system for consumers to rate the workers on their performance.

18 A work jacket and a helmet is provided by the employer.

19 The minimum wage for a mailman is 22,000 SEK (2,400 USD), which is 30% below the median wage on the Swedish labor market.
nature of gig- vs. traditional jobs will thus be part of the effect we estimate. On top of work experience, we randomly assigned applicants a Swedish-sounding or an Arabic-sounding name, which we chose according to official statistics over the most common names given to newborns in Sweden in 1998.\textsuperscript{20} Given that they have degrees from Swedish high schools and speak fluent Swedish, our applicants with Arabic-sounding names are likely to be perceived either as second-generation immigrants or as first-generation immigrants who arrived in Sweden at a young age. This is a consequence of making these applicants comparable to those with Swedish-sounding names, but one might worry that our treatment effects do not generalize to newly arrived first-generation immigrants. However, as Carlsson (2010) has shown, labor market discrimination in Sweden is remarkably similar for first-generation immigrants with foreign education and second-generation immigrants. For this reason, we believe that our results are also informative about effects for newly arrived immigrants.

4.4. Randomization procedure

As described in Section 4.2, we created three distinct application templates for each of the three cities, where an application template comprises the layout and all text of the application, except for the indicator of previous labor market experience (primary treatment), and the name and contact information of the applicant (secondary treatment). For each vacancy, we randomly combined the three application templates with the three levels of labor market experience (gig-economy, traditional work, or unemployment), and three of the four identities.\textsuperscript{22} We thus sent three applications to each vacancy. The randomization ensures that the primary and secondary treatment are independent of each other and of all other aspects of the applications. Since each vacancy received all three versions of the main treatment (labor market history), this treatment is stratified on the vacancy level. The secondary treatment, Swedish- or Arabic-sounding name, is also stratified on the vacancy level, since each vacancy received at least one application with each treatment. Appendix Table B.2 shows the distribution of applications over broad occupations and treatment groups. Reassuringly, this suggests that the number of applications is balanced across treatment groups.

4.5. Definition of callback

Answers from employers were recorded up to two months after the application was sent. Phone calls were not answered and we let the automatic answering machine collect messages. All contacts by phone, i.e., missed phone calls, text messages, or voice messages, were registered as callbacks.\textsuperscript{23} Invitations to interviews by email were coded as callbacks, as were invitations to online tests or questionnaires. All questions by email from employers, for example "Do you speak Norwegian?”, "Do you have the required electrical skills?” or "Are you willing to commute?” were also registered as callbacks.

To make sure that the less well-defined responses from employers do not drive our results, we show that our results are robust to using a narrower definition of callback. See Section 5.3 for details.

5. Estimation and results

5.1. Identification and estimation

To measure how labor market experience impacts the call-back rate, we estimate the following linear probability model:

\[
y_{i,k} = \alpha + \beta_1 E_{i,k}^{\text{rad}} + \beta_2 E_{i,k}^{\text{Gig}} + v_j + \eta_k + \epsilon_{i,j,k}.
\]

where \(y_{i,k}\) is an indicator variable taking the value one if application \(i\) sent to vacancy \(j\) using application template \(k\) received a callback, and zero otherwise; \(E_{i,k}^{\text{rad}}\) is an indicator variable taking the value one if the application was given the \textit{traditional work experience} treatment, and zero otherwise. Similarly, \(E_{i,k}^{\text{Gig}}\) indicates if the application was given the gig \textit{experience} treatment. The model also includes vacancy and application fixed effects, \(v_j\) and \(\eta_k\), in order to realize the precision gains from the stratified randomization (these controls are not required for identification); and \(\epsilon_{i,j,k}\) is an error term. The treatment effects are estimated by \(\beta_1\) and \(\beta_2\).

Because we are also interested in the interaction between our experience variables and perceived applicant background, we expand Eq. (1) by interacting the main treatment with the secondary treatment (Swedish- or Arabic-sounding name):

\[
y_{i,j,k} = \alpha + \beta_1 E_{i,j,k}^{\text{rad}} + \beta_2 E_{i,j,k}^{\text{Gig}} + \lambda N_{i,j,k} + \delta_1 E_{i,j,k}^{\text{rad}} \times N_{i,j,k} + \delta_2 E_{i,j,k}^{\text{Gig}} \times N_{i,j,k} + v_j + \eta_k + \epsilon_{i,j,k},
\]

where \(N_{i,j,k}\) is an indicator variable taking the value one if the application was given an Arabic-sounding name, and zero otherwise. Here \(\beta\) capture the treatment effects for individuals with Swedish-sounding names, while the effect for those with Arabic-sounding names is given by \(\beta + \delta\). Standard errors are clustered at the vacancy level.

