THE POWER OF MUSIC

A comparative study of literature and vase paintings from Classical Athens
ABSTRACT


This paper deals with ancient Greek music, and in particular the relation of people to music during the fifth century BC in Athens. Music is believed to exercise great power over the human character and behavior, and at the same time is a means of emotional communication. For the first time during the fifth century, the power of music leaves the realm of the myths and becomes a subject of philosophical investigation.

Two different types of sources are examined in order to study the relation of people to music: on the one hand the literary sources of this period, and on the other the vase paintings. This method reveals various attitudes towards music by using two different perspectives. Possible explanations are given for the differing information, the purpose of each source being a decisive factor.

The paper suggests that although the information from the two types of sources varies and can even be contradictory, the recognition of the power music exercises is obvious in both cases.

Keywords: *music, ethos, power, Plato, vase paintings, art, Athens, Classical, literature, New Music.*

Louisa Sakka, Department of Archaeology and Ancient History, University of Uppsala. Sweden.
In memory of my father
TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 1
   1.1 Aim .................................................................................................................... 1
   1.2 Definition ......................................................................................................... 2
   1.3 Sources ............................................................................................................. 2
   1.4 Theoretical background ................................................................................. 4
   1.5 Method .............................................................................................................. 4
   1.6 Account of earlier research .......................................................................... 5

2. BACKGROUND ....................................................................................................... 7
   2.1 The Athenian society during the fifth century BC ........................................ 7
   2.2 Music in ancient Greek life ............................................................................ 8
       2.2.1 Music during the sixth century BC ....................................................... 11
       2.2.2 Changes in music during the fifth century BC ...................................... 12
   2.3 Plato’s dialogues ........................................................................................... 13

3. ETHOS IN MUSIC .................................................................................................. 15
   3.1 Literature ........................................................................................................ 15
       3.1.1 The intellectual debate in fifth century BC Athens .............................. 15
       3.1.2 Plato on music’s ethos ...................................................................... 17
   3.2 The vase paintings ......................................................................................... 23
       3.2.1 Music and wine: the cult of Dionysos .............................................. 23
       3.2.2 The ethos of Orpheus .................................................................... 25
       3.2.3 Thamyris and hubris .................................................................... 26
       3.2.4 Marsyas: the debate between the aulos and the lyra ...................... 26

4. MUSIC AND THE CITIZENS .............................................................................. 28
   4.1 Literature ........................................................................................................ 28
       4.1.1 The ideal education ............................................................................ 28
       4.1.2 The symposion ................................................................................. 32
       4.1.3 Women and mousike ...................................................................... 34
   4.2 The vase paintings ......................................................................................... 35
       4.2.1 Musical education ........................................................................... 35
       4.2.2 The symposion ................................................................................. 37
       4.2.3 Women and mousike .................................................................... 39

5. THE ARTISTS AND THE NEW MUSIC ............................................................ 44
   5.1 Literature ........................................................................................................ 46
       5.1.1 Amateur and professional musicians .............................................. 46
       5.1.2 Plato’s views on art ........................................................................... 46
       5.1.3 Plato and Aristotle’s views on professionalism .............................. 48
       5.1.4 Musical contests .............................................................................. 49
       5.1.2 The musical revolution of the late fifth century ............................... 50
       5.1.2 The New Music .............................................................................. 50
       5.1.2 Resistance to the New Music ........................................................... 53
   5.2 The vase paintings ......................................................................................... 56
       5.2.1 Musical contests .............................................................................. 56

6. DISCUSSION ......................................................................................................... 59
   6.1 Reactions to music ......................................................................................... 59
       6.1.1 The effects of music ........................................................................... 61
       6.1.2 The calming and enchanting effect of music ................................... 61
       6.1.3 The exciting effect of music ............................................................... 62
       6.1.4 The pedagogical use of music ......................................................... 64
       6.1.5 Music in religion and death ............................................................... 66
The multifunctional aulos ................................................................. 67
6.1.2 Comparison of the sources ...................................................... 68
6.2 “Good” and “bad” music ............................................................... 70
6.3 Music in real life ....................................................................... 74
6.4 Modern theories concerning the psychological power of music .... 76
7. CONCLUSIONS .......................................................................... 80
GLOSSARY ...................................................................................... 83
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS ............................................................... 85
ILLUSTRATIONS ........................................................................... 89
BIBLIOGRAPHY ............................................................................. 113
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Aim

The aim of this essay is to study people’s relation to music in Classical Athens. It concentrates on the role and the importance of music in the lives of the Athenians, the various uses of music, and the attitudes towards it. Two different types of sources are used in this study: literary sources and vase paintings. Of the literary sources, Plato’s dialogues are focused upon: he expresses ideas on the importance of *ethos*¹ and its relation to music, on the relation of the Athenian citizens to music, as well as on the status of amateur and professional musicians in the Athenian society. What is of importance during this period is the emergence of the so-called New Music, which is studied with the help of, among others, Aristophanes, Pherecrates, Plato, and modern scholars. The New Music causes many reactions, which are reflected in the written sources mainly in the form of criticism or satire, and may even be discerned in the vase paintings of the time.

The main discussion concentrates primarily on the power of music. It is suggested that the idea of music’s power over the body and soul may be discerned in most paintings representing music. Parallels of the effects of music visualized in the paintings are found in the literary sources. The two types of sources are compared and a possible explanation for similarities and differences in the information they offer is presented. The intention of this paper is to answer the following questions:

- How is music believed to affect people?
- How is the power of music visualized in the vase paintings? Are there parallels in the literary sources?
- Do the sources contradict or support each other?
- Is one type of source more reliable than the other?
- Do the sources represent the attitude of the average Athenian citizen towards music? If not, which type of source represents which class/type of people?
- What sort of information does each type of source offer? What kinds of music do they mention and what kinds do they not?

¹ According to Bundrick: “The term *ethos*, a word with a range of nuanced meanings, refers to the character of a musical instrument or composition, based on such elements as rhythm, mode, tempo, or pitch. - - - Concepts of musical *ethos* were tied to perceptions of morality and proper behavior, and to ideals of *sophrosyne* (moderation) in the face of *hubris* (excessive pride in the face of the gods).” Bundrick 2005, 10f.
- What could music have been like in real life?

1.2 Definition

This paper concentrates on music in fifth century BC Athens. The fifth century is a period of many changes with a lot written about it. It is an interesting time in many ways: the power is coming into the hands of the people, the economic funds are increasing, while art, literature, science, and philosophy bloom as never before. Most of the sources concerning ancient Greek music focus on exactly this period. They are not only contemporary; the interest in the fifth century is seen long into the Roman times, as for example in works of pseudo-Plutarch and Athenaeus. It is a recognized fact between these writers that music plays a very important role in the lives of the Athenians.

It is easy to comprehend why this essay focuses on Athens. Even though the most famous and talented musicians come from other places, as Thebes or parts of the Ionian coast, the sources concerning Athens outnumber those of other cities. It is very unfortunate not to have as much information about places with important musical traditions, but one can use the Athenian sources to their utmost, hoping to get a glimpse of the rest of the Greek world at the same time.

The technicalities of music or the way it is composed and played, are not of the greatest importance for this essay. What is of interest is the study of the social role and the psychological effects of music on people in different contexts and situations. The main sources will be those that assist in this specific study.

1.3 Sources

The studying of music of past societies will always be problematic since it is difficult to reproduce music in its original form. The problem is even harder to solve in cases like ancient Greece, the music of which has not left much evidence in the form of notation. One of the main reasons is that the compositions were transmitted through listening and memorization. There are certain sources however, and M. L. West divides them into five categories: archaeology and art; references to music and music making in Greek literature; specialist writing on music; non-literary documents as inscriptions and papyri; and finally the actual musical scores. This chapter offers an

---

2 Comotti 1989, 7.
3 For more information on the various sources, see West 1992, 4-8.
account of the sources of this study, and only a brief description of the difficulties each source presents. A more detailed criticism of the sources will take place in the main discussion of this essay.

A study of the literary sources comes first. It would be beyond this essay to study in depth the theorists of music, detailed descriptions of harmonies and rhythms, and other technical aspects of playing music. This essay is about the relation of music to people and to real life, the role and the importance of music, its various uses, and the attitudes towards it. The most appropriate texts are the texts of the philosophers. One of the first known to theorize about the relation between music, ethos, and the soul, is Damon of Oa. Unfortunately there is very little known about him, and his ideas have come down to us in fragments cited in later sources, such as Plato and Athenaeus. It seems like Plato adopts many of Damon’s ideas.

This paper concentrates on Plato’s dialogues. Plato however, is not contemporary to the society he speaks of: he writes in the fourth century BC about music of the fifth. Besides, he is creating an ideal city in his dialogues, not aiming at a detailed description of the musical life of his time. A third obstacle is that Plato is aristocratic in his ideas, so he does not reflect the views of the average Athenian. Nevertheless, as mentioned above, Plato describes certain attitudes towards music. He writes about the dangers and also the benefits of music, about where it is played, and how people react to it. Although he does not aim in giving an account of the musical reality of his time, he does criticize it. Indirectly, through these criticisms, he offers information on what the musical reality was like. Other literary sources examined briefly are Aristotle, certain of Aristophanes’ plays, pseudo-Plutarch’s De Musica, Athenaeus’ Deipnosophistae, and others.

In contrast to literary texts, the vase paintings reflect the ideas of a much broader part of the population. Large amounts of pottery are produced and used by most of the Athenian population. In addition, many of these vases have survived in a very good shape until today. Another advantage is that the pottery is contemporary with the period studied. The vase paintings, however, are art, and art values the aesthetic result more than the truth, while most representations are not lacking in idealism either.

---

4 See p. 16 in this essay.
1.4 Theoretical background

It is important to compare various types of sources when studying past societies, since this approach allows crosschecking of the information and offers a much broader view of reality. Each type of source should, of course, be examined first on its own and then in combination with others. Archaeological sources have too often been interpreted in the light of literary sources. It is difficult to avoid it, as one’s ideas are always formed according to previous knowledge, which in this case derives mostly from literary sources. One is also influenced by the society one lives in, with all its ideals, values, and prejudices. Earlier societies will always be interpreted differently according to the context in which the interpreter works; being totally objective is unfortunately impossible. This paper is a combined study and comparison of two different types of sources, in an effort to create a better picture of reality.

1.5 Method

Plato’s dialogues *Republic* and *Laws* are examined in order to find the passages related to music. A summary of his discussions concerning ethos and education and his views on the role of music in general are presented, while other ancient sources and modern commentators are also studied. The goal is to discern attitudes towards music and musicians, along with how music and the status of musicians change during the fifth century BC.

The next step is to examine the vase paintings of this period. Modern scholars such as Bundrick and Boardman have served as excellent sources, as well as larger collections of vase paintings, such as *LIMC* and *CVA*. Once again the aim is to discern the attitudes, emotions, and reactions to music as visualized in the vase paintings. The most important tendencies in vase painting concerning the relevant subjects are examined in the second part of each chapter.

A comparison of the information from the two types of sources follows. An account of similarities and differences in the information about music is presented, as well as how music is perceived, and how it is thought to influence human behavior. Finally, possible explanations of these differences are offered, taking in account the purpose and use of each source, by whom and when they are written/created, as well as what sort of audience/customers/readers they are intended for.

---

5 For example Anderson 1966; Anderson 1994; Barker 1984; Guthrie 1975; Guthrie 1978.
1.6 Account of earlier research

The music of ancient Greece has been the subject of many publications from the fifteenth century onwards⁶ and there has been a revival in these the last thirty years.⁷ There are a few general works, with one of the most important ones being M. L. West’s Ancient Greek music,⁸ which examines most of the relevant subjects with clarity and detail. Giovanni Comotti has made a contribution in building a good base for introduction into these studies, making use of the ancient literary sources,⁹ while Edward A. Lippman bases his study on the written sources, but narrows his focus mainly on theoretical and philosophical aspects of music, and musical conceptions of harmony, ethics, and aesthetics.¹⁰ Warren D. Anderson’s Music and musicians in ancient Greece is another general study that covers a long period, from the Neolithic engravings in caves to the ideas of Plato and Aristotle in the fourth century, making use of the discipline of ethnomusicology with a comparative method.¹¹ Studies that focus on certain musical instruments or on musicians themselves, their status in society, and the topic of female musicians, are also of great value.¹² I. E. Stefanis’ Dionysiakoi technitai is an important cataloguing of musicians and theatrical artists into what he in the preface calls a “biographical dictionary”¹³ ranging from 500 BC until 500 AD.

Music and the Muses: The culture of Mousike in the Classical Athenian City¹⁴ is a relatively recent selection of articles that take up the complexity and essentiality of music in the Classical Athenian society. The phenomenon of the fifth century’s musical revolution is treated in detail in this volume, as are the role of music in religion and education, and the philosophical and ethical aspects of it. While studying the theoretical aspects of music and the ancient philosophers and dramatists, the studies, comments, and summaries of William K. C. Guthrie, Andrew Barker, and Warren D. Anderson are of great value.¹⁵

---

⁶ For further information see Matthiesen 1974, iii.
⁷ For further information see Bundrick 2005, 203.
⁹ Comotti 1989.
¹⁰ Lippman 1964.
¹¹ Anderson 1994, xi.
¹³ Stefanis 1988, 7.
¹⁵ Guthrie 1975; Guthrie 1978; Barker 1984; Anderson 1966.
Vase paintings have received more attention than music. The important handbooks on Archaic and Classical Black and Red figure painting by John Boardman, give us a detailed review of painters, their techniques, and their workshops, while including a large number of illustrations. These are general studies of the paintings, in which one has the possibility of viewing many scenes representing music. Martin Robertson has written a general study focusing on the vase painters of Classical Athens. Francois Lissarrague concentrates on the Greek symposion (banquet) in the vase paintings, where there are many images depicting the use of music. Two books that have been of great assistance in the writing of this essay are *Imago Musicae* VIII\(^\text{16}\) and Sheramy Bundrick’s *Music and image in classical Athens*.\(^\text{17}\) *Imago Musicae* VIII is a selection of articles in which music is treated from various perspectives, including essays on the power of music as visualized in the vase paintings,\(^\text{18}\) representations of musical instruments as the salpinx,\(^\text{19}\) and domestic music making.\(^\text{20}\) What Bundrick contributes with is that she views musical imagery through the entire fifth century, not individually but in a wider context. She suggests that the changes in the musical reality of the time, as the debate on music in education, the importance of a good musical ethos, and the development of professionalism in music, are reflected in the vase imagery.\(^\text{21}\)

\(^{16}\) *Imago Musicae* 1995.

\(^{17}\) Bundrick 2005.

\(^{18}\) Seebass 1995.

\(^{19}\) Nordquist 1995.

\(^{20}\) Voutira 1995.