5.2. Results

Fig. 2 and Table 1 show our main results. Fig. 2 shows the average callback rate for each treatment (i.e., depending on prior experience and perceived applicant background) and Table 1 shows the estimates of

| Table 1 Main results. |
|-----------------------|---|---|---|
|                       | (1) | (2) | (3) |
| Traditional work experience | 1.62 | 1.62 | 4.01 |
|                         | (0.60) | (0.60) | (1.23) |
| Gig experience           | 1.05 | 1.04 | 2.34 |
|                         | (0.61) | (0.61) | (1.19) |
| Arabic-sounding name     | -6.70 | -7.00 |    |
|                         | (1.20) | (1.01) |    |
| Arabic × Traditional     | -4.54 | -3.51 |    |
|                         | (1.82) | (1.50) |    |
| Arabic × Gig             | -2.67 | -3.93 |    |
|                         | (1.78) | (1.44) |    |
| Intercept               | 13.94 | 17.29 |    |
|                         | (0.60) | (0.93) |    |
| P-value, H0: Trad. = Gig| 0.36 | 0.35 | 0.18 |
| Vacancy and application fixed effects | No | No | Yes |
| $R^2$                   | 0.000 | 0.671 | 0.017 |

Note: Dependent variable is an indicator for receiving a callback from the employer. Standard errors in parentheses are clustered by vacancy. All coefficients and standard errors have been multiplied by 100. Columns (2) and (4) include 3,329 vacancy fixed effects and 9 application template fixed effects. The P-value row shows p-values from Wald tests of difference between the traditional and gig work coefficients. Overall callback rate is 14.8%.

\textsuperscript{20} Evidence from Sweden as well as the US indicates that the nature of platform work is short-term and intermittent (Collins et al., 2019; Farrell and Greig, 2016a).

\textsuperscript{21} The Swedish-sounding names were Filip Johansson and Erik Andersson. The Arabic-sounding names were Ali Ahmed and Mohammed Hassan.

\textsuperscript{22} The randomization was performed using the Node.js package shuffle-array (https://www.github.com/pazguille/shuffle-array) by Guille Paz, which uses the JavaScript standard function Math. random () internally.

\textsuperscript{23} To connect a missed phone call to a vacancy in our database we used an online search engine to search for the phone number. If the owner of the number was an individual and not a company, we searched for the name on Google, LinkedIn, and Facebook to connect the name to a company. By the end of the experiment a number of telephone numbers could not be matched to a vacancy. We called all non-coded telephone numbers, pretending to be dialing the wrong number, to further improve the callback rate.
interest from Eqs. (1) and (2), with and without vacancy and application fixed effects.

Our main contribution lies in the analysis of the relationship between gig-experience and the callback rate. But let us first comment on the stark difference in callback rates for applicants with Swedish- vs. Arabic-sounding names. Fig. 2 shows that the average callback rate for the minority group is considerably lower than for majority applicants, irrespective of type of labor market experience. The estimated callback gap with respect to perceived background is 9 percentage points or about 47%. While this gap indicates substantial discrimination against minority applicants, it is well in line with estimates from previous correspondence studies on the Swedish labor market as well as other studies on hiring discrimination.

Turning to the impact of gig-experience, our main results presented in columns (1) and (2) of Table 1 suggest that participation in the gig-economy is more valuable than unemployment, but less useful than similar experience from the traditional labor market. However, this pattern masks substantial heterogeneity with respect to perceived applicant background. More specifically, we only see an improvement in the callback rate (compared to unemployment) for the majority group where the difference between applicants in an ongoing unemployment spell and in a gig-job is around 2–2.3 percentage points, or 11–14%. Traditional work experience gives a further 1.5–1.7 percentage point increase in callbacks over gig experience, although this difference is somewhat imprecisely estimated.

For applicants with Arabic-sounding names we instead find that the callback rate is the same irrespective of whether the applicant is searching from contemporary unemployment, from a gig-job or from a job on the traditional labor market. Overall, we conclude from this result that higher qualifications in terms of more experience does not improve the callback rate for this minority group.

5.3. Robustness

We have performed a number of robustness checks and supplementary analyses. Results from these are presented in Appendix B, and discussed below.

In our pre-analysis plan we specified a sample of 8,000 applications, based on a power calculation for detecting a 2 percentage point change in the call-back rate from a baseline of 10% with 80% power and a test size of 5%. Because the data collection went faster than expected, we decided to extend the experiment to 10,000 applications. This decision was not based on any preliminary findings, as we did not look at the data before having concluded the extended experiment. Nevertheless, for full transparency we also report the results when restricting the sample to the first 8,001 applications sent in Appendix Tables B.4 and B.5 (we use 8,001 applications to ensure that each vacancy was sent three applications). They are similar to our main results.