\(^{21}\) Bundrick 2005, 6f.
2. BACKGROUND

2.1 The Athenian society during the fifth century BC

After the victory in the Persian wars in the beginning of the fifth century BC, Athens becomes one of the most powerful city-states in the Greek world. In order to be able to defend the rest of the Aegean against new Persian attacks, Athens suggests the building of an anti-Persian alliance. A large fleet is needed, that will be supported economically by contributions of smaller city-states, the money being gathered at the treasury of the island Delos.\(^\text{22}\) This is the beginning of a period of financial growth and expansion of political control, leading to the creation of an Athenian empire.\(^\text{23}\)

Being head of the Delian League that is formed in 477, and moving the treasury from Delos to Athens in 454,\(^\text{24}\) the Athenians manage to extend their power over many other Greek city-states that become their allies. They manage to increase the city’s incomes, a fact which is still seen today in the great architectural works on the Acropolis, where a lot of the money went in the second half of the century. Plutarch explains how these temples symbolize Athens’ new power and are part of Pericles’ political program.\(^\text{25}\)

During this ‘Golden Age’ or ‘Age of Pericles’, as the middle of the fifth century B.C. in Athens is often termed, while democracy is constantly gaining ground, Athens becomes a center of intellectual activity; philosophy, literature, and the arts reach totally new levels,\(^\text{26}\) while Athens is actually called “the school of Hellas” by Thucydides.\(^\text{27}\) Festivals are reorganized and opened to a broader audience, literacy is not a privilege of the aristocrats anymore, and musical contests become a Panhellenic phenomenon, where musicians from all over the Greek world come to perform.\(^\text{28}\)

This period is known for its bloom in philosophy, as mentioned above. In the beginning of the fifth century the centers of philosophy are still spread around the Greek world, from southern Italy to Ionia. But during the fifth century the two main cultural centers are Athens and on a smaller scale Syracuse.\(^\text{29}\) Society, politics, and culture are in constant interaction with philosophy. New ways of viewing the world and society,

\(^{22}\) Morris 2006, 274.
\(^{23}\) For more Information on the creation of the Athenian Empire, see Morris 2006, 273-276.
\(^{24}\) Robertson 1992, 235.
\(^{25}\) Plutarch, Pericles 12-13.
\(^{27}\) Thucydides 2.41.1.
\(^{28}\) Bundrick 2005, 8.
\(^{29}\) Morris 2006, 288.
scientific thinking, and not least, questioning of the traditional values and way of living, create discussions and are mirrored in the works of Plato, Aristotle, and the dramatists. Ways of acquiring wisdom through discovering the truth of things, and gaining power through rhetoric, also concern philosophy of the fifth century.30

The atmosphere in Athens during this time, however, becomes all the more polarized between the rich and the poor. Hostilities are being created as the social power moves from the elite down to the demos.31 Wallace characterizes the second half of the fifth century as a time of “political and intellectual uncertainty and conservatism”.32 This is something that should be held in mind when studying the musical debate of the second half of the fifth century and beginning of the fourth, since it could be based on a parallel conflict. This will be discussed in more detail later in this essay.

In addition, the other Greek cities start to disapprove of Athens’ expansionist policy. Another league, the Peloponnesian, is created under the rule of Sparta. In the mean time, many of Athens’ allies revolt and leave the league, given that the fear of the Persians does not exist any longer. It is not long until the two leagues come into conflict, leading to the Peloponnesian war (431-404 BC) and defeat of Athens by Sparta.

2.2 Music in ancient Greek life

Before discussing music in ancient Greece, it is important to note that the ancient term mousike has a broader meaning than the modern term ‘music’: it is the art of the Muses, including music, poetry, and dance.33 The Muses are deities that protect and inspire the artists. Their functions change through time according to the dominating art forms of each period.34 Music should actually be studied together with the songs/poems it accompanied, and when possible, even the dance.35 Unfortunately many modern studies separate the three. It is worth noting, however, that plain instrumental music is rare in Classical Athens. The idea of mousike including poetry and dance is especially apparent in Plato.

30 Morris 2006, 294.
31 Morris 2006, 284.
32 Wallace 2004, 265.
33 Comotti 1989, 3.
34 Murray 2004, 389.
35 Lawler 1964a and 1964b are good examples of studies of ancient Greek dance.
Music is a manifestation of happy and peaceful life for the ancient Greeks. It is always present in celebrations of important religious, public or private events, probably accompanied by dance. Sorrow, grief, and war are often represented as a “foe to the dance and lute, parent of tears”\(^\text{36}\) without that excluding music even in those moments (as the lamentations at funerals). In Aeschylus *Eumenides* Athena says: “And in their dealings with mankind, visibly, perfectly, they (the Erinyes) work their will, unto some giving song, unto others a life bedimmed by tears.”\(^\text{37}\) In religious or private ceremonies, in public festivals, at symposia or at work, music is a way of expressing feelings, communicating, and entertaining, just as it is today. One thing worth noting here is that the strict line drawn nowadays between secular and religious, as between private and public, was not as obvious in ancient Greece. At religious festivals there was often a feast after the sacrifice, with eating and drinking. On the other hand, at the symposia, the men made libations to the gods and sung hymns after the meal and before the drinking began. The drinking itself was usually in honor of one of the gods.\(^\text{38}\) It is therefore not correct to be speaking in today’s terms about phenomena of two and a half thousand years ago. But to be practical and clear, these terms (religious-secular, public-private) can be used to characterize the different situations in which music was performed.

This chapter offers a brief account of the most important situations in which music elements are found in ancient Greece. Music is almost always played at public festivals and private ceremonies. The musicians may even compete against each other in the musical competitions. There is also domestic and personal music making and music that accompanies an activity of some sort, as children’s play, work, or marching into a battle.

The public festivals are usually in honor of one or more of the Gods. The most important ones are the Panathenaic festival and the City Dionysia. There are almost always processions in which the participating citizens sing, most often accompanied by an *aulos* player.\(^\text{39}\) There are choruses of dancing young women or men, accompanied by the aulos or the *lyra*. Finally, an aulos player normally accompanies the sacrifice, which is the peak of a religious festival. The most well known types of songs related to cults are the *paean*, addressed to Apollo, and the *dithyramb*, addressed to Dionysos. The

---

36 Aeschylus, *Suppliant Maidens* 678-83.
37 Aeschylus, *Eumenides* 952-5.
38 See p. 32f. in this essay
39 In Fig. 11, 40 there are representations of both the aulos and the lyra.
latter loses much of its religious essence and becomes part of the City Dionysia, where groups of men and boys compete in dancing the dithyramb to aulos music. Choruses and aulos accompaniment are also part of the dramatic contests during the festivals of the Lenaea and the City Dionysia.\(^{40}\)

Even solo musicians and singers perform, and an example is the reciting of Homer and other epic poems by *rapsodoi*. Already in the eighth century there are competitions between these singers or instrumentalists.\(^{41}\) With time, more religious festivals include musical contests of *kitharodoi*, *aulodoi* and *auletae*; one of these festivals is the Panathenaea, which is reorganized in the early fifth century BC.

Music is present in private ceremonies, such as weddings or victories in athletic competitions. Songs are sung accompanied by the aulos or the lyra. At funerals, except for the women’s songs, professionals seem to be hired to sing laments. The main instrument on the vases with representations of funeral processions is the aulos. The extravagance of the funeral processions is limited as early as the beginning of the sixth century, by laws of Solon.\(^{42}\)

The symposion is another event where music is played. It is mainly men from the elite that gather at someone’s house to eat and drink, discuss and sing to the lyra or the aulos. This pattern exists already in Homer’s poems, where professional minstrels in the king’s halls compose and sing their songs, usually to a *phorminx*.\(^{43}\) In the end of the sixth and beginning of the fifth century, the symposion is represented in many vase paintings, showing the guests playing music and drinking. By the end of the fifth century these customs change; the younger Athenians start to disregard the traditional music as part of the symposion. Many play new songs that are not according to the tradition; others prefer instrumental music, without singing; and it becomes more and more common to hire professional musicians instead of playing music themselves.\(^{44}\) The symposion will be discussed in more detail in the chapter “Music and the citizens”.

Working songs seem to be quite common in ancient Greece. Activities such as working in the fields or building, are accompanied by music and singing, judging from the vase paintings and the literary sources.\(^{45}\) One of the uses of music is to keep the rhythm and motivation. There is a good example of it in Aristophanes’ play *Frogs*,

---

\(^{40}\) West 1992, 14-17.  
\(^{41}\) West 1992, 18f.  
\(^{43}\) Barker 1984, 18.  
\(^{44}\) West 1992, 24-28.  
\(^{45}\) For more information on working songs see West 1992, 28-30.
where the frogs sing to help the god Dionysos keep the rhythm while rowing.\textsuperscript{46} Music is played while men march into battle, to keep their rhythm, but maybe even to inspire courage and bravery. Women may sing or play music while working at home, weaving or grinding.\textsuperscript{47} Children’s games are very often dances and songs. Plato gives an account of how he believes these first songs should be composed.\textsuperscript{48} Athletic training is almost always accompanied by the music of the aulos in the imagery.

There is furthermore a belief that music has a magical or healing ability: this idea of music as healing physical ills does not exist in the actual Greek medicine, which is more ‘scientific’. It is, however, used by unqualified doctors and old women, as well as in cures that are connected to religion, as in shrines of gods that are related to healing. West names three kinds of healing music: “incantations; paeans and purifying songs; and music supposed to be efficacious by virtue of its intrinsic properties”.\textsuperscript{49} The Pythagoreans prefer the lyre in these cases, but in general the aulos is thought to have the most power in producing ”strange effects”.\textsuperscript{50} Music’s healing ability is a theme that is not seen very often, if at all, in the vase imagery.

2.2.1 Music during the sixth century BC

Athens is not the first city-state to become renowned for its music. Ionia, the islands, and Peloponnesos (Sparta, Argos, Corinth) make musical innovations already almost two centuries before, with Alkman and Terpander of Lesbos being two of the famous musicians in seventh century Sparta. Terpander is said to be the first to win the Karneia at Sparta. Arion is a Lesbian kitharodos, said to be the inventor of the dithyramb in the sixth century, at the court of tyrant Periander in Corinth.\textsuperscript{51} During the sixth century the Pythian Games at Delphi start including musical contests.\textsuperscript{52} Sakadas of Argos is a virtuoso auletes and the first to win the Pythian contest at Delphi. In total he wins three times in the sixth century, once with his \textit{Pythikos nomos}, which deals with the myth of Apollo winning over the dragon.\textsuperscript{53}

---

\textsuperscript{46} Aristophanes, \textit{Frogs} 202-268.
\textsuperscript{47} West 1992, 27.
\textsuperscript{48} For more information on Plato’s ideas on children’s songs, see p.28f. in this essay.
\textsuperscript{49} West 1992, 32.
\textsuperscript{50} West 1992, 33.
\textsuperscript{51} Arion is said to be responsible for first composing and naming the dithyramb; Herodotus 1.23.
\textsuperscript{52} Pausanias says that the aulodoi and auletae contests were new (10.7.4), while contests of kitharodoi existed before; Pausanias 10.7.2-5.
\textsuperscript{53} Bundrick 2005, 8.
In Athens, the tyrant Peisistratos and his sons engage themselves with upgrading the musical festivals in Athens. It is said that he reorganizes the Greater Panathenaea in 566 BC, but only in the fifth century does this festival accumulate prestige, with musicians from all over the Greek world coming to Athens to compete. The vase imagery follows this evolution, with musical scenes appearing already in the archaic period, but reaching their peak during the fifth century.\(^{54}\)

2.2.2 Changes in music during the fifth century BC

With the establishment of democracy in 508/7 and the victory in the Persian Wars, Athens’ importance grows in relation to other city-states and so do the musical contests. Musicians come mostly from the eastern Greek world and from cities such as Thebes, with an important musical background. “New Music” is the term given by German musicologists in the beginning of the twentieth century to the music that is played now in Athens. The musicians make great innovations concerning both the instruments and the type of music they play.\(^{55}\) There will be a longer discussion about this in the chapter “The artists and the New Music”.

The power music has over the human soul is acknowledged long before the fifth century and represented in various myths. Already in the Homeric texts the Sirens enchant Odysseus and his companions with their song. But for the first time during the fifth century, the idea that music can affect one’s behavior and character becomes a whole philosophy, an ethical theory. Music becomes more important in education and is strongly associated with ethos and human behavior. At the same time, music’s potential danger is also recognized and Plato draws strict restrictions for the use of music in his ideal state.

One of the first to actually study and write about music is said to be Lasos of Hermione, a Greek lyric poet of the sixth century BC, in his musicological treatise.\(^{56}\) Musical education is considered very important, and from being a privilege of the aristocratic class, who are taught in their homes, now becomes open to most citizens, as seen in the imagery where school scenes appear. More vase paintings represent musical scenes during the fifth century, including everything from mythical musicians to symposion scenes. After the middle of the fifth century however, there is a decrease in

\(^{54}\) Bundrick 2005, 8.
\(^{55}\) Bundrick 2005, 9.
\(^{56}\) Aristoxenus, *Harmonica* 1.3; West 1992, 225.
musical themes and especially the ones depicting amateur musicians. Professionalism becomes more widespread now. Lasos of Hermione, Pindar, Damon of Oa, 57 Plato, and Aristotle, theorize on the relation of ethos to human behavior, and even to the welfare of the whole society. All these changes are even seen in the vase iconography, where there are more representations of themes associated to ethos. 58 This will be discussed in more detail in the chapter “Ethos in music”.

2.3 Plato’s dialogues

When analyzing Plato’s works, contradictions within them and in comparison to one another are often encountered. First of all, Plato’s ideas change during the span of his lifetime (428/7-348/7). In the Republic, one of his earliest dialogues, he has a utopia of creating the perfect state; thus, he is quite idealistic. In the much later dialogue, Laws, Plato abandons the idea of a faultless state. He becomes more pragmatic and strives to create a state that is closer to reality. Even in one and the same dialogue, however, there are differing opinions. The interpretation of his statements must therefore be done within their context, in particular when the speaker is someone else than Socrates.

The Republic was written around 380 BC. It is one of the most influential works of philosophy and political theory, and perhaps Plato's best known work. It is divided in ten books. The author discusses how he believes the ideal State should be ruled, through Socrates’ voice. He speaks of music and education in general in several of the books in the Republic (II, III, IV, V, VII).

In the Laws, written twenty years later, around 360 BC, Plato ascertains the relationship between music and legislation. In fact, he even states that the songs are the laws of the state, thus connecting legislation and music. 59 As Guthrie puts it:

The Laws is a culmination of the progress we have already observed in other late dialogues, from the unfettered rule of the wise men in the Republic, that “city laid up in the heavens”, to the rule of law as the only safeguard against the abuse of power in the world of fallible human beings. 60

A Cretan, a Spartan, and “the Athenian stranger” (Plato’s voice) are walking from the palace of Knossos to the shrine of Zeus on Crete. During the time they discuss

57 For more information on Pindar and Damon see p. 15f in this essay.
58 Bundrick 2005, 10f.
59 Plato, Laws 799e10-11.
60 Guthrie 1978, 382.
how the best system could be developed, based mainly on the Athenian, but becoming stricter with Dorian and Spartan discipline.

It has the same idea as the *Republic* but this is the second best state, a more real state. Here Plato allows private properties and private families and the existence of written laws. He has more tolerance than in the *Republic* towards the arts. It is divided in twelve books, and some of them (II, III, VI, VII) speak of education and the arts.
3. ETHOS IN MUSIC

3.1 Literature

3.1.1 The intellectual debate in fifth century BC Athens

As early as the time of Homer’s epic poems there exists a belief that music has power over the human soul and can affect a person’s behavior and psychology. In myth, religion, medicine, and ceremony, the concept of music’s ethical power is expressed long before the time of the philosophical treatises, but this idea becomes even stronger in the fifth and fourth centuries BC. The instruments, the rhythm, the melody, and all other ingredients of music, play an important role in forming one’s character and influencing one’s behavior. Lasos of Hermione, Pindar, Damon of Oa and Plato, are some of those who engage themselves in the investigation of music’s relation to ethos.