As discussed in Section 4.5, our main definition of a callback is rather wide, including not only invitations to interviews, but also questions and invitations to online tests. To make sure that the less well-defined responses from employers do not drive our results, we replicated the analysis using a narrower definition of callback, excluding the cases where employers contact applicants for further questions (see Appendix Tables B.6 and B.7). The results are similar, the main difference

---

24 The average callback rate is 19.4% for applicants with Swedish-sounding names, and 10.3% for those with Arabic-sounding names.
25 Carlson and Rooth (2007) find that job applicants with a Swedish-sounding male name have a 50 percent higher probability of receiving a callback for a job interview compared to job applicants with a Middle Eastern-sounding male name. Similar evidence has been found for Australia, Belgium, Norway and UK (see, e.g., Baert et al., 2015; Booth et al., 2012; Drydakis and Vlassis, 2010; Fibbi et al., 2006; Kaas and Manger, 2012; Midtbøen, 2016; Riach and Rich, 2002; Wood et al., 2009).
26 The difference in callback rates for applicants searching from unemployment and employment is consistent with Eriksson and Rooth (2014), who found that unemployment lasting at least nine months have negative effects for young majority workers who look for medium/low skill jobs.
27 With the exception of the sample size results, none of these analyses were specified in our pre-analysis plan.
being that callback rates in all groups are lower with the narrow callback definition.

We sent three applications to each vacancy randomly varying applicant name and experience. As the name composition and application rank (i.e., the order in which the three applications were sent to a vacancy) was randomized, controlling for these does not affect our results. However, it might be the case that callback rates vary with name composition or application rank. To shed light on this, Appendix Fig. B.1 shows mean callback rates by name on the application and name composition for the vacancy. Only one thing stands out: for Swedish applicants with the unemployed treatment, the callback rate seems higher when there are two Swedish applicants and one Arabic, than when there are two Arabic and one Swedish. However, there are essentially no differences for any of the other groups. Since we have no plausible economic explanation for the pattern, and since it does not appear for any of the other treatment groups, it seems likely to be due to statistical chance. Furthermore, Appendix Fig. B.2 shows callback rates separated by application rank within the vacancy. While there is some variation, it’s hard to discern any clear patterns.

Finally, we plot callback rates separately for the three regions in Appendix Fig. B.3. While callback rates are uniformly highest in Gothenburg, and lowest in Malmö, the treatment effects in terms of experience and applicant name are similar across the three regions. Thus we conclude that the results we find are generalizable across regions, and not driven by a particular local labor market.

5.4. Discussion

Our results suggest that the majority of young workers benefit from work experience in their search for low-skilled jobs. However, employers seem to attach a lower value to experience obtained in the gig economy, suggesting that the type of job matters. This pattern could reflect that employers perceive gig-experience as a signal of a lack of other options, and thus as indicative of lower worker quality. Given the high entry barriers into traditional wage jobs in Sweden, we believe that the signalling value of wage employment is high in our setting (see Section 3).

We do not know exactly how gig jobs are perceived by employers—e.g., experience in the gig-economy may signal a more irregular and intermittent work experience compared to the traditional wage job, since evidence suggests that platform work is intermittent in nature. This could be one reason for why employers appear to value gig experience below traditional experience. While this makes it hard to say which aspects of gig experience are important to employers, it allows us to recover the full effect of gig experience on the actual labor market. This includes any misconceptions employers might have about the nature of gig experience.

Another potential issue could arise if the variance of unobserved productivity differs between groups, introducing bias in estimates of discrimination from correspondence studies (Heckman, 1998). Intuitively, employers care about both observed and unobserved productivity when making hiring decisions. If the applications are of relatively high quality, signalling high observed productivity (as arguably is the case in our setting), employers will want to avoid a large negative draw from the distribution of unobserved productivity, since this would push overall productivity below the threshold at which an employee is worth hiring. This will lead employers to prefer applicants from groups with lower variance in unobserved productivity.

Given the more stringent screening in traditional jobs compared to gig jobs, a plausible assumption might be that the variance in unobserved productivity is lower in the former than the latter. This would then lead us to overestimate the difference in callback rates between the gig and traditional experience treatments.

Neumark (2012) proposes a test for this type of bias. Unfortunately, the test requires access to a variable which affects perceived productivity in the same way across treatment groups. Since we do not have such a variable in our data, we are unable to test this empirically. The differences between majority and minority applicants in the effects of work experience are striking but not entirely new in the literature. In particular, Arai et al. (2008) use a two-stage correspondence study where in the first stage, employers are sent CVs of equal observable quality while in the second stage, the CVs with Arabic names are given an advantage of, on average, two more years of relevant work experience. Consistent with our findings, the call-back gap between male applicants with Swedish and Arabic-sounding names remains large and significant despite a positive adjustment of CVs with Arabic names. Cahuc et al. (2021) conduct a correspondence study in the French labor market finding that high-school dropouts in France who exhibit a low callback rate in response to their applications cannot improve this rate by enhancing their labor market experience. We conclude from these studies and our findings that it is very difficult for groups with low callback rates at baseline to improve their hiring prospects by acquiring more labor market experience.

Our experiment was conducted during an economic boom. From a theoretical perspective it is not clear how the state of the labor market would affect our findings. On the one hand, we may underestimate the value of contemporary employment, since employers are potentially less selective in whom to invite for an interview when they struggle to fill their vacancies. But employers may at the same time interpret unemployment, and potentially also participation in the gig-economy, as a stronger signal about job-seeker (unobservable) productivity in tight labor markets, which could enhance the signalling value of past experience. A few studies have considered how ethnic discrimination in hiring varies with labor market tightness, but the findings are not conclusive. Baert et al. (2015) show that discrimination decreases in upturns in the Belgian labor market. In contrast, evidence in Kroft et al. (2013) as well as Carlsson and Rooth (2007) show that the call-back gap with respect to past unemployment and perceived background is higher in tight labor markets.

6. Concluding remarks

Recently, one of Sweden’s leading newspapers published the following quote from the Swedish Public Employment Services:

The gig economy will help those who want a permanent position but who have difficulty finding one, for example young people without long experience and those newly arrived in Sweden. For them, it will be easier to find a job in the gig economy and start building a résumé that helps them find a permanent job.

We conducted a field experiment to shed light on this question. More specifically, we sent almost ten thousand fictitious job applications to over three thousand employers looking to hire on the traditional labor market. By randomly varying the applicants’ work history, we estimate the value of a gig-job compared to either unemployment or similar work experience from the traditional labor market (in terms of call backs). Our findings suggest that gig-experience raises the call back rate compared

28 Estimates available upon request.
29 It should also be noted that, as we’re now dividing the data into a larger number of groups, precision is relatively low.
30 We also estimate fully interacted models with region indicators. The baseline differences show up here too, in the intercept estimates, although the difference between Stockholm and Gothenburg is quite imprecise. All interaction terms are imprecise and mostly not very large.
31 We thank an anonymous referee for bringing this issue to our attention.
32 This is in line with the model in Engbom (2021), where the quality of the pool of applicants increases in booms, making firms less selective in hiring.
33 Erik Sandström, head of digital services at the Swedish Public Employment Services in Dagens Nyheter, February 25, 2018, authors’ translation.
to unemployment, although less so than similar experience from the traditional labor market for young entry-level job applicants who belong to the majority group (i.e., for applicants with Swedish-sounding names).

For minority applicants, however, we find that neither gig work experience nor traditional experience enhance the call-back rate compared with contemporary unemployment. One potential reason for this result is that employers have such strong negative priors against this group that higher qualifications in terms of more experience do not improve the callback rate for minority workers. But the finding could also reflect an attenuation of negative signals from past unemployment/gig-employment when the candidate belongs to a minority.

We are fully aware that our study has several limitations. First, like most correspondence studies we are not able to go beyond the first stage in the hiring process. Thus, we cannot conclude whether our results translate into differences in actual hiring rates between job-seekers with different types of work experience/perceived background. Second, it may be argued that the results are specific to the choice of gig/traditional job included in the CV as well as to the Swedish labor market. While this is a valid concern, we believe that our focus on well-known companies that have operated in the market for quite some time enhances the chances that prospective employers are able to distinguish between the gig- and traditional employers. If not, this would lead us to underestimate the differences. In addition, previous studies suggest that the negative impact of unemployment, as well as the callback gap between minority and majority applicants, are rather similar in Sweden compared to, e.g., the US. Third, it should also be kept in mind that the experiment was conducted during an economic boom, when many employers are struggling to fill vacancies and it is a priori not clear how this impacts our findings.

Despite these shortcomings, we believe that our study provides a first important piece of evidence about the value employers attach to gig-experience for minority and majority applicants. While we acknowledge that participating in the gig economy may provide earnings opportunities to individuals in the absence of other employment opportunities, our results give no support to the hypothesis that the gig-economy serves as an important gate-way to traditional jobs for minority workers.