Pindar is the first Greek poet to present himself as a professional musician. The information about him is only from later sources, but what is said about his ideas shows that he considers modal ethos very important. In his Paeans he states that the Dorian is considered the most dignified and solemn mode. In his Olympian 2 he makes clear that poetry should rule over music, when he says: "Ye hymns that rule the lyre!"

Pythagoras of Samos lives, according to tradition, around the end of the sixth and beginning of the fifth centuries BC. The Pythagorean School, which he establishes first at Croton and then in other Italian cities, has social, political, and religious characteristics, and the members follow a very strict way of life. The Pythagoreans are interested in music and mathematics, and it is for the first time toward the end of the sixth century that the idea of harmony is connected with

---

61 According to Anderson, the idea of musical ethos has its origins in the orient, Anderson 1966, 42.
62 According to Bundrick: “Although ethos signified the good or bad character of any subject, it was particularly linked with ideals of virtue, most notably sophrosyne, especially in opposition to hubris. Interest in sophrosyne and hubris inspired the popularity of such subjects as the Centauromachy, Amazonomachy, and Gigantomachy in wall painting, architectural sculpture, and vase painting. As has often been noted, these mythical battles could serve as metaphors for the equally epic conflicts between the Greeks and the Persians, with the sophron Greeks, representatives of civilization, opposing the bestial, hubristic barbarians who threatened the established order. At the same time, these images alluded to the struggle for sophrosyne within the individual self”; Bundrick 2005, 104.
63 Bundrick 2005, 103.
64 Anderson 1966, 34f.
65 Pindar, Olympian 2 lines 1-2.
mathematics and acquires a more specific musical character. For the Pythagoreans, the whole universe is based on mathematics and they give a mathematical basis to musical intervals. Certain consonances, as the fourth, the fifth, and the octave, are seen as representations of the harmony that exists in the ordered structure and movements of the universe and in the feelings of the human soul, while it is also connected to ethical value. Damon, Plato, and Aristotle seem to be strongly influenced by the Pythagorean research in acoustical and musical phenomena.

The Pythagorean doctrines are very important in the development of a set of guidelines of musical ethos. Plato’s ideas about the power of music are based mainly on the Pythagorean theory and on Damon’s ideas of music causing movement in the soul. Damon is known as a theorist of music and as Pericles’ political adviser. Examples of sources on Damon are Plutarch’s Pericles, Aristotle’s The Athenian Constitution, and Plato’s dialogues, mainly the Republic. Damon is known for the speech he makes in front of the Areopagus, concerning the importance of music in education. He believes music can infuse virtue, wisdom, and justice to the young and bases his doctrine on Pythagorean theories. One of the fragments saved is the following:

> With good reason Damon of Athens and his school say that songs and dances are the result of the soul’s being in a kind of motion; those songs which are noble and beautiful produce noble and beautiful souls, whereas the contrary kind produce the contrary.

The second statement is probably the most important principle of all musical ethics. Damon believes that “musical styles are nowhere altered without (changes in) the most important laws of the state.” This idea is apparent in the Laws and the Republic. Already before Aeschylus’ time, Pratinas complains about the misuse of rhythms and melodies by virtuoso players on the aulos, which shows that the concern about the changes in music existed long before Damon and Plato:

---

66 Lippman 1964, 6.
67 Comotti 1989, 27.
68 Anderson 1966, 38.
69 According to Plutarch "Damon seems to have been a consummate sophist, but to have taken refuge behind the name of music in order to conceal from the multitude his real power"; Plutarch, Pericles 4.
70 Wallace 2004, 249f.
72 Athenaeus 628c.
73 Plato, Republic 424c5-6.
74 Pratinas was one of the earliest tragic poets of Athens (ca 500 BC) and is said to have introduced the satyr plays. He was also a writer of dithyrambs and of choral odes called hyporchemata, RE XXII, 1954, 1721-1730, s.v. Pratinas (F. Stoessl).
'Tis the song that is queen, stablished by the Pierian Muse; but the flute must be second in the dance, for is e'en a servant; let him be content in the revel only, in the fist fights of tipsy youngsters raging at the front door.  

Judging by the work of Pindar and Aeschylus however, these innovations in music by virtuosi are still very faint.

Aristophanes is one of the best sources of information on the musical reality in ancient Greece. He compares the use of modes in older times and his own, and in general comments on the changes in music composition. Through his jokes one can discern his disapproval of the amateur and professional musicians’ enthusiasm in taking advantage of music for showing off their abilities and entertaining the public. Music is taken further away from reality this way, according to Aristophanes, and thus loses its educational ethos. More of his views will be mentioned in the chapter “The Artists and the New Music”.

3.1.2 Plato on music’s ethos

Plato’s dialogues express many ideas on ethos. This chapter concentrates on the ethos of music. In the Republic, the main purpose of Plato’s discussion with his companions is to find the best way possible to rule his ideal State. It is a matter of starting in time: the citizens’ characters must be formed from the early stages in life in order to create the perfect society. In the next chapter Plato’s ideal education will be discussed in more detail.

Plato describes what he believes to be the correct way of composing songs. A song consists of three parts: the words, the melody, and the rhythm. An idea that Plato strongly insists upon is that the words should always be prioritized and plain instrumental music should be avoided. The words are essential in understanding the song. According to the author, people should be able to realize what the song is about, what it is “imitating”, and that can only be done clearly with words. The melody and the rhythm should be according to the words and always follow them; the opposite should never occur.

75 Athenaeus 617b. Csapo is of the opinion that Pratinas might be parodying the critics of New Music, since he is using the new style himself in this dithyramb. It is likely that the aulos player replies to the song of the chorus by playing in the new fashion, Csapo 2004, 218.

76 Anderson 1966, 47.

77 Plato, Republic 398c-d.
Plato does not allow all the harmonies in his ideal state. For example, he does not allow lamentations; that is why he excludes “the mixed Lydian, and the tense or higher Lydian” from his State. In addition, drunkenness, softness, and indolence are unacceptable, and so the Ionian and the Lydian are also excluded. That leaves only the Dorian and the Phrygian:

“I don’t know the musical modes,” I said, “but leave us that mode that would fittingly imitate the utterances and the accents of a brave man… And another for such a man engaged in works of peace… acting modestly and moderately and acquiescing in the outcome. Leave us these two modes – the enforced and the voluntary – that will best imitate the utterances of men failing or succeeding, the temperate, the brave…”

Plato even makes rules about which instruments should be played and which should not: the lyra and the kithara, the instruments associated with Apollo, are accepted into his State. The herdsmen are also allowed some type of syrinx, but the rest of the instruments are driven out. The aulos is banished, since it is the instrument of Marsyas. According to Anderson, Plato is trying to make the music of his ideal State totally hieratic, and erase anything that is not originally Greek. Apart from the myth of Marsyas and Athena, there is even a story about the politician and general Alcibiades:

He refuses to play the flute, holding it to be an ignoble and illiberal thing…“Flutes then”, said he, “for the sons of Thebes; they know not to converse. But we Athenians, as our fathers say, have Athene as foundress and Apollo for patron, one of whom cast the flute away in disgust, and the other flayed the presumptuous flute-player”.

---

78 For a detailed description of the harmonies see West 1992, 177-179.
79 Plato, Republic 398e.
80 Plato’s choice of keeping the Phrygian mode for enriching civic religious life, and Aristotle’s indifference for religion and thus banning of the Phrygian mode, are analyzed in Anderson 1966, 107-109.
81 Plato, Republic 399a-399c.
82 Lyres, harps, and lutes existed in Mesopotamia already before 2000 BC and were also used in west Asia and the Mediterranean. The Greek variants are surely influenced by them, even though the Greeks thought of the lyra as autochthonous; Comotti 1989, 70. For more details on the lyra see West 1992, 49-70.
83 The kithara was probably influenced by the kitharae in the Middle East, present already in the Sumerian age; Comotti 1989, 57.
84 Anderson 1966, 66.
85 According to tradition the aulos came from the East, perhaps Phrygia. The practice of playing pipes was universal in the Near East, from before 2000 BC, according to West 1992, 81.
86 Plato, Republic 399d-e. For more information on the myth of Marsyas and Athena, see p. 26f. in this essay.
87 Anderson 1966, 66.
88 Plutarch, Alcibiades 2.5-6.
The reason was said to be that he did not like the way it blocked the mouth so one could not talk, while the lyra brought the notes and the voice in balance. The moral and aesthetic superiority of the musical performance with a lyra instead of an aulos is based on an aristocratic ideal, which has body, voice, and instrument perform in harmony.\(^8^9\)

The rhythms of music should follow the same rules, according to Plato, avoiding any complexities. They should express courage and harmony and be adapted to the words of the songs that express the same. When Socrates starts speaking about the rhythms, he seeks the help of Damon in remembering, acting as if he does not know the various rhythms himself.\(^9^0\) It seems like Plato wants to show that he is not interested in the techniques of playing music and the technical theory; the author is more concerned about the effect music has on people, while technical issues interest professional musicians, which he disdains.\(^9^1\)

Plato's main idea is that music should stay simple. The narration that is applied to music should be plain, imitating only the “good”. It should help educate the young by giving them examples of just, brave men and good citizens. The narration should never “imitate” women or slaves, coward men, animals or crashing seas. In accordance, the rhythm and the melody do not have to undergo changes either, since they follow the simplicity of the words. All the different types of scales and rhythms will therefore not be needed, given that there is nothing complicated to be represented.\(^9^2\) Plato wants gymnastics to be simple and “good”, just like music:

> While simplicity in music begets sobriety in the souls, and in gymnastic training it begets health in the bodies...\(^9^3\)

He then changes what he said about music for the soul and gymnastics for the body, and says that both music and gymnastics aim to improve the soul. Plato describes how the guardians of the State must train in both in order to become courageous without being savage from too much gymnastics, and to be gentle and moderate without being soft and effeminate from too much music.\(^9^4\) So the man that

---

\(^8^9\) Wilson 2004, 276.
\(^9^0\) Plato, Republic 400a-e. He mentions the dactyllic, the iambic, and the trochaic, amongst others.
\(^9^1\) About Plato’s views on the musicians, see p. 46-49 in this essay.
\(^9^2\) Plato, Republic 401a-402a.
\(^9^3\) Plato, Republic 404e.
\(^9^4\) Plato, Republic 410-412. The second part of this statement reminds us of Pericles’ funeral oration, in which he praises the Athenians by saying: “For we are lovers of beauty yet with no extravagance and lovers of wisdom yet without weakness”; Thucydides 2.40.1.
practices music and gymnastics in a balanced manner will be “the most perfect and harmonious musician”, according to Plato.\textsuperscript{95}

Music and gymnastics should be preserved in their original form, without any innovations, which would be dangerous for the State. Plato states that it was originally Damon who said that when the \textit{mousikoi tropoi} change, the \textit{politikoi nomoi} change with them.\textsuperscript{96} It is most likely that mousikoi tropoi in this case means musical styles,\textsuperscript{97} while politikoi nomoi could either be the laws of the city or in general the political and social rules.\textsuperscript{98} It is worth noting, however, that nomoi is a term used even for a type of musical composition and performance.\textsuperscript{99} From a very young age children should be taught good order in play, with the help of music. That is how they will grow up as orderly and good citizens that will not want to change the laws their predecessors created.\textsuperscript{100}

Plato might possibly think this way but, as pointed out by Anderson, it is debatable if Damon actually is such a conservative, since he is said to make innovations himself and is closely associated with the democratic Pericles. According to Anderson, Plato agrees with and uses many of Damon’s ideas on ethos and education, but discards many others, and does not consider him to be a suitable citizen of his ideal State. The basic difference between them is that for Plato, perfection is necessarily static, though Damon is probably much less conservative.\textsuperscript{101}

As already mentioned, Plato believes there is “good” and “bad” music and dance. His opinion in the \textit{Laws} is that the poets should be restricted in what they are allowed to teach to younger people in order to direct them towards just and correct lives.\textsuperscript{102} In the \textit{Republic} he says that, when poets come to this State, although respected and praised, they will not always be allowed in to recite their poems; only those who imitate the style of the virtuous men and thus set good examples for the

\textsuperscript{95} Plato, \textit{Republic} 411e-412b:”That he who best blends gymnastics with music and applies them most suitably to the soul is the man whom we should most rightly pronounce to be the most perfect and harmonious musician”.
\textsuperscript{96} Plato, \textit{Republic} 424c.
\textsuperscript{97} Wallace 2004, 258; Anderson 1966, 25.
\textsuperscript{98} Wallace 2004, 258.
\textsuperscript{99} See the glossary and n. 113 in this essay.
\textsuperscript{100} Plato, \textit{Republic} 423d-425a.
\textsuperscript{101} Anderson 1966, 77f.
\textsuperscript{102} Plato, \textit{Laws} 656c.
citizens, will be permitted into the State.\textsuperscript{103} Technical proficiency is less important for Plato.\textsuperscript{104}

The author admires the laws of Egypt where it is unacceptable to make any innovations in music, dance or painting; the artists have to strictly follow the tradition.\textsuperscript{105} In all other states except Sparta and Crete, according to Plato, there are no laws forbidding the artists to teach the “bad” music and dancing. He says that if only true music, the natural melodies, could be found, then there would never be any need of innovation. This is because the sacred, real music never gets antiquated, and one does not get tired of it.\textsuperscript{106} The true and natural melodies could be interpreted as influenced by the Pythagorean theories about the ratios and numbers in the balanced universe in relation to music. In \textit{Timaeus} Plato expresses his belief that the purpose of harmony and rhythm of music is to help restore the order in the soul, and not to offer pleasure to the listener:

Music too, in so far as it uses audible sound, was bestowed for the sake of harmony. And harmony, which has motions akin to the revolutions of the Soul within us, was given by the Muses to him who makes intelligent use of the Muses, not as an aid to irrational pleasure as is now supposed, but as an auxiliary to the inner revolution of the Soul, when it has lost its harmony, to assist in restoring it to order and concord with itself. And because of the unmodulated condition, deficient in grace, which exists in most of us, Rhythm also was bestowed upon us.\textsuperscript{107}

Plato admits that music and dance should be judged by the pleasure they give, but not just anyone’s pleasure.\textsuperscript{108} They should be judged by the pleasure they give to the best and most educated men, in particular those with virtue and wisdom.\textsuperscript{109} The competent judges, says Plato, can only be the older men of the \textit{chorus}.\textsuperscript{110} Music and dancing should not follow the taste of the multitude. Instead, Plato’s ideal artist is strong enough to present the “real” music and dance, and better characters than those of the audience, in order to give the people a higher pleasure from the music, and help

\textsuperscript{103} Plato, \textit{Republic} 397-398b.
\textsuperscript{104} Plato, \textit{Laws} 654b8-d7.
\textsuperscript{105} Plato, \textit{Laws} 656d-657b.
\textsuperscript{106} Plato, \textit{Laws} 657b-e.
\textsuperscript{107} Plato, \textit{Timaeus} 47c7-e2.
\textsuperscript{108} At 667e, in the \textit{Laws}, Plato presents his interpretation of the word “pleasure”: “it is the pleasure we feel of some work of art, which does not do harm nor good in any degree worth speaking of. This is why the quality of music should not be judged by the amusement and the pleasure we get from it, because that does not do us any good; art should be judged by the standard of truth.”
\textsuperscript{109} Plato, \textit{Laws} 657d-659a.
\textsuperscript{110} Plato, \textit{Laws} 670b-671a.
them learn from it. Cleinias, the Cretan man, replies that both in Crete and in Sparta there are strict laws on what the poets should present in their work; they should promote justice and convince the people that only a just and good man is fortunate and happy, while the harmony and rhythm should be suitable to the good character of the words.\textsuperscript{111}

Plato is quite concerned with the new way of making music to impress and entertain, with the mixing of different types of rhythm and melody. He considers all art dangerous because it consists of imitation, but music is what requires most care: if one makes a mistake in music it can have very bad consequences. The poets, he says, are much inferior to the Muses and can make mistakes as, for example, wrong combinations of melodies and rhythms, use of solo kithara or aulos without words, or imitation of women, slaves, and even animals. This is wrong for Plato for the following reasons: first, because the imitations mousike represents should be easily understood and therefore based on the words of a song; secondly, music should imitate only the “good” and form the youths’ characters in the best way so that they become just and temperate men with courage, something that cannot be achieved when imitating women, slaves, and animals.\textsuperscript{112}

In the old days, the author recounts, there was such good order in the theatres, that everybody kept quiet until the whole performance was finished. Thus, the audience was not allowed to give its opinion on the music; this was up to the competent authority to judge. As time past, however, poets took more and more freedom in making innovations in music, mixing the different styles\textsuperscript{113} and ignoring the rules of the “just and lawful in music”.\textsuperscript{114} They now inspire the audience to believe that they themselves can also judge if music is good or bad, according to the pleasure it gives them. This, according to Plato, is how music lost its quality. But the worst is that this freedom in music leads further to a freedom in people’s everyday lives, with disobedience of their elders and their rulers. In the end it will even lead to disregarding the gods.\textsuperscript{115} According to these concerns of Plato and his recount of the situation in the past, it appears that some proper forms and established styles of

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{111} Plato, \textit{Laws} 659a-660c.
\item \textsuperscript{112} Plato, \textit{Laws} 668a-670a.
\item \textsuperscript{113} Plato gives a brief account of the different “kinds and manners” of music that existed from very early in time according to him. He mentions hymns, paean, lamentations, dithyrambs, and nomoi. These different styles, Plato continues, one should not mix with one another; Plato, \textit{Laws} 700b.
\item \textsuperscript{114} Plato, \textit{Laws} 700a-d.
\item \textsuperscript{115} Plato, \textit{Laws} 700d-701b.
\end{itemize}
playing music in ancient Greece might have existed, but are now being ignored. These forms might be related to the Pythagorean system of harmonics and consonance.

3.2 The vase paintings

In the iconography of the vase paintings there are none of the above instructions on how songs should be composed and played. Instead there is an interest in the reactions of performers and listeners to music. Both the positive and negative effects of music’s ethos on them are visualized, usually in the form of myths. This is seen in other types of art as well, where *sophrosyne* and *hubris* are often metaphorically contrasted,\(^\text{116}\) as for example in representations of the mythical Centauromachy, Amazonomachy, and Gigantomachy. Aristotle calls the wall painter Polygnotos of Thasos, *agathos ethographos*.\(^\text{117}\) He is one of the first artists to represent the three mythological musicians Orpheus, Thamyris, and Marsyas, in order to investigate and represent the association of music to character and action. In later years other vase painters represent this relationship through images of the symposion and the Dionysian *thiasos*.\(^\text{118}\)

3.2.1 Music and wine: the cult of Dionysos

A topos in the modern study of ancient Greek music has been the alleged opposition between the music of Apollo and the music of Dionysos – the former logical, rational and linked with stringed instruments, the latter wild, irrational, and allied with the *aulos*.\(^\text{119}\)

The Greeks know of music’s ability to calm or excite, and Dionysus and his followers are connected with the second effect. Good examples of music’s exciting effect are seen in the symposion, the *komos*, and the Dionysian thiasos, where wine is drunk and music is played. The wine drinking is however limited: it has to be properly mixed with water, so that it’s positive effect will not turn into drunkenness.

In the vase paintings, the positive and negative effects of both music and wine are visualized. One of the themes on the vases is *mania*, the madness that possesses the god or his followers, the satyrs and the maenads. The most frequently seen instruments in this case are the *aulos* and a stringed instrument, the *barbitos* (Fig. 1,

\(^{116}\) *Sophrosyne* is a complex philosophical term, which includes the ideals of excellence of character, moral sanity, moderation, and soundness of mind. For further information on sophrosyne and hubris see nn. 1 and 62, as well as the glossary of this essay.


\(^{118}\) Bundrick 2005, 104-106.

\(^{119}\) Bundrick 2005, 106.
2). There are also percussion instruments, as the tympanon, krotala, and kymbala, probably liked for the noise they make (Fig. 2, 3). The aulos is said to create the strangest effects on people and to “excite the emotions”. Aristotle says characteristically:

> The flute is not a moralizing (ethikon) but rather an exciting influence (orgiastikon), so that it ought to be used for occasions of the kind at which attendance has the effect of purification rather than instruction.

Concerning percussion instruments, Dionysos has long been associated with them in literature and the vase iconography. The rhythmic noise they make seems to be preferred in orgiastic cults, since it is an important element in creating an ecstatic ambience. During the whole fifth century there are often krotala in Dionysos scenes and mainly from the middle of the century onwards, there are also tympana and kymbala. All these percussion instruments are not valued as much as wind and especially not as much as stringed instruments, which have the highest status during the fifth century.

According to Bundrick, the representation of ithyphallic satyrs playing music connects the music with sexual arousal. The music, the wild dancing to the rhythm of the drums, the sexual excitement, the wine, and maybe other drugs, are important ingredients in becoming ecstatic. Enthousiasmos, to have the god in oneself, and ecstasy, to come out of oneself, are words that originate in Dionysos’ cult. As mentioned above, Aristotle believes in the cathartic benefits of music, while Plato says that dance and music are able to calm the frenzied Bacchants through a cathartic process. The ecstasy and sexual excitement are obvious in many scenes of Dionysos and his followers, and are visualized with indicative postures, such as wide-open arms, tipped-back head, and eyes staring into space (Fig. 1, 2, 3).

---

120 The phorminx and the kithara are also depicted in some of the paintings related to the cult of Dionysos, but not frequently. The fact that the kithara is seen with Dionysos, however, shows that it was not strictly Apollonian. Nymphs never play the kithara. It is only played by the satyrs, since in reality only men ever played it. For more details see Bundrick 2005, 106-108.
121 For example see LIMC s.v Dionysos 295, 296, 314, 329, 333.
122 Aristotile, Politics 1341a.
124 Bundrick 2005, 109. For example see LIMC s.v. Dionysos 153.
125 Modern scholars have mentioned opium, ivy- or toadstool-eating, Godwin 1981, 132.
126 Plato, Laws 790e-791a; Lippman 1964, 46.
127 For example see LIMC s.v. Dionysos 350, 356, 465, 801.
A similar range of reactions to music, both in the gestures and in the expressions of the face, can be seen in representations of the symposion (Fig. 4). The men seem to be entranced as much by the music as by the wine. Sympotic images are at their height in the archaic period, when there are many erotic scenes with *aulétridae* as well. In these scenes there is an erotic atmosphere, with the drinking of wine, the erotic games, and the presence of instruments such as the aulos (Fig. 26). There are many scenes of dance, showing the loss of control by wine drinking. Nevertheless, the Greeks do not cease to believe that "Dionysos, his wine, and his music take the drinker-listener to the edge of disorder, but through that disorder ultimately bring harmony".  

### 3.2.2 The ethos of Orpheus

Representations of the mythical musician Orpheus are mostly from the fifth century and can be associated with the ongoing investigation of music’s effects on psychology. They appear at the same time as other representations related to ethos and *pathos*. Many of the vases have scenes of Orpheus’ death, killed by Thracian women; these show the enraging effect of music on people (Fig. 5). Other scenes show the calming and enchanting effects of music, with Orpheus playing his lyra in the presence of other men. The depictions of Orpheus’ death are many more in number than the ones of him playing music. One explanation that Seebass suggests is that it is aesthetically more interesting for the vase painters to represent the action and movement created by the scene of the killing, than the calmness that the scene of Orpheus as a musician offers. One of the most famous vase paintings of Orpheus is a column crater now in Berlin, on which he is shown sitting on a rock playing his lyra, while four Thracian men listen to his music totally enchanted (Fig. 6).  

Similar to these emotional paintings of Orpheus are representations of other musicians on vases, with the audience listening carefully, captivated by the music.

---

128 For more information on symposion scenes, see p. 37-39 in this essay.
130 For example see *LIMC* s.v. Orpheus 28, 36, 44.
131 For example see *LIMC* s.v. Orpheus 8, 9.
133 Berlin Antikenmuseum, 3172, ca.440; *Imago Musicae* 1995, fig.5; Bundrick 2005, fig.74.
134 For a more detailed description of this vase painting see p. 61 in this essay.
There are mythological scenes for example, such as Apollo, Musaios and the Muses (Fig. 27, 28, 29), and domestic scenes where women play music (Fig. 30, 31).\footnote{For scenes with women playing music see p. 39-43 in this essay.}  

3.2.3 Thamyris and hubris

The story of the mythological musician Thamyris tells of a handsome man with a beautiful voice, who challenges the Muses in a musical contest. He is of course defeated, so the Muses punish him by taking away both his eyesight and his voice. This myth symbolizes the punishment of hubris and warns against immoderate use of music, showing that this will have a negative effect on one’s character and fate.\footnote{Bundrick 2005, 127.}  

The moment of the contest is most commonly depicted on the vase paintings (Fig. 7).\footnote{For example see \textit{LIMC} s.v. Thamyris 10.} The image of Thamyris first appears on vases during the Early Classical period, at the same time as the investigations of musical ethos begin, and discussions concerning sophrosyne and hubris take place. He is almost always depicted in his native Thracian clothes, maybe so as to contrast his imprudence with the characteristically Greek Muses.\footnote{Bundrick 2005, 129.} In some of the paintings both a lyra, which Thamyris is playing or going to play, and a book roll held by a Muse, are depicted. This could be reflecting the ideal education of the time, with poetry and music at the basis of it, while the contest could be representing “an idealized musical performance of Apollonian poetry”.\footnote{Voutira 1995, 75.}

3.2.4 Marsyas: the debate between the aulos and the lyra

Another mythological contest is that between Apollo and Marsyas, who finds the aulos Athena has thrown away, since it disfigures her face. Marsyas is defeated by the lyra-playing Apollo and punished (Fig. 9).\footnote{Apollodorus 1.4.2.} In the vase paintings there is most often the representation of the contest (Fig. 8).\footnote{For example see \textit{LIMC} s.v. Mousai 103.}

According to Voutira, this myth reflects the debate that is going on at the time, concerning the ethical superiority of the lyra in comparison to the aulos. The lyra has only been attested in art from the late eighth century onwards, but right from the beginning it is associated with aristocratic education, indicating social status.\footnote{Bundrick 2005, 14.} The
stringed instruments as the lyra, the kithara, and the barbitos, are slowly replacing the traditional aulos playing. The advantage of the stringed instruments is that one can sing at the same time. Plato, who discards any solo instrumental music, since it can be misinterpreted, has also stressed this. The lyra in particular, is considered the perfect instrument for amateur musicians since it is simple to play and does not need much technical practice. It is worth noting a change in the iconography of the myth in the last three decades of the fifth century: Marsyas is now pictured playing the lyra instead of the aulos (Fig. 10), something which might mirror the ongoing debate between the two instruments. This debate may even be reflected in a scene with a woman preferring the lyra than the aulos handed to her (Fig. 11).

---

143 Voutira 1995, 83. For example see LIMC s.v Mousai 107.
144 There are scenes in which both the aulos and the lyra are pictured, but they never seem to be played simultaneously. There are mythical scenes where Apollo holds a lyra and a Muse the aulos, see Fig. 27, 28.
4. MUSIC AND THE CITIZENS

4.1 Literature

4.1.1 The ideal education

Education in music is most sovereign, because more than anything else rhythm and harmony find their way to the inmost of the soul and take strongest hold upon it, bringing with them and imparting grace, if one is rightly trained, and otherwise the contrary.  

The above statement makes clear the important role Plato believes musical education to have. Education in general is one of the first things that the rulers of his ideal State should take care of and it should start at a very young age. In the Republic Plato states that the narrations that are told to children should be censured; they should not speak of the “world below” in a terrifying way for example, nor should they show a man weeping or lamenting for a friend’s death. They should speak only of the brave and fearless, the just and temperate man, and Plato even allows falsehood in order to preserve the social and moral values. It is most likely that the narrations he speaks of are meant to be sung, as most Greek poetry and narrations were; they can thus be compared to modern nursery rhymes and songs. In general, taking care of education in Plato’s state includes bringing more simplicity in music and gymnastics, a manlier character of poetry, and greater harmony between the individual and the State.

The educated man, according to Plato, is the one that is “fully choir-trained”. Choreia is an essential term in Plato. It has many meanings, but here it is basically the choir training of the citizens which includes instruction in dance and song. It aims mainly at preparing them for the ritual dancing and singing in honor of one or more of the gods. Choreia for Plato is the equivalent of the entire educational system of the Athenian citizens.

Plato divides education into gymnastics for the body and music for the soul. However, there is confusion in his ideas concerning the division of education and the
aim of each part of it. In the *Laws* Plato has the same opinion as in the *Republic*,\(^{152}\) that education has two branches: gymnastics for the care of the body, and music for the care of the soul. In its turn gymnastics also has two branches: dancing, which imitates musical recitation, and aims at preserving dignity and freedom, and wrestling, which aims at health, agility, and beauty.\(^{153}\) The above statement comes in contradiction with another part of the *Republic* where he states that both music and gymnastics aim at the improvement of the soul, the first giving the moderation one needs and the second the courage, without being too savage or too soft.\(^{154}\) It is apparent that Plato is not very consistent in the division of music, dancing, and gymnastics, neither on what their aims are.

The author then presents a detailed educational program, starting from birth until the age of sixteen. Babies should be treated in a way that does not make them too comfortable but neither hateful by being exposed to sorrows too early. Children should be allowed to play games, but from the age of six they should start schooling. Education should be compulsory for all and the teachers are to be foreigners who will be paid. He insists that the rules concern women as much as men, even the type of gymnastics and war training.\(^{155}\) The legislator should not leave the female to live a soft life without order and wasting money, while only taking care of the male half of the city.\(^{156}\) All should be trained from very young to find pleasure in the severe and orderly music and not in the sweet and vulgar music, in order to become better people.

Plato is afraid that the children who are brought up allowed to make changes in their games will grow up to be people who want a different sort of life, and this will end up in them wanting to change the laws of the state, one of the biggest evils, according to the author. Since music is an imitation of good and bad characters, the young should be prevented from seeing imitations of the bad; this can be achieved if music is censured and not innovated. He praises the example of Egypt where art has stayed the same in centuries and has not changed to the better or the worse; this is

---

152 Plato, *Republic* 404e; 376e: “Gymnastics for the body and for the soul music”. See also discussion on music and gymnastics, p.19f in this essay.

153 Plato, *Laws* 795d6-e. For an analysis of the contradiction in Plato’s ideas about gymnastics caring for the body at one point, the soul at another, see Anderson 1966, 94f.

154 Plato, *Republic* 410a-412b.

155 Plato, *Laws* 804d-e.

156 Plato, *Laws* 804e-806c.
accomplished by consecrating all dancing and music, and having special songs and
dances for all the ordained religious festivals.\textsuperscript{157}

From the age of ten and for three years the child can learn the “letters” and
from the age of thirteen and for three years exactly, it can learn to play the lyra.\textsuperscript{158}
Plato then moves on to the regulations concerning the teachers of the lyra. The teacher
should keep the music simple so that it is easier for the student to learn all he has to
learn in three years. No \textit{heterophonia}, and no mixed rhythms; there should be
\textit{homophonia} between the melody of the voice and the instrument.