Appendix A. further details about the data collection

We restricted the sample to employers who had included an email address in the job ads. If the employer had its own application procedure on their external webpage, and informed about this in their email response, we deleted the vacancy and thereafter excluded vacancies from this company from the sampling frame. In total, 236 employers wrote by email that they did not accept applications by email. During the data collection, more than 900 vacancies or 2,700 applications were deleted for this reason. In May 2018 the EU General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) came into force and replaced the Swedish Personal Data Act. A number of employers stated that GDPR was the reason for why they did not accept applications by email. With the GDPR, the restrictions on how companies could collect and process personal data were strengthened (Datinspektionen, 2018). Companies that want to store personal data on job applicants can choose to collect applications through their own website, where they can provide information to the applicant and obtain consent more easily. This could possibly affect the selection of employers and hence the external validity of the study.

Out of considerations for the employers, and in order not to reveal the experiment, we avoided applying for more than one job at the same small company or local department of a large company. Similarly, for large companies with several departments or franchise chains, we let some time pass before applying to the second chain store or local department of a company in a city where we already sent one set of applications.

In total, we sent 10,305 applications. Out of these, 117 applications were deleted because the applications were erroneously sent out without a lag in between. A number of employers with a high demand for labor or a high turnover repeatedly posted new job vacancies on Platsbanken. 129 applications (43 job ads) were sent by mistake to an email address that had already received a set of applications for a different vacancy. We deleted both vacancies if the second set of applications was sent less than 30 days after the first set, otherwise we deleted only the second set of applications. 198 applications were deleted for the aforementioned reason, leading to a final data set of 9,987 applications.

Appendix B. supplemental results

Table B1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SSYK</th>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Share, percent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>941</td>
<td>Food Preparation Assistants</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>534</td>
<td>Personal Care Workers in Health Services</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>522</td>
<td>Shop Salespersons</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>524</td>
<td>Other Sales Workers</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>422</td>
<td>Client Information Workers</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>513</td>
<td>Waiters and Bartenders</td>
<td>5.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>911</td>
<td>Domestic, Hotel and Office Cleaners and Helpers</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>411</td>
<td>Clerks and Secretaries</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>332</td>
<td>Sales and Purchasing Agents and Brokers</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>432</td>
<td>Material Recording and Transport Clerks</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>531</td>
<td>Child Care Workers and Teachers’ Aides</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>832</td>
<td>Car, Van and Motorcycle Drivers</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>512</td>
<td>Cooks</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>532</td>
<td>Personal Care Workers in Health Services</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>912</td>
<td>Vehicle, Window, Laundry and Other Hand Cleaning Workers</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>351</td>
<td>Information and Communications Technology</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>523</td>
<td>Cashiers and Ticket Clerks</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>821</td>
<td>Assemblers</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>611</td>
<td>Market Gardeners and Crop Growers</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>962</td>
<td>Other Elementary Workers</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Other occupations</td>
<td>16.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: This table shows the fraction of applications sent for the 20 most common occupation groups defined by three-digit Swedish Standard of Occupations (SSYK) code.
Table B2
Number of applications by occupation.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupation group</th>
<th>Swedish name</th>
<th>Arabic name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Unempl.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service, care and shop sales workers</td>
<td>4,101</td>
<td>686</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary occupations</td>
<td>2,262</td>
<td>376</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration and customer service clerks</td>
<td>1,581</td>
<td>263</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupations requiring higher education qualifications or equivalent</td>
<td>729</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building and manufacturing workers</td>
<td>564</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanical manufacturing and transport workers, etc.</td>
<td>456</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupations requiring advanced level of higher education</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agricultural, horticultural, forestry and fishery workers</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managers</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>9,987</td>
<td>1,666</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Cells show number of applications sent by one-digit Swedish Standard of Occupations (SSYK) group and treatment status.

Table B3
Callback rates by treatment status.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Swedish name</th>
<th>Arabic name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>17.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gig</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>21.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Cells show means, standard deviations, and number of observations for the callback variable by treatment status. Means and standard deviations have been scaled by 100 to correspond to percentage callback rates.

Table B4
Callback rates by treatment status, only first 8,001 observations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Swedish name</th>
<th>Arabic name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>17.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gig</td>
<td>20.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>21.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9.94</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Cells show means, standard deviations, and number of observations for the callback variable by treatment status. Means and standard deviations have been scaled by 100 to correspond to percentage callback rates. Sample is restricted to the first 8,001 observations sent.