So, to attain this object, both the lyre-master and his pupil must use
the notes of the lyre, because of the distinctness of its strings,
assigning to the notes of the song notes in tune with them; but as to
divergence of sound and variety in the notes of the harp, when the
strings sound one tune and the composer of the melody another, or
when there results a combination of low and high notes, of slow and
quick time, of sharp and grave, and all sorts of rhythmical variations
are adapted to the notes of the lyre, - no such complications should
be employed in dealing with pupils who have to absorb quickly,
within three years, the useful elements of music.\textsuperscript{159}

This section is one of the very few in which Plato describes the playing of
music in such detail. Indirectly, it depicts and criticizes the new ways of playing
music that appear in the second half of the fifth century. It also shows that it is very
likely there are teachers and students wanting to practice this “difficult” music, which
is the reason Plato feels he has to set these rules. The New Music that the virtuosi
professionals bring with them, is more complicated but probably also more
impressive, especially for the younger generations, and seems to be making its way
into every aspect of the Athenians’ lives, whether Plato and other traditionalists like it
or not.

Plato limits the time of learning to play the lyre to three years, and wants to
keep the knowledge simple. This will be enough for the child to gain the ethical
values that music contributes with, since virtue is represented by simplicity in music,
according to Plato.\textsuperscript{160} The child should not for any reason continue and specialize in
playing music since this will take precious time from other knowledge that has to be
gained, as the “letters” mentioned above, arithmetic, “measuring length and surface

\textsuperscript{157} Plato, \textit{Laws} 798b-799b.
\textsuperscript{158} Plato, \textit{Laws} 809e-810a.
\textsuperscript{159} Plato, \textit{Laws} 812d-e.
\textsuperscript{160} About the simplicity in music see p. 19 in this essay.
and solid”, and astronomy.\textsuperscript{161} Musical training seems to be a preparation of the citizen who will then continue with philosophical studies. Becoming a virtuoso will make one effeminate and soft instead of virtuous.\textsuperscript{162}

Finally, Plato speaks of the regulations that should be applied on dancing and gymnastics, the other half of education. The boys will have dancing masters and the girls dancing mistresses. Supervising and responsible for both music and gymnastics is the “Director of the Children”, who will be old, but able to choose the assistants he wants to help him, women and men.\textsuperscript{163} As in learning to read, write, and play music, there will be public instructors paid by the state to teach the military art to the young people. Women should be taught just as much, in order to be able to protect the young in case of war, when the men go into battle.\textsuperscript{164}

Plato divides the movements of the body called dancing, into two categories: “the one representing the solemn movement of the beautiful bodies, the other the ignoble movement of ugly bodies”. Of the first kind there is a dance of war, of a noble and manly person, and a dance of peace, which shows a temperate character, enjoying prosperity and modest pleasure.\textsuperscript{165} Here Plato divides dancing into the same categories he did earlier with the Dorian and Phrygian harmonies in music, where the first was a harmony of war, the second of peace.\textsuperscript{166}

The dance of war is called \textit{Pyrrhiche} and the dance of peace \textit{Emmeleia}, or dance of order. The Pyrrhiche is a passage rite for boys becoming men, and part of the Panathenaic games, where men and boys compete. It is usually accompanied by an auletes (\textit{Fig. 17}).\textsuperscript{167} Of the bad kind of dancing, which should not exist in Plato’s State, there is a kind of Bacchic dance, according to the author, by drunken men imitating Pans, Silenoi, and Satyrs, associated with purifications or initiation into mysteries.\textsuperscript{168} The ignoble type of dancing should be shown to the youths in the way of comedy, says Plato. It should be something to be laughed it, so that they know what to avoid doing and learning. Slaves and strangers should be hired in these cases, and no serious attention should ever be paid to these dances.\textsuperscript{169} The guardians should make

\textsuperscript{161} Plato, \textit{Laws} 817e.
\textsuperscript{162} Plato, \textit{Republic} 410c-d. See also p. 19 and n. 94 in this essay.
\textsuperscript{163} Plato, \textit{Laws} 813b-d.
\textsuperscript{164} Plato, \textit{Laws} 813e-814b.
\textsuperscript{165} Plato, \textit{Laws} 814e.
\textsuperscript{166} Plato, \textit{Republic} 399a-399c. See p. 18 in this essay.
\textsuperscript{167} Bundrick 2005, 78.
\textsuperscript{168} Plato, \textit{Laws} 815b-d.
\textsuperscript{169} Plato, \textit{Laws} 816d-e.
sure no changes are made once the correct dances are recognized, so that the city and the citizens should continue living in the same way, as much as possible alike each other; that is how they will live their lives happy and well, according to Plato.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Laws} 816c-d.}

There is a passage in \textit{Protagoras} where the thought of Plato’s contemporaries may be presented. If Plato is really letting Protagoras speak for himself in this passage, it is possible to discern how he, and possibly other sophists, view ethical education.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Protagoras} 325d7-e1.} If this is so, the belief that training in rhythms and modes from a young age is very important and long lasting, is even held by others besides Plato in the Athenian society of the time\footnote{Anderson 1966, 95.}

The \textit{Laws} and the \textit{Republic} are in agreement about the importance of music in education and in forming people’s characters. In the \textit{Laws} there are new ideas as well, since Plato now includes in his educational program public festivals, all classes of society, and all ages, even babies and embryos, while even the symposion is seen as a place of education. One of the most interesting new ideas that Plato has in the \textit{Laws} is the importance of games, consisting in singing and dancing from a very young age. He believes that music in this case should be pleasant for the children so it will become attractive to them. Aristotle supports the idea of early habituation to good music, so that the children will at a young age be able to appreciate it and feel pleasure listening to it\footnote{Aristotle, \textit{Nicomacheian Ethics} 1103b23-5.} and also be able to judge correctly without being carried away by pleasure.\footnote{Aristotle, \textit{Nicomacheian Ethics} 1113a25-1113b2.}

\subsection*{4.1.2 The symposion}

The symposion is a man’s world; in particular it is the world of the elite male citizens of a city-state. The symposion’s religious role has already been mentioned;\footnote{See “Background” in this essay.} the \textit{spondeion} is sung while pouring libations to the gods, and paeans, hymns to the gods, are sung after the libations, at every symposion in Archaic and Classical Athens.\footnote{It is worth noting that these religious songs were accompanied by the aulos, something that proves the serious and ritualistic side of the instrument; Bundrick 2005, 81.} There is, of course, a social aspect of the symposion as well. Apart from the entertainment it offers, a good citizen should be able to behave in a civilized way, philosophize, sing and play the lyre, and not drink too much. However, these are the
ideals of Plato and other writers, such as Xenophon, and they do not always represent the real symposia. There are vase paintings for example, which show that a drinking party can get out of control, including very drunk men and even sexual orgies (Fig. 25).\footnote{See also Lissarrague 1987, fig. 9: a red-figure cup from c. 480, NY 20-246, ARV 467/118, in which there is more drinking and erotic play than discussion.} Even Plato suggests there to be “banqueting laws” about speaking, drinking, and playing music, as well as “officers of Dionysos”, who will make sure that the drinking stays under control. These commanders will be of the elder men, some of which will stay sober.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Laws} 671c-e.} The above measures indirectly show the author’s concern about the situation at the symposia at the time.

In the \textit{Laws}, Plato speaks of the “choir of Dionysos”, which will consist of old men, to the surprise of the speaker’s companions.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Laws} 666a-b.} He explains that these old men will be encouraged to sing with the help of wine. There should be rules concerning who can drink wine, according to Plato: young children should not drink it at all until the age of eighteen, since they already have a lively spirit. Men up to the age of forty should only drink very limited amounts, while the older one gets, the more one is allowed to drink. Plato’s explanation is that older people not only want to wash away their sorrows and lighten up their lives with the wine, but they will also have more courage to get up to sing and dance; that is the best way of teaching the younger people all they have learnt through their long lives. They are, according to Plato, the most wise and appropriate to influence the youth and speak/sing of virtue and justice.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Laws} 665a-b.} So the author gives an educational aspect to the symposion as well as the religious and the social.

The symposion is a place of performance of poetry and also one of its themes; the poets speak of the rules and the pleasures of it. What can also be seen as a theme in this poetry is the banquet of the gods on Olympus.\footnote{Schmitt 1990, 20-22.} Aristophanes is one of the poets who takes up the symposion theme: in his \textit{Wasps}\footnote{Aristophanes, \textit{Wasps} 1208-50.} (422 BC) there is a description of an imaginary symposion, where after dinner the guests wash, pour libations, and sing the \textit{skolia}.\footnote{A short drinking-song, which the next guest tries to complete with his own; Barker 1984, 103.}
Symposia still exist in the second half of the fifth century but professionals are now responsible for the entertainment. Plato shows his dislike of the new ways of entertainment at “the wine parties of the common market-folk” through Socrates in *Protagoras*.\(^{184}\) Aristophanes in his *Clouds* also complains about the young people’s disregard of traditional songs and symptic customs.\(^{185}\)

Both Plato and Xenophon have written a *Symposium*. In the first case the guests decide that the evening should be dedicated to philosophical discussion, so they send away the professional auletria to entertain the women in the women’s quarters instead.\(^{186}\) Music is presented as pure entertainment, just as in Xenophon’s *Symposium*. Here there is a lively description of the acrobatics, singing, dancing, and music, that the hired professionals, two girls and a boy, amuse the guests with.\(^{187}\)

### 4.1.3 Women and mousike

In the *Republic* Plato speaks of the education and position of women in his ideal State. When Socrates says that friends will have all in common, his companions ask him to explain what kind of a community of women and children this will be. But Socrates is reluctant to answer, since he feels trouble will arise from what he will say. He agrees in the end to speak of what he calls “the possession and use of children and women”.\(^{188}\)

He believes that women should have the same duties as men, and therefore the same nurture and education, in music, gymnastics, and the art of war. Their original nature is the same: “They have all things in common… except that we treat the females as weaker and the males as stronger”.\(^{189}\) As the guardians will be chosen amongst the men as the most capable of men, their wives will be chosen as the most capable amongst women, because, as Socrates points out, even women can have these qualities, only always inferior. He believes that what prevails at present time is contrary to nature. And it is not a ridiculous sight to see a naked woman exercising, as it appears in Athens; it should be respected because it is for a good cause.

---

\(^{184}\) Plato, *Protagoras* 347c-d.

\(^{185}\) Aristophanes, *Clouds* 1353-79.

\(^{186}\) Plato, *Symposium* 176e.

\(^{187}\) Xenophon, *Symposium* 2.1-3, 2.7-8, 2.11-23, 9.2-7.

\(^{188}\) Plato, *Republic* 451c.

\(^{189}\) Plato, *Republic* 451e.
In *Laws*, Plato insists that education should be compulsory for all and that his rules are to be applied on both women and men.\(^{190}\) Concerning music itself though, he makes a division into feminine and masculine:

> And while it is necessary for him (the lawgiver) to assign both words and music for both types of song as defined by the natural difference of the two sexes, he must also clearly declare wherein the feminine type consists. Now we may affirm that what is noble and of a manly tendency is masculine, while that which inclines rather to decorum and sedateness is to be regarded rather as feminine both in law and in discourse.\(^{191}\)

The ideal man in the author’s opinion is noble and manly, while the ideal woman is solemn, respectable, and modest. The music, says Plato, should follow these principles. This model of the moderate woman is also seen in Pericles’ funeral oration, where a respectable woman in ancient Athens should be heard and seen as little as possible, “whether in praise or in blame”.\(^{192}\)

4.2 The vase paintings

4.2.1 Musical education

In his dialogues Plato creates an outline of his ideal educational program, drawn after the old Hellenic model, giving a picture of how he believes education should be and how he imagines it to have been in the idealized past he has created. Indirectly, he informs of the changes that might have taken place.\(^{193}\) The vase paintings however, seem to mirror the actual changes that took place in society through the whole fifth century. Sheramy Bundrick has examined the changes in the vase imagery, from the end of the sixth century until the end of the fifth; here follows a review of Bundrick’s observations, which are relevant to this study.

As noted in the beginning of this essay, in ancient Greek the term mousike includes music, dancing, and the singing of poetry, which are essential in the *archaia paideia* (ancient education). This aims to give the citizens, in particular the elite, enough musical knowledge in order to express one’s culture and social status in the company of peers. This education changes in the fifth century, giving more importance to rhetoric and literacy (*grammatike*) than to music and gymnastics.

---

\(^{190}\) Plato, *Laws* 804d-806c.

\(^{191}\) Plato, *Laws* 802e.

\(^{192}\) Thucydides 2.45.2.

\(^{193}\) As for example in Plato, *Laws* 812d-e, see p. 30 in this essay.
However, music is still included, and not knowing how to play the lyra is considered equal to not have had a good education.\textsuperscript{194} The number of literate Athenians increases during this century and education is not a privilege of the elite anymore. In the iconography there is a remarkable increase of the musical theme in the fifth century.\textsuperscript{195}

From the end of the sixth century BC there are many scenes of schoolrooms where boys are learning by their music teachers to play music and recite poems, usually in the presence of a paidagogos with a stick (\textit{Fig. 14}).\textsuperscript{196} They are seen mostly on vases connected to the symposion, such as cups, craters, and amphorae. The fact that education is still limited to the elite has an influence on the character of the representations. For instance, there is often a combination of schooling- and symposion-scenes, or at least an indirect alluding to the certain purpose of education, with small symposion scenes on the sides of the vase or just craters in the background of the schoolroom. One of the most famous vases is by the Douris Painter, with lessons in music, reciting, and singing (\textit{Fig. 12, 13}).\textsuperscript{197} The paidagogos shows that these students are from the upper classes. In the background there are two drinking cups, referring to the symposion. There is teaching of the aulos on one side of the cup. In the tondo of the cup there is a scene referring to gymnastics. Thus, as a whole the cup is a visualization of Plato’s ideal of a balanced and harmonious combination of gymnastics and music, for the well being of the body and the soul.\textsuperscript{198}

The musical instruments in the vase paintings often refer to the good education one has received and can be seen for example in mythological themes (\textit{Fig. 15}), and scenes associated to the dead, on white-ground lekythoi (oil-flasks) (\textit{Fig. 32, 33}). In these cases the instruments are mainly chelys lyres (\textit{Fig. 15, 40})\textsuperscript{199} and in some cases kitharae (\textit{Fig. 32, 33}). In the second half of the fifth century these scenes of deceased playing the lyra or with images of lyres around their tomb become more frequent.\textsuperscript{200}

\begin{itemize}
\item 194 Bundrick 2005, 49.
\item 195 “These scenes advertise training in \textit{mousike} for the good of the city and democracy, no matter how grounded they essentially are in aristocratic ideals. It is understood by the viewer that \textit{mousike} affords the types of virtues most beneficial to oneself and the polis, including \textit{sophrosyne} and \textit{harmonia}.” Bundrick 2005, 51.
\item 196 Paidagogos was usually a slave that would follow the young boys to school; Bundrick 2005, 60.
\item 197 For more details on the Douris painter see Robertson 1992, 84-93; Boardman 1975, 137-139.
\item 198 Bundrick 2005, 60-62.
\item 199 Bundrick 2005, 64-66.
\item 200 For representations of women on white-ground lykethoi, see p.40f. in this essay; Bundrick 2005, 68.
\end{itemize}
There are many scenes where an auletes plays during athletic practice, especially in red-figure vases (Fig. 16). The pyrrhike is also a famous theme on vases from the late sixth until the mid fifth century (Fig. 17). It seems like the pyrrhic dance loses its importance around mid fifth century, something that is seen in the decrease of these scenes on vases and in Aristophanes’ complaints in Clouds about how boys in his days do not dance the pyrrhike correctly anymore. As Bundrick observes, many of the above scenes referring to education, as athletic training and music schools, seem to almost disappear from the vase paintings more or less at the same time, after the middle of the fifth century.