Table B5
Main results, only first 8,001 applications.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(1)</th>
<th>(2)</th>
<th>(3)</th>
<th>(4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional work experience</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>1.61</td>
<td>4.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gig experience</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>3.54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic-sounding name</td>
<td>-6.02</td>
<td>-7.02</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic × Traditional</td>
<td>-5.81</td>
<td>-3.72</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic x Gig</td>
<td>-4.33</td>
<td>-2.12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>14.14</td>
<td>17.14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P-value, H₉: Trad. = Gig | 0.83 | 0.83 | 0.43 | 0.33 |
Vacancy and application fixed effects | No | Yes | No | Yes |
Observations | 8,001 | 8,001 | 8,001 | 8,001 |
R² | 0.000 | 0.666 | 0.019 | 0.680 |

Note: Dependent variable is an indicator for receiving a callback from the employer. Standard errors in parentheses are clustered by vacancy. All coefficients and standard errors have been multiplied by 100. Columns (2) and (4) include 3,329 vacancy fixed effects and 9 application template fixed effects. The P-value row shows p-values from Wald tests of difference between the traditional and gig work coefficients. Overall callback rate is 12.4%. Sample is restricted to the first 8,001 observations sent.

Table B6
Callback rates by treatment status, narrow definition of callback.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Swedish name</th>
<th>Arabic name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed</td>
<td>14.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gig</td>
<td>16.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traditional</td>
<td>18.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7.88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Cells show means, standard deviations, and number of observations for the narrow callback variable by treatment status. Means and standard deviations have been scaled by 100 to correspond to percentage callback rates.

Table B7
Main results, narrow definition of callback.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>(1)</th>
<th>(2)</th>
<th>(3)</th>
<th>(4)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional work experience</td>
<td>1.56</td>
<td>1.57</td>
<td>3.83</td>
<td>2.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gig experience</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>2.19</td>
<td>1.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic-sounding name</td>
<td>-6.05</td>
<td>-6.75</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic x Gig</td>
<td>-4.30</td>
<td>-2.01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic × Traditional</td>
<td>-1.75</td>
<td>-1.33</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arabic x Gig</td>
<td>-17.67</td>
<td>-16.31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intercept</td>
<td>11.38</td>
<td>14.41</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

P-value, H₉: Trad. = Gig | 0.72 | 0.71 | 0.16 | 0.46 |
Vacancy and application fixed effects | No | Yes | No | Yes |
Observations | 9,987 | 9,987 | 9,987 | 9,987 |
R² | 0.000 | 0.666 | 0.016 | 0.679 |

Note: Dependent variable is an indicator for receiving a callback from the employer, using the narrow definition of a callback. Standard errors in parentheses are clustered by vacancy. All coefficients and standard errors have been multiplied by 100. Columns (2) and (4) include 3,329 vacancy fixed effects and 9 application template fixed effects. The P-value row shows p-values from Wald tests of difference between the traditional and gig work coefficients. Overall callback rate is 12.4%. Sample is restricted to the first 8,001 observations sent.
Fig. B1. Callback rates by treatment status and name composition. Note: Bars show callback rates with 95% confidence intervals for each treatment group, separately by the composition of name treatments sent to the vacancy.

Fig. B2. Callback rates by treatment status and application rank. Note: Bars show callback rates with 95 percent confidence intervals for each treatment group, separately by the order in which the application was sent to the vacancy.
Appendix C. example CVs

Below we include three examples of personal letters and CVs for vacancies in the Stockholm region (CVs for Gothenburg and Malmö are similar, but with region-appropriate home addresses, schools, and workplace practice locations).

Each of the three CV types were combined with all three experience treatments. The examples below show CV type 1 with the unemployed treatment, CV type 2 with the gig job treatment, and CV type 3 with the traditional job treatment. The four identities were inserted in the fields {first_name}, {last_name}, {phone}, and {email}. The job title of the vacancy was inserted in the field {occupation}.

We have marked the places were we signal the primary treatment (experience) using red squares.

Note that the letters and CVs have been machine translated, with some manual adjustments, from Swedish to English. They are thus meant to signal the layout and content, but not the tone of writing, of the applications. In some places, we have placed short explanations of certain names in square brackets (such as a “[high school]” or “[restaurant]”), in order to help non-Swedish readers understand the context of the applications.

We also include the untranslated originals in Swedish.
Hi!

My name is {first_name} {last_name} and I am very interested in the job opening as {occupation}.

I have a high school diploma from the hotel and tourism program at Stockholms hotell- och restaurangskola [high school] and I’m currently looking for a job. The program gave me valuable knowledge in, among other things, service, conferences, and marketing. I have interned for a total of 18 weeks in three different hotels. I have interned both in the conference department and in reception. From my internships in hotels, I have good knowledge in service, customer interactions, and organization. I had a lot of fun and learned a lot during the internships. I was told by the staff that I’m a quick learner and could keep calm in stressful situations.

During the internships, it was an advantage that I am a social person who likes to meet new people. As a person, I am responsible and find orderliness important. I have several hobbies, among other things I like to play floorball, listen to music, and I have a great interest in cooking. Good references are available on request.

I look forward to your reply!

Sincerely,

{first_name} {last_name}
Education

Hotel and tourism programmet, Stockholms hotell- och restaurangskola [high school]
Fall term 2014 – spring term 2017

High school diploma June 2017, specialization in Hotel och conference.
  * Courses in Conference and events, Service and hospitality, Conference, Breakfast and buffet service, Floor service, Reception, Entrepreneurship etc Praktik

Internship | Scandic Continental [hotel]
Reception - 10 weeks, spring term 2017
I interned at reception and, together with a receptionist, received customers at check-in and check-out. I learned some features of Scandic’s computer system. I also ran errands and refill supplies.

Internship | Scandic Malmen [hotel]
Conference department - 4 weeks, spring term 2016
I interned at the conference department and helped prepare conferences. I made coffee and prepared refreshments during the breaks, and I helped clean up afterwards. I got to walk with staff in the conference department and got an insight into what a work day looks like. I learned a lot about customer service and gained a good knowledge of Scandic’s concept and idea.

Internship | Quality Hotel Globe [hotel]
Reception and breakfast - 4 weeks, spring term 2015
During mornings I worked as a breakfast host, and during the day I interned with hotel staff at reception. I often got to help if something needed to be taken care of, refilled, or put in order. I got some insight into how the booking system works. I gained good knowledge of the company’s concept and customer service.

Language
  * Swedish – fluent
  * English – good speaking and writing skills

Other
  * Driver’s license
Hi!

My name is (first_name) (last_name) and I am very interested in the job opening as [occupation].

Right now I work as a bicycle courier at [company] where I deliver food in central Stockholm. As I am an active person who likes to work independently, the job fits me perfectly. I have a background as a soccer player, and it has been an advantage that I work out a lot because the job is very physically demanding. At [company], punctuality, orderliness and good local knowledge have also been important.

Last spring, I graduated from the Business and Administration program at NTI Handelsgymnasiet [high school]. I chose the Business Program because I like working with people and I love service. I have store work experience from my internships at Intersport [sports goods store] and ICA Kvantum [grocery store]. From my internship periods, I have extensive experience of service and contact with customers. I also got to develop my sense of orderliness because this is important at a store. During an internship, it is important to learn quickly and adapt to the regular staff.

As a person, I am stress-resistant, service-minded and have an eye for details. I am flexible and independent and like problem solving. Right now I am eager for new challenges and to be able to develop in a new role! In my free time I like to hang out with my friends and play soccer.

I hope to hear back from you about an interview, and I would be happy to provide references if you like.

Sincerely,

(first_name) (last_name)
Employment
2017-08-10-ONGOING
Bike messenger/, Stockholm
My duties consist of delivering food from restaurants to customers. is the dominant app firm for food delivery in Stockholm.

Internships
2016/2017 – TWO DAYS A WEEK | TWELFTH GRADE
Shop assistant / Intersport, Mall of Scandinavia [sports goods store]
The internship involved a lot of customer service and interactions. I learned to find goods very quickly, and could therefore guide customers to find the right product. I helped keep the goods in order and put them in the right place. I also helped to provide customers with service when buying shoes in the shoe department.

2015/2016 – 3 WEEKS IN TENTH GRADE & 2 DAYS A WEEK DURING SPRING TERM OF ELEVENTH GRADE
Shop assistant / ICA Kvantum, Solna [grocery store]
I unpacked goods and helped customers in the store. I got to follow several different staff members in their work. I got to work independently from the start. The work involved a great deal of personal responsibility and a lot of service and customer interaction. Of course there was also a lot of cleaning and tidying.

Education
FALL TERM 2014 – SPRING TERM 2017
Business- and administration program / NTI Handelsgymnasiet Stockholm [high school]
Diploma, specialization in Trade and Service. The program prepares for work in trade and service.

Languages
- Swedish – fluent
- English – good speaking and writing skills

Other
- Driver’s license
Hi!

My name is {first_name} {last_name} and I am very interested in the job opening as {occupation}. I am a happy and positive guy who is currently looking for new challenges.

I have worked as a mail deliveryman at [company] since August 2017. Being a deliveryman is a free, mobile job with a lot of personal responsibility. It is important to be conscientious and ensure that the shipments are delivered on time. It is also important to have a positive and accommodating attitude towards customers. Such a physical job suits me, since I work out a lot.

My studies in the Restaurant and Food Program at Griliska Gymnasiet [high school] have given me excellent knowledge in cooking, ingredients, and service. I have interned at two different restaurants, a lunch and a dinner restaurant. During the internships, I got to help out in both the kitchen and the dining room. The internship at Mathias Dahlgren’s Matbaren [restaurant] was very educational. At first, I worked in the prep kitchen and, for example, pick herbs and clean shrimp, but later I got to make my own sauces, smaller dishes and sides. It was easy for me to see what needed to be done in the dining room, if the water needed to be refilled or if a table needed to be wiped. During the internship at Restaurang S [restaurant], I worked in both the buffet and hot dishes kitchens, and at the end of the internship, I got to make a whole dish. I'm not afraid to dig in. At Restaurang S, I washed dirty dishes, cleaned, and lifted large goods deliveries. I like when things happen around me and like to work at a high pace.