4.2.2 The symposion

As has already been mentioned, music plays an important role in the symposia, where the spondeion, the paean, and skolia are sung. All these moments, as well as the mixing of the wine with water in the crater, the performance of hired musicians, the games (Fig. 22), and erotic behavior, are represented in the vase paintings.

Song, poetry, and music can be represented in the paintings with depictions of the musical instruments and with inscriptions. There is a vase depicting Sappho and Alcaeus, with inscriptions of their names above their heads, the word damakalos (“Damas is beautiful”) and five O’s, coming from Alcaeus’ mouth, showing he is singing (Fig. 20). A youth reclining with a bough of myrtle in his hand seems to be singing a skolion (Fig. 18).

Onomatopoetic inscriptions may represent the sounds of notes or even just signs looking like letters and dots. There are a few vase paintings where one can actually read the words the singer is pronouncing. There are even references to gods in the paintings, just as in Plato’s Symposium, where the guests pour the libations, sing a hymn to the god Apollo, and do the usual ceremonies before they start drinking. In one painting the word Opollon (“O Apollo”), an invocation to the god, is written as

---

201 See Boardman 1975 fig. 286, vase painting by Douris with athletic training accompanied by aulos music; Basel, Antikenmuseum Käppeli 425, ARV 430, 31.
203 Bundrick 2005, 80.
204 Bundrick 2005, 81f.
205 For example see Lissarrague 1990 fig. 96, red figure amphora from c. 510 BC, in Berlin, inv. 1966.19; See also Lissarrague 1990 fig.97, black figure epinitron from c. 500 BC, in Eleusis, 907.
206 For example see Lissarrague 1990 fig. 98, black figure skyphos by Pistias class, from c. 515 BC, in Elvehjelm Museum of Art, Madison, 1979.122.
207 Plato, Symposium 176a.
if coming out of the mouth of one of the reclining men. In another, a symposiast is holding castanets while singing *o paidon kalliste* ("O most beautiful boy") (Fig. 19). There is an example of a man playing the lyra and singing, with the words coming out of his mouth and over his head on the one side, while on the other words come out of the lyra in the opposite direction (Fig. 21). He is singing a love song about a beautiful youth, as is so usual at the symposia.

The context of the banquet scene is often balanced by representations of collective activities, such as battles and parades. This way the meal is treated as one civic practice amongst others. Sometimes there are symbols of the banqueters’ occupations besides the general context, such as arms, musical instruments, and drinking vessels. Schmitt finds that the emphasis has been placed on three main elements: “the equal distribution of food and wine; the exchange of conversation, of singing, and of different forms of pleasure; the insertion of commensality in a whole framework of civic activities”.

Examining the iconography through time, it is obvious that during the sixth century there is a focus on aristocratic occupations, such as the symposion and the komos. Apart from the hetaerae, women are not depicted playing music so often. With the establishment of a more democratic system in the end of the sixth century, and during the beginning of the fifth, there is an increase of musical interest which is also reflected in the vase paintings: school scenes (Fig. 12, 13, 14), more symposion scenes with amateur musicians (Fig. 21, 22, 25, 26), athletic (Fig. 16, 17) and courtship scenes with musical accompaniment, Eros as a musician, Apollo and the Muses (Fig. 27, 28, 29).

Sympotic and komos scenes can be seen on vases from 530 until about 400 B.C., but the most vibrant ones are from the period 530-460 BC. During this period the so-called Anakreontic scenes appear, with men dressed in exotic costumes, dancing, singing, and playing music. One theory is that they are dressed as women, and a second, more convincing, is that these costumes and customs are Ionian, but

---

208 For example see Lissarrague 1990 fig. 100, red figure cup by the Brygos Painter from c. 480, in Paris, Cabinet des médailles 546, *ARV* 372/26.
209 Lissarrague 1990, 132f.
211 Schmitt 1990, 19.
212 Bundrick 2005, 197f.
213 For example see Bundrick 2005 fig. 53, column krater by the Pig Painter with Anakreontic komastes from c. 470-460 BC, in the Cleveland Museum of Art, The A. W. Ellenberger Sr. Endowment Fund (1926.549).
seen as effeminate by the Athenians.\textsuperscript{214} There is evidence that the symposion and the komos can get out of control, as seen in a representation of drunken symposiasts (Fig. 25).

However, these scenes of elite entertainment and leisure, as many other scenes examined hitherto, decrease from the mid-fifth century BC. At the same time there is more focus on the professional musicians in the symposion scenes, instead of the symposiasts playing music themselves. During the second half of the fifth century there are many representations of female professional musicians and pyrrhiche dancers, replacing the images of the male pyrrhic dancers (Fig. 23, 24, 26). Bundrick notes that the shift of focus from the aristocratic symposia scenes to professional entertainers in the second half of the fifth century may reflect changing attitudes not only towards musical education, but also towards the way of life of the elite in general.\textsuperscript{215}

\subsection*{4.2.3 Women and mousike}

In the literary sources, the Muses are often the ones inspiring the musicians and the poets, an idea existing already in Homer.\textsuperscript{216} In the vase paintings the Muses are often seen playing music out in the nature, sometimes in the company of Apollo or Musaios (Fig. 27, 28, 29, 40).\textsuperscript{217} Concerning mortal women, there are professional female musicians, the hetaerae,\textsuperscript{218} of which there are quite a few representations in the vase paintings (Fig. 26). They are depicted mostly in the context of the symposion, lightly dressed, while they dance, play music, and usually offer sexual pleasure to the male guests. They are not Athenian citizens; hetaerae are either foreigners or slaves, and remain mostly anonymous.\textsuperscript{219}

According to Boardman, during the Classical period there is an increased interest in scenes concerning the everyday life of women, in comparison to the Archaic period. These are seen mostly on vases that may have been intended for use by women.\textsuperscript{220} Although in the Archaic period the paintings mostly represent hetaerae,

\begin{thebibliography}{10}
\bibitem{Bundrick 2005} Bundrick 2005, 84-86.
\bibitem{Bundrick 2005} Bundrick 2005, 87-90.
\bibitem{The first line, both in the Odyssey and the Iliad is a calling to the Muse or the Goddess for inspiration; Homer, The Odyssey 1.1, The Iliad 1.1.}\bibitem{For example see LIMC s.v. Mousai 12, 19, 36b, 44b.}\bibitem{Plato, Symposium 176e; Aristophanes, Wasps 1335-81; Aristotle, Athenian Constitution 50.}\bibitem{Nordquist 2008, 124f.}\bibitem{Bundrick mentions hydriai, lekythoi, pelikai, oinochoai, pyxides, bell and calyx craters, lebetes gamikoi, amphorae, and stamnoi, all associated with women and household work; Bundrick 2005, 94.}
\end{thebibliography}
now the interest is more on “respectable” Athenian women, many of them in a
domestic setting.\textsuperscript{221} This is however debated, as will be discussed next.

In addition, there are women that play music in cult rituals, but most of the
information regarding them comes from the Hellenistic period and later. They are now
named as “musicians” in the inscriptions, in contrast to the lack of interest in the
musical skills of the female professionals at the symposia. Especially in the
Hellenistic period, women can participate in musical contests and many become
famous.\textsuperscript{222} There are a few celebrated female poets from late Archaic-early Classical
period, as Sappho (\textit{Fig. 20}) and Korinna.\textsuperscript{223} But the poets are hardly ever seen in the
vase paintings, since portraits are not usual at the time.\textsuperscript{224}

\textit{Domestic music making}

There are certain representations of women playing music in settings that imply the
interior of a building (\textit{Fig. 30, 31}). The instruments played are the chelys lyra, aulos,
barbiton, phorminx and harp. Who these women are supposed to be is uncertain: are
the Muses, hetaerae or “respectable” Athenian women, as Boardman believes? These
paintings might be offering new information that is not found in the literary sources;
namely the fact that at least some Athenian women might be well educated in
music.\textsuperscript{225} There are, however, supporters of the other alternatives, that the women
might be Muses\textsuperscript{226} or hetaerae.\textsuperscript{227}

Alexandra Voutira makes the hypothesis that they could be indicating a contest
in lyric poetry, maybe in a private school, since one of them is usually playing or
about to play the lyra, while another holds open a book roll.\textsuperscript{228} Another red-figure
attic vase depicts women in a domestic setting, one of them playing the barbiton,
while the other two seem to be really enjoying the music (\textit{Fig. 30}). There are even
vase paintings depicting women with the aulos. On these vases there are usually two

\begin{footnotes}
\footnote{221} Boardman 1989, 219.
\footnote{222} Nordquist 2008, 125-127.
\footnote{223} Pausanias 9.20.
\footnote{224} See \textit{Fig. 20} for a vase painting representing Sappho and Alcaeus.
\footnote{225} Bundrick 2005, 93-96.
\footnote{226} Some scholars support the idea that they represent Muses, because of the similarity of the scenes
with the ones depicting the goddesses. Bundrick mentions Maas & Snyder 1989, 120, 140f.
\footnote{227} Some scholars have suggested they are hetaerae, since it is the only type of mortal musicians the
literary sources mention and because most other scenes with female musicians are picturing hetairae.
\footnote{228} Voutira believes the book roll is supposed to be showing both text and musical notation; Voutira
1995, 75f.}

or three women with a lyra or a barbiton, and one holds the aulos.\textsuperscript{229} The aulos is hardly ever seen played simultaneously with the stringed instruments, so it is likely they are played alternately.\textsuperscript{230}

Bundrick is of the opinion that these women are mortal and not hetaerae. The paintings show the women respectably dressed and reading papyri, something that the hetaerae are not seen doing. The author mentions two theories of the status of Athenian women. The “pessimistic” one is that they are not allowed to be educated and are limited to the house and housework; the “optimistic” one is that men are aware of the importance of women in managing the household, and they are not totally excluded or oppressed, even if there is a separation of duties for men and women.\textsuperscript{231} As Aristotle points out, women do take part in the public life of Athens, especially in the religious cults.\textsuperscript{232} After Pericles’ law in 451/0 that both mother and father should be Athenians in order to be an Athenian citizen, Athenian women probably become more important. Bundrick believes that this supports her opinion that the vase scenes represent leisure moments of educated, privileged Athenian women, playing music.\textsuperscript{233}

There is a group of white-ground funerary lekythoi with women playing instruments on them, and “the funerary nature of these vases suggests it was desirable and acceptable to memorialize a woman as educated for all eternity”.\textsuperscript{234} On these vases there is usually one person playing music and another listening, and the music serves as an expression of grief (Fig. 32, 33).\textsuperscript{235}

It is most probable that these women are mortals and respectable Athenian citizens, for the following reasons: their clothing indicates that they are not hetaerae but respectable women; besides, they are not pictured in a context similar to that of the symposion scenes, and the atmosphere is much calmer. There are no inscriptions with names of the Muses; they are inside an oikos, represented by the columns for door and walls, while Muses are out in the nature, usually sitting on a rock. Finally,

\textsuperscript{229} For example see Voutira 1995 fig. 18, red figure calyx krater from c. 440-430, in Würzburg von Wagner Museum, 521.
\textsuperscript{230} Voutira 1995, 90.
\textsuperscript{231} Bundrick 2005, 96-98.
\textsuperscript{232} Aristotle, \textit{Rhetoric} 1361a; Aristotle, \textit{Politics} 1259a38-1259b10.
\textsuperscript{233} Bundrick 2005, 98.
\textsuperscript{234} Bundrick 2005, 99.
\textsuperscript{235} Seebass 1995, 32.
there are always just women depicted, no men, indicating that the scene might be taking place in the *gynaikon*, the private space of the women.

**Female musicians in cult**

Both male and female citizens take part in cult rituals. Music is played during processions, sacrifices, and in chorus-dances.²³⁶ Women engage themselves as musicians in Apollo’s cult, and possibly even Athena’s and Artemis’.²³⁷ They even participate in the cult of Dionysos, which will be discussed briefly here.

There is a group of vase paintings, called “Lenaia scenes”, depicting women worshipping Dionysos *(Fig. 34)*. In these scenes the women wear characteristic clothes for the Dionysian cult and practice rituals around a mask representing the god himself. Sometimes they play the aulos and others the tympanon. It is debated whether these women are mortals at the festival of the Anthesteria or the Lenaia, or if they are mythological women, namely nymphs. Bundrick believes it must be something in between the two alternatives, as with so many other cases in fifth century iconography. The women represented are probably nymphs, but the practices might take place in reality at Dionysos’ festivals; the drum and the aulos are very likely to be part of these rituals.²³⁸

A good example of music in orgiastic or ecstatic cult is seen on a volute crater attributed to the Group of Polygnotos, with a cult procession before two seated figures *(Fig. 35)*. In representations of this sort the women tend to play percussion instruments, which are an important element in orgiastic cults. It is once again difficult to say if this scene represents myth or reality. The seated man and woman are often identified as the Phrygian Kybele and her son Sabazios or Dionysos-Sabazios. The procession consists of standing and dancing women and men. One woman is carrying a *liknon* (a basket in which the secret objects of the mysteries are said to be hidden), a woman is playing the aulos, and a girl the tympanon; three women are dancing with snakes, which allude to the chthonic nature of the ritual. There is another group of dancing women and girls, and a boy with kymbala (one of the few representations of the instrument in fifth century imagery), while two aulos players, a man and a woman, stand beside them. The dancing seems ecstatic. The instruments

---

²³⁶ See Nordquist 1990 and “Background” in this essay.
²³⁷ Nordquist 2008, 126f.
²³⁸ Bundrick 2005, 157f.
are probably the ones used in reality in these rituals.\textsuperscript{239} This ecstasy, reached with music and dancing, seems to be the purpose of mysteries in general; the \textit{mystae} (initiates) want to get away from civilization and the earthly, while coming closer to identification with the divinity. It is reasonable that this is especially appealing to the women and lower classes of society, which are all accepted as participants in the rituals, and for a while free themselves from everyday troubles.

\textit{Private ceremonies}

Women are seen playing music in private ceremonies, as, for instance, at weddings. During the sixth century it is mainly Apollo Kitharoidos that is portrayed in wedding scenes as the musician, but in the fifth it is mostly mortals playing the music, even the brides themselves in some cases.\textsuperscript{240} There are vase paintings depicting the dances of women at weddings, accompanied by male or female musicians (aulos or lyra players or both).\textsuperscript{241} In some paintings there is one woman playing the harp, probably the bride (\textit{Fig. 36}). In another the bride is playing the chelys lyra.\textsuperscript{242} while once the bride is seen holding an aulos up to her face.\textsuperscript{243} These musical instruments may allude to the bride’s education and social status.\textsuperscript{244}

\textsuperscript{239} Bundrick 2005, 158-160.
\textsuperscript{240} Bundrick 2005, 179.
\textsuperscript{241} Bundrick 2005, 181.
\textsuperscript{242} For example see lebes gamikos by the Painter of Athens 1454, in Athens, National Museum 1171, from Peristeri; \textit{ARV} 1179,4.
\textsuperscript{243} For example see Bundrick 2005 fig. 20, lebes gamikos by the Washing Painter with bride and companions, c. 430-420, in Athens, National Archaeological Museum (14791).
\textsuperscript{244} Bundrick 2005, 189-191.
5. THE ARTISTS AND THE NEW MUSIC

As mentioned earlier, there are both amateur and professional musicians in ancient Greece. During the Archaic and Classical period society undergoes many changes, which influence music and the position of musicians in society. One of the basic changes is the increasingly higher status of professional musicians.

Until the Early Classical period, musical education, as noted in the previous chapter, is a privilege of the elite. With the establishment of democracy in the end of the sixth century and during the whole fifth, education becomes accessible to a larger part of the population; being able to play the lyra and recite poems is considered proof of good education. During the fifth century music is present in so many situations in the life of Athens, that just about all Athenians can be called amateur musicians: they sing paeans in festivals or before a battle, chant the *hymenaeos* at weddings, participate in choruses at festivals or private celebrations, and play music and sing at the symposia, amongst other events. This changes with time, however, and in the end of the fifth and beginning of the fourth century the growing importance of professional musicians is witnessed, as well as a decrease of the value of musical education among the Athenian citizens.\(^{245}\)

Professional musicians are of two kinds, the ones that have a special talent, and the ones who perform routine services. The first are known already from Homer: they are *aedoi* and *rhapsodoi* that have special skills and a talent in music. Inspired by the Muses, they accompany themselves with a phorminx or a lyra and sing long epic poems, narrating the deeds of heroes of the past.\(^{246}\) They hold a high status and are called to play at gatherings and celebrations to amuse the guests.\(^{247}\) By the sixth century though, the guests themselves have to be educated well enough to sing the new types of poetry that are mainly written for the symposion, namely lyric and elegiac poetry. They accompany themselves on the lyra.\(^{248}\)

During the fifth century, there are on the one hand professionals in the musical contests, which are reorganized in Athens, with musicians coming from all over the

\(^{245}\) West 1992, 34f.
\(^{246}\) Barker 1984, 18.
\(^{247}\) West 1992, 34.
\(^{248}\) Lissarrague 1990, 124.
Greek world. They bring with them their talents and innovations that cause the debate discussed in this essay.\(^{249}\)

On the other hand there are professionals who provide official routine services without needing any special talent, and usually have a lower status than the talented performers. In Athens there are the auletes of the archons and the auletes of the boule, as well as salpingtae with civil duties. They are most likely Athenian citizens.\(^{250}\)

There are also mourners and auletae that can be hired for various public or private events, as weddings and funerals. At the symposia, by the end of the fifth century “young men scandalized their elders by reciting speeches from decadent modern dramas instead of drawing on the traditional repertoire, or they rejected altogether the doing of a party piece”.\(^{251}\) Professionals seem to be hired all the more often to entertain the guests. They are women or men, slaves or hirelings, often of foreign origin. They entertain the guests with music, dancing, and acrobatics, taking the place of the amateur music making that was more common in the beginning of the fifth.\(^{252}\)

Other symposiasts satisfy themselves with philosophical conversations and no music at all.\(^{253}\)

In Greek cult an auletes always participates in the sacrifice; it is either a man or a woman, who receives a share of the meat of the sacrificed animal. The musician is either an amateur aristocratic citizen or a professional of high or low status, and sometimes even a slave. He or she is temporary employed for a certain event or festival or paid by the year, having steady duties with civil or sacral authorities. It seems, however, that the money is not enough to support them a whole year, so these musicians probably play at other occasions as well, when they get the chance. In the texts the professional musicians are not appreciated as much as the star performers, who are employed by kings and other wealthy men. But in general in the literary sources, any form of professionalism is seen negatively.\(^{254}\)

\(^{249}\) See p. 50f. in this essay.
\(^{250}\) Nordquist 1991, 84f.
\(^{251}\) West 1992, 26.
\(^{252}\) West 1992, 35. As in Xenophon, Symposium, see p. 34 in this essay.
\(^{253}\) As for example in Plato, Symposium 176e.
\(^{254}\) Nordquist 1991, 93.
5.1 Literature

A brief account of the ideas of Plato and Aristotle concerning art and the artists, as well as musical contests, will follow. Next, this chapter will concentrate on New Music and the reactions it caused.

5.1.1 Amateur and professional musicians

Plato’s views on art

Plato’s views on art and the artists are not consistent. Two different theories concerning art can be discerned in his dialogues: on the one hand there is the division of art into “good” and “bad”, and on the other the universal condemnation of art. The first view is seen mainly in Republic, books II and III and in Laws, books III and VII. The criteria for judging art as “good” are different though; in the Republic the quality of art depends on the virtue of the object that is being “imitated”, while in Laws it depends on how correct the “imitation” is, how close to the actual object. The second view is seen in Republic, book X, where art is presented as an imitation of the world we live in, which is an imitation of the realm of Ideas. Thus, art is a copy of a copy, twice removed from reality. This view is the cause of the strict censure Plato would like to apply on the arts and is apparent when he presents the poet as one that “knows nothing of the reality but only the appearance”.

Part of the first view, where art can be either “good” or “bad”, is the idea that musical talent is given by the gods. The poetae (poets and music composers) are men that compose in poetic ecstasy. The gods inspire them, so what they create is closer to reality than the world we live in, instead of further away. They are the voice of the gods, but they alone do not have the ability to create what they do under poetic ecstasy.

In Plato’s dialogue Ion, two views of the poets can be discerned: on the one hand there is the Homeric conception, in which the poet composes his own poems with the aid of the divine; he is a clever teacher and educator. On the other hand there is a different approach, in which the God enters and possesses the poets, as for example the Orphic writers, in a so-called enthousiasmos. In Ion Plato rejects the idea that this poet could be a practical and moral guide, and presents him as a mindless

---

255 Plato, Republic 601a7-b2.
256 According to Guthrie this approach appears sometime during the sixth century BC; Guthrie 1975, 208.
medium for god’s words.\textsuperscript{257} It is a discussion between Socrates and the poet/rhapsodist Ion, about the latter’s ability of interpreting Homer. Socrates asks various questions and concludes that Ion acts without technical knowledge, but by a divine gift, possessed by Homer, and thus blameless of dishonesty.

SOC. Now if you are an artist (textnikos) and, as I was saying just now, you only promised me a display about Homer to deceive me, you are playing me false; whilst if you are no artist, but speak fully and finally about Homer, as I said you did, without any knowledge but by a divine dispensation which causes you to be possessed by the poet, you play quite fair. Choose therefore which of the two you prefer us to call you, dishonest or divine.

ION. The difference is great, Socrates; for it is far nobler to be called divine.

SOC. Then you may count on this nobler title in our minds, Ion, of being a divine and not an artistic praiser of Homer.\textsuperscript{258}

This is an example of poetic ecstasy. Plato means that the poet can create only when he is in a “divine frenzy” with the gods giving the power to him, since he is not himself competent enough. Socrates proves it here by saying that in any other case Ion would have knowledge on all the themes in Homer, which Ion does not. However, Socrates only asks about practical knowledge, not aesthetic, which shows that Plato sees art as didactic, giving moral and political advice.\textsuperscript{259} The Muses provide their help in giving the facts of the poem not creating its form.\textsuperscript{260}

Plato believes that the poets do have a poetic ability, but that they are not always capable of telling between good and bad and have no perception of what is just and lawful in music.\textsuperscript{261} The composition of prayers to the gods in addition, is a responsibility of the poets, and Plato finds it very important to have the correct prayers composed, so that nothing bad is requested of the gods.\textsuperscript{262} That is why the poets will never compose alone, but always with the guidance of men over the age of fifty and the inspection of the Law-wardens, who will judge the compositions before letting them be performed for the citizens.\textsuperscript{263} He requires strict rules in the ideal state;

\textsuperscript{257} For a more detailed analysis, see Guthrie 1975, 204-211.
\textsuperscript{258} Plato, \textit{Ion} 542a-b.
\textsuperscript{259} Guthrie 1975, 205.
\textsuperscript{260} Guthrie 1975, 206f.
\textsuperscript{261} Plato, \textit{Laws} 802b-c.
\textsuperscript{262} Plato, \textit{Laws} 801a-b.
\textsuperscript{263} Plato, \textit{Laws} 801c-d.
the poets will not be allowed to teach anything that goes against the traditional ethical standards, otherwise they will be banned.\textsuperscript{264}

In general Plato is not so concerned about the artists’ technical abilities or their special skills in composition. His main concern is that they are men of virtue, regardless of musical or poetic talent. His focus is basically on the practical issues in securing the educational ethos in music and he imposes many rules on how the artists should compose their works in order for this to be achieved.

\textit{Plato and Aristotle’s views on professionalism}

Although there are indications that the Athenian citizens can be professional musicians,\textsuperscript{265} Plato and Aristotle do not approve of that. They do not want the citizens educated in a technical way aiming to please and entertain the audience. They want the Athenian citizens to be educated so as to improve their own virtue. Here follows Aristotle’s opinion on the correct musical education for the Athenian citizens:

\begin{quote}
And since we reject professional education in the instruments and in performance (and we count performance in competitions as professional, for the performer does not take part in it for his own improvement, but for his hearer’s pleasure, and that a vulgar pleasure, owing to which we do not consider performing to be proper for free men, but somewhat menial; and indeed performers do become vulgar, since the object at which they aim is a low one, as vulgarity in the audience usually influences the music...)\textsuperscript{266}
\end{quote}

As mentioned in the previous chapter, Plato believes that three years of musical training is enough for the student in order to achieve the goals of musical training. More time on music he considers unnecessary, since a person needs to learn other things, such as philosophy. The professional musicians, that play the musical instruments for payment, should be foreigners.\textsuperscript{267} In school and at the theatre, the music and songs should aim to give good examples to the Athenian citizens and not to entertain them.\textsuperscript{268} It seems like he basically does not want Athenians occupying themselves solely with music and especially accepting payment for it. His ideal is that the freeborn Athenians should not have to do work with the hands, but they should have the time to philosophize, recite poetry, play simple music, and in general do

\textsuperscript{264} Plato, \textit{Laws} 656c1-7.
\textsuperscript{265} Nordquist 1991, 95.
\textsuperscript{266} Aristotle, \textit{Politics} 1341b9-14.
\textsuperscript{267} Plato, \textit{Laws} 804d-e.
\textsuperscript{268} For example in Plato, \textit{Laws} 653a-c and 659a.
what is believed to form a better character. Since most citizens from the lower classes need to work through, all this can only concern the elite and it agrees with the rest of the author’s aristocratic ideas. Plutarch narrates that even

   Philip (of Macedon) once said to his son (Alexander) who, as the wine went round, plucked the strings charmingly and skillfully, “Are you not ashamed to pluck the strings so well?”

As Plato says, the gods created the religious festivals for the people to rest from their work; there they can engage in dance and song in the company of the Muses, Apollo, and Dionysos, and that way “set right again their modes of discipline”. That can be compared to Aristotle’s opinion on why music has become an essential part of education: it provides dignified enjoyment in leisure time. He believes that moderate playing and listening to music is good for both the body and the mind, assists in the development of a morally correct character, and leads to wisdom. Even Pericles’ idea can be paralleled to the philosophers’:

   Moreover, we have provided for the spirit many relaxations from toil: we have games and sacrifices regularly throughout the year…

Ford sees Aristotle as a political theorist “drawn to music because of the profound effects it obviously has on human souls and their character”. What differs him from Plato, however, is the fact that he is less strict and allows even non-educational music in the city festivals and pleasurable activities, which are not always combined with the moral and political aims that Plato has.

Musical contests
Mousikoi agones are musical competitions where solo kitharodoi, kitharistae, aulodoi and auletae perform, the most famous events being the Pythia at Delphoi and the Karneia at Sparta, both in honor of Apollo. With time, mousikoi agones are introduced into the Panathenaic festival, which becomes Panhellenic. In Plato’s opinion there should be musical and gymnastic contests between the citizens:

---

269 Plutarch, Pericles 1.5.
270 Plato, Laws 653d.
271 Aristotle, Politics 1339b10ff (or 1337b29-34).
272 Thucydidès 2.38.1.
By competition-officers it (the law) means umpires for the competitors both in gymnastics and in music... in the case of music it will be proper to have separate umpires for solos and for mimetic performances, - I mean, for instance, one set chosen for rhapsodists, harpers, flute-players, and all such musicians, and another set for choral performers.277

Contests are normally associated with hard technical training so as to become better than the other competitors and win. Plato’s competitions should therefore be differentiated from the real ones. In Plato’s ideal state, poets’ and musicians’ ambition should be to educate the audience, not impress them. So the winner is the one whose song has the best didactic value and ethos. The elder men, who feel real pleasure by listening to the finest and noblest of music will appoint the winner.278 Another basic difference from reality is probably the fact that the amateur musicians playing in Plato’s contests will not receive prizes in money.

In the above passage there is a contradiction with Plato’s strict directions of never having plain instrumental music because it can confuse the audience. Here he even names “players on the harp/kithara, the flute and the like” that will all compete in these contests. It also contradicts the banning of the aulos in other parts of his dialogues.

5.1.2 The musical revolution of the late fifth century

The New Music

As Csapo points out in his article “The politics of the New Music”, the actual term “New Music” is misleading, since it never appears in the sources as such. The new style of music is more often referred to as “theatre music”,279 since the most important forms influenced by it are the dithyramb and drama.280

The late fifth century is a turbulent period with interesting musical developments. Most evidence comes from two later writers, pseudo-Plutarch and Athenaeus, who have preserved fragments of the writings of the time. Aristophanes, Plato, Aristoxenus, and others are also of help, but it is sometimes difficult to date the changes they mention.281

277 Plato, Laws 764d-e.
278 Plato, Laws 657e-659b.
279 Plato, Laws 700a-701d; Aristotle, Politics 1342a18: theatrika mousike; Pseudo-Plutarch, De Musica 1140d-f: theatrika mousa.
280 Csapo 2004, 207.
281 Barker 1984, 93.
The most important musical forms the above sources speak of, apart from the music used in drama, are the dithyramb and the *kitharodic nomos*, which follow a similar evolution. The dithyramb undergoes many changes, not least when tyrant Peisistratus sets up the City Dionysia, where competitions in dithyramb, tragedy, and comedy take place. Comotti suggests that this competitive atmosphere is what pushes the composers to make innovations. The dithyramb loses its religious character with time and the composers feel free to use myths about other gods, and even to make changes in the melody and rhythm.\textsuperscript{282} According to Csapo, it is the Athenian democracy that finally turns the dithyramb into a show for the Athenian mass.\textsuperscript{283} The kitharodic nomos follows the changes of the dithyramb. Although innovations take place all through the fifth century, they concern mainly the dithyramb; only during the last decades of the century do they spread to other genres.\textsuperscript{284}

The most famous composers of this period are Melanippides, Phrynis, Philoxenus, Timotheus, Cinesias, and Telestes. There is a comedy called *Cheiron* written by a certain Pherecrates, quoted in pseudo-Plutarch’s treatise *De Musica*.\textsuperscript{285} In this play, personified Music herself makes a speech complaining about the way musicians have been treating her lately. The fragment is criticizing the innovations made in music at the time. Pherecrates wins his first prize in 438 BC, so he is contemporary to the poets he mentions.\textsuperscript{286} It is one of the most important documents concerning New Music.