My strengths are that I love to provide good service and I’m easy to work with. In my free time I spend a lot of time in the gym, hanging out with friends, and listening to music. I am happy to provide references on request.

Sincerely,

{first_name} {last_name}
Employment

Mail Deliveryman, [Company Name]
August 2017-ongoing
My duties mainly consist of mail delivery in central Stockholm.

Internships

Kitchen Assistant, Mathias Dahlgren Matbaren [Restaurant]
Twelfth grade - 8 weeks in total
Six weeks in the kitchen and two in the dining room.

Kitchen Assistant, Restaurang S [Restaurant]
Eleventh grade - 8 weeks in total
Internship in hot dishes kitchen, buffet kitchen, and waiting.

Education

Restaurant Program — Grillska Gymnasiet — Sundbyberg [High School]
Three years in the restaurant program have given me good knowledge in cooking, ingredients, and service.

Languages

- Swedish - fluent
- English - very good at speaking and writing

Other

- Driver’s license
Hej!

Jag heter {first_name} {last_name} och är mycket intresserad av jobbet som {occupation}.


Jag fick höra från personalen att jag var snabbtill och kunde behålla lugnet i stressade situationer.


Jag ser fram emot erat svar!

Med vänliga hälsningar,

{first_name} {last_name}
Utbildning

Hotell- och turismprogrammet, Stockholms hotell- och restaurangskola
HT 2014 - VT 2017

* Kurser inom Konferens och evenemang, Service och bemötande, Konferens, Frukost och bufféservering, Våningsservice, Reception, Entreprenörskap m.m.

Praktik

Praktik | Scandic Continental
Hotellreception - 10 veckor VT 2017


Praktik | Scandic Malmö
Konferensavdelningen - 4 veckor VT 2016


Praktik | Quality Hotel Globe
Hotell reception och frukost - 4 veckor VT 2015


Språk

* Svenska – flytande
* Engelska – goda kunskaper i tal och skrift

Övrigt

* B-körkort
Hej!

Jag heter (first_name) (last_name) och är mycket intresserad av jobbet som (occupation).

Just nu arbetar jag som cykelbud på [###], där jag levererar mat i centrala Stockholm. För mig som är aktiv och gillar att arbeta självständigt passar jobbet perfekt. Jag har en bakgrund som fotbollsspelare och det har varit en fördel att jag tränar mycket eftersom jobbet är väldigt fysiskt. På [###] har det också varit viktigt med punktlighet, ordning och reda och god lokalkänndom.


Jag hoppas ni hör av er för ett möte och lämnar gärna referenser om ni vill.

Med vänliga hälsningar,

(first_name) (last_name)
Arbete
2017-08-10-PÅGÅENDE
Cykelbud/Stockholm
Mina arbetsuppgifter består av att leverera mat från restauranger till kunder. Cykelbud är det dominerande app-företaget för matleverans i Stockholm.

Praktik
2016/2017 – TVÅ DAGAR I VECKAN I ÅRSKURS TRE
Praktiken innebar en stor del kundservice och kundbemötande. Jag lärde mig mycket snabbt var varorna var placerade och kunde därför guida kunder att hitta rätt vara. Jag hjälpte till att hålla i ordning och placera varorna på rätt plats. Jag hjälpte också till i skoavdelningen med att ge kunder service vid köp av skor.

2015/2016 – 3 VECKOR I ÅRSKURS 1 & 2 DAGAR I VECKAN UNDER VT ÅRSKURS TVÅ
Praktik butiksbiträde / ICA Kvantum, Solna

Utbildning
HT 2014 – VT 2017
Handels- och administrationsprogrammet / NTI Handelsgymnasiet Stockholm
Examen, inriktning Handel och Service. Programmet förbereder för att arbeta inom handel och service.

Språk
- Svenska – flytande
- Engelska – goda kunskaper i tal och skrift

Övrigt
- B-körkort
Hej!

Jag heter [first_name] [last_name] och är mycket intresserad av jobbet som [occupation]. Jag är en glad och positiv kille som just nu söker nya utmaningar.


Mina starka sidor är att jag är älskar att ge god service och har lätt för att samarbeta med andra. På min fritid är jag mycket på gymmet, umgås med vänner och lyssna på musik. Jag lämnar gärna referenser på begäran.

Vänliga hälsningar,

[first_name] [last_name]
References