The various innovations of these musicians are too many to be mentioned in this essay.\textsuperscript{287} Besides, one can come upon difficulties understanding their exact meaning. Some examples can be given here, as Melanippides who is accused of being the one to have started the degeneration of music.\textsuperscript{288} He is active around 480-430 BC\textsuperscript{289} and is in fact admired by Xenophon.\textsuperscript{290} Aristotle mentions of his innovations in the structure of the traditional dithyramb.\textsuperscript{291} Philoxenus is another example,

\textsuperscript{282} Comotti 1989, 23f.
\textsuperscript{283} Csapo 2004, 209.
\textsuperscript{284} Comotti 1989, 30.
\textsuperscript{285} Pseudo- Plutarch, *De Musica* 1141d-1142a.
\textsuperscript{286} Anderson 1966, 50.
\textsuperscript{287} For an extensive description of the innovations see Barker 1984, 93-98; West 1992, 356-368; Comotti 1989, 35-40.
\textsuperscript{288} Pseudo- Plutarch, *De Musica* 1141d-1142a.
\textsuperscript{289} Barker 1984, 93.
\textsuperscript{290} Xenophon, *Memorabilia* 1.4.3: "In epic poetry Homer comes first...in Dithyramb, Melanippides.”
\textsuperscript{291} Aristotle, *Rhetoric* 1409b: “Instead of antistrophes composed dithyrambic preludes.”
characterized as very talented by Antiphanes. Concerning Cinesias, Aristophanes says he is a nonsensical and pretentious dithyrambist, while Plato says that he tries to please the public instead of being instructive. Innovations that are made by these musicians include adding more strings to the kithara or finding ways to tune it so that more harmoniae can be played on it, as well as shifting between harmonies and rhythms (the often mentioned kampai).

Timotheus of Miletos is the most important new-wave composer. He is trying to have a melody and metrics that are constantly and suddenly changing. Pherecrates seems to dislike the high notes that Timotheus achieves with the extra strings on his instrument, something that probably makes the music more colorful and exciting for the public. Pherecrates says with the voice of Music:

He's been worse than all the other fellows put together; his notes crawl up and down the scale like ants, and when he finds me on a walk alone he tears and breaks me with his dozen strings.

With these innovations, Timotheus’ music becomes difficult to sing for the amateur Athenian citizens who form the chorus in these times. It is also harder for a large group to sing this music, than for a single individual. Only well-trained professionals can meet the demands of the New Music, and this is one of the main reasons that the Hellenic dithyrambic chorus slowly dies out. This concern is seen clearly in the Problems, attributed to Aristotle, in which the author describes how the amateur chorus cannot keep up with the innovations in musical performances. Plato’s distress over the New Music becomes more comprehensible now, since, for him, the chorus of the citizens personifies the civic paideia; it is through the chorus that the citizens get their best and most important education. However, even though Timotheus is strongly criticized in Pherecrates, Aristophanes, and the philosophers, he becomes the leading composer of his time. In fact, his nomoi and those of Philoxenus become classics in the education of children two centuries later.

---

292 Athenaeus 643d: “Far superior to all poets is Philoxenus.”
293 Aristophanes, Birds 1377ff.; Lysistrata 838ff.; Frogs 153, 1435-7; Ecclesiazousae.330.
294 Plato, Gorgias 501e.
295 Pseudo- Plutarch, De Musica 1141d-1142a; Aristophanes, Clouds 970-1.
296 Anderson 1966, 50.
297 Anderson 1966, 51.
298 Pseudo- Plutarch, De Musica 1142a.
300 Plato, Laws 654a-b.
301 Polybius 4.20.8-9.
West calls these new virtuosi “star performers”. They perform in a time when personality and individual virtuoso skills are becoming all the more important for the public. In general this period is characterized by more complexity in music (in rhythms, melodies, and poetic diction) and a mixing between musical styles. New Music is closely associated with emotional expression and decorative elaboration, so specialist performers on the aulos become very important, since it is an instrument one can apply these innovations on easily. The status of the leading auletes is now higher than ever.\footnote{West 1992, 366.}

Many of the well-known auletae are Theban, as Pronomus,\footnote{Stefanis 1988, 2149.} who is well known for having been the first to play all the harmoniae on one pair of auloi.\footnote{Barker 1984, 97.} Another one mentioned is Antigeneidas from Thebes,\footnote{Stefanis 1988, 196.} who does not like the name “auletes” being applied to every simple musician that plays at a funeral. There are quite a few details in the information about him and other auletae, something that shows the growing interest in them.\footnote{In the inscriptions, the auletes never used to be named, whereas in the fourth century they started being named after the choregos and the chorus-master and later even before the chorus-master; West 1992, 367.}

The most celebrated kitharistes of these times is Stratonicus of Athens (active between 410 –360 BC).\footnote{Stefanis 1988, 2310.} He is said to have adopted the kithara with up to eleven strings. The kitharodoi are the musicians who arouse the most popular interest, and they are the ones who get the biggest prizes at the Panathenaic competitions in the end of the fifth and beginning of fourth centuries.\footnote{West 1992, 368.}

Resistance to the New Music

Not everyone follows these new developments in music. There are in fact quite a few musicians and theorists that are opposed to these tendencies and continue in the old style.\footnote{Some of the conservatists named are Tyrtaeus of Mantinea, Andreas of Corinth, and Thrasyulus of Phlius; Pseudo-Plutarch, De Musica 1137f-1138a. Dorion is another, who plays for Philip of Macedon; West 1992, 369.} Plato and Aristotle are entirely against the introduction of these new techniques of the virtuosi kithara and aulos players in the musical education of the
Athenian citizens and characterize them as morally harmful. Plato forbids any imitations of women, animals, cowards, and whatever creates a lot of noise, since all that demands the use of different and complex scales, rhythms, and changes from one to another.

Plato does not directly criticize the musicians as much as Pherecrates and Aristophanes do. He criticizes the changes that have taken place in musical performance. In Laws Plato describes with distaste how the situation has changed in the theatre, in the following passage:

> Among us, at that time, music was divided into various classes and styles... So these and other kinds being classified and fixed, it was forbidden to set one kind of words to another class of tune. The authority... was a rule made by those in control of education that they themselves should listen throughout in silence, while the children and their ushers were kept in order by the discipline of the rod... But later on, with the progress of time, there arose as leaders of unmusical illegality poets who, though by nature poetical, were ignorant of what was just and lawful in music; and they, being frenzied and unduly possessed by a spirit of pleasure, mixed dirges with hymns and paeans with dithyrambs, and imitated flute-tunes with harp-tunes, and blended every kind of music with every other; and thus through their folly, they unwittingly bore false witness against music, as a thing without any standard of correctness, of which the best criterion is the pleasure of the auditor, be he a good man or a bad. By compositions of such a character, set to similar words, they bred in the populace a spirit of lawlessness in regard to music... Hence the theatregoers became noisy instead of silent, as though they knew the difference between good music and bad music, and in place of an aristocracy in music there sprang up a kind of base theatrocracy.

Thus, as Plato recounts, in the “old days” there was order, but now the will of the audience has taken over, and the poets compose in order to please the crowd instead of educating them, which is the original purpose of music.

Aristoxenus is another one who believes music has degenerated in favor of the crowd’s pleasure. In his opinion earlier music aimed to educate and honor the gods, but in his times musicians compose only for the concert-hall. He criticizes Crexus,
Timotheus, and Philoxenus, who have all discarded the enharmonic genus, trying to make music sweeter.\textsuperscript{315}

It is a common practice during this period to criticize other composers’ work in one’s own. This is seen especially in comedies, where the criticism is expressed with humor, often satire and abuse. The best sources are Aristophanes and the Pherecrates-fragment mentioned above. These plays offer not only contemporaries’ views towards the changes in music, but also information about musical techniques, musicians, and the actual changes that are taking place.

Aristophanes works from about 430 until 390 BC. He is a traditionalist who sees the changes in music as corruption of the arts. He is a supporter of simple and manly music, as represented in the compositions of Aeschylus.\textsuperscript{316} A detailed account of all he says about music is beyond this essay, but a few examples can be named. In Clouds, Aristophanes criticizes the new dithyramb-composers and makes the character Socrates call them “quacks of every degree…and fools who their staves of dithyrambs proudly rehearse”,\textsuperscript{317} while the dithyrambic poet Cinesias is satirized by Aristophanes in his play Birds.\textsuperscript{318}

Frogs is one of the latest of Aristophanes’ plays, written in 405 BC. In this play Dionysos decides to travel to Hades to bring back Euripides, because no good poets are left in Athens anymore. When he gets there though, he discovers that Euripides has taken Aeschylus’ honored place on the poetic throne of Hades. A long contest begins between the two poets, Euripides and Aeschylus, with Dionysos as a judge. The styles of their compositions are evaluated and compared with each other, both from a musical and a poetic perspective.\textsuperscript{319} An interesting passage is where Aeschylus makes fun of Euripides:

\begin{quote}
But he from all things rotten draws his lays, from Carian flutings, catches of Meletus, dance-music, dirges. You shall hear directly.
Bring me the lyre. Yet, wherefore need a lyre for songs like these?
Where's she that bangs and jangles her castanets (ostraka)?
Euripides's Muse, present yourself: fit goddess for fit verse.
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{315} Pseudo-Plutarch, De Musica 1145a-d.
\textsuperscript{316} Barker 1984, 100.
\textsuperscript{317} Aristophanes, Clouds 331-333.
\textsuperscript{318} Aristophanes, Birds 1373-1409.
\textsuperscript{319} Barker 1984, 111f.
\textsuperscript{320} Aristophanes, Frogs 1300-1305. The ostraka are an instrument like a castanet, associated with whores and mystery cults, mainly women’s rites; Barker 1984, 115.
After a long competition, Dionysos decides that the one who proves best advisor on political and moral matters for Athens will be the one who follows him back. However, Dionysos just takes “the one that his soul desires”, which is Aeschylus, while Sophocles is left with the throne in Hades.

5.2 The vase paintings
The previous chapters gave an account of vase paintings depicting mythological musicians, youths learning to play music, amateur musicians at the symposion, as well as women playing music in various contexts. This chapter concentrates on the public performances of amateur and professional musicians in the vase paintings during the fifth century. The changes in the iconography most likely reflect the changes in the society that concern the literary sources.

The musical contests
During the sixth century, apart from representations of Heracles and Apollo as kitharoidoi (Fig. 39), usually depicted on a bema performing, mortals are seen performing in front of other men, probably high class Athenians. An amphora depicts a mortal on a bema playing kithara, dressed in rich garments; the two men listening are holding staffs and wearing beautiful clothes, evidence of their high social status. It is likely that in these times the audience of the musical contests is mainly the Athenian elite. They are emphasized as much as the musicians performing on these vases. The musicians are also probably Athenians, since it is not until the fifth century that musicians came from other cities as well.

In the vase imagery of the fifth century, when the musical contests become Panhellenic, there is more focus on the individuality and professionalism of the competing musicians and less emphasis on the elite audience and on gods and goddesses as musicians. The scenes of Apollo as a kitharoidos, frequent in the beginning of the fifth century, start to show the god without holding the kithara,

---

321 Aristophanes, Frogs 1419-21.
322 Aristophanes, Frogs 1468.
323 Aristophanes, Frogs 1515-23.
324 Even Athena is seen in one painting, playing the aulos beside Heracles who plays the kithara, on a vase from a private collection in Germany; Bundrick 2005, 161.
326 See Bundrick 2005, fig. 96, amphora by the Andokides Painter from c. 530-520 BC, in Paris, Musée de Louvre (G 1).
327 Bundrick 2005, 164.
328 Bundrick 2005, 164.
although he is still represented with kitharoidoi.\textsuperscript{329} Although aulos players have not disappeared from the iconography, the kitharoidoi seem to have the highest status among professional musicians, even in the paintings. On a vase by the Pan Painter the word \textit{kalos}\textsuperscript{330} is written on the bema, which a very concentrated kithara player is just mounting \textit{(Fig. 37)}. Both aulos and kithara players wear beautifully decorated costumes, contrasting with the standard ones of the sixth and the fifth century images of Apollo (who wears a \textit{chiton} and a \textit{himation}). These costumes are derived from East Greek precedents and show the Athenians’ interest in “Eastern exotica”, but also the fact that many of these professional musicians are actually non-Athenians.\textsuperscript{331}

Some figures in the fifth century paintings are interpreted as judges of the musical contests,\textsuperscript{332} something that might allude to the democratic system of Athens, from the way they were selected.\textsuperscript{333} The aulodic contest becomes more important again in the second half of the fifth century. Musical contests are now represented on a larger variety of vases, which shows that this event is accessible to a wider audience. The representations of events such as contests, theatrical plays, and sacrifices, where the entire citizen body participates, are strongly related to the democratic system, in contrast to the symposion and komos scenes, which are related to the aristocracy.\textsuperscript{334}

Well-known musicians are now included in the vase iconography. There is a vase painting by the so-called Pronomos painter, which represents the aulite Pronomos in a theatrical scene \textit{(Fig. 38)}. It has a very rich iconography and the aulite is sitting in a central position with the inscription ‘Pronomos’ over him. The play-writer is sitting by his side. Dithyrambs seem to be a vase-painting theme as well. Even depictions of theatrical choruses may be recognized, as with a scene of a richly dressed aulites amongst two men clad as birds, dancing \textit{(Fig. 41)}. It has been

\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{329} Wilson 2004, 284.
\item\textsuperscript{330} According to Bundrick the word \textit{kalos} "proclaims his fame and talent, almost transforming him into a statue"; Bundrick 2005, 165.
\item\textsuperscript{331} Bundrick 2005, 166.
\item\textsuperscript{332} For example see Bundrick 2005 fig. 99, calyx krater in the manner of the Peleus Painter with victorious kithara player, c. 430–420 BC, in London, The British Museum (E 460).
\item\textsuperscript{333} It is not totally clear how the judges of the musical contests were selected, but it seems to have been done democratically, by lot; Bundrick 2005, 168f.
\item\textsuperscript{334} Bundrick 2005, 170.
\end{itemize}
suggested that it is a representation of Aristophanes’ *Birds*. However, the quantity of theatre and dithyramb scenes is not even close to that of musical contests. 

Just as the comedies of Pherecrates and Aristophanes satirize virtuosi, the same may be seen on a few vases. On a bell-krater there is a depiction of satyrs dressed as kitharodoi, which they are probably mocking. The philosophers and other conservatives also direct criticisms towards the virtuosi musicians, as mentioned above. However, the vase paintings show an increasingly large interest in the individual star performers, instead of focusing on the amateur elite musicians, something that may allude to the fact that a big part of the population actually enjoys these performances, which have become an essential element of the Athenian democracy.

At the end of the fifth century BC remarkable changes take place in the iconography. Most of the musical scenes almost disappear from the vase imagery. Bundrick believes it has to do with the change in the metaphoric associations mousike held for the Athenians. From being a symbol of aristocratic status, mousike had become a symbol of democracy, of joining the whole city with its festivals and contests. But towards the end of the century the Athenian society had changed and “the communal-minded imagery of fifth-century Athens was replaced with an iconography of escapism and individuality, of personal concerns rather than civic”, where “the old ideas of mousike as the harmonia of the city had no place and found no performance”.

---

335 Bundrick 2005, 176.
337 See Bundrick 2005 fig.17, bell krater by Polion from c. 420 BC, in New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art; Fletcher Fund, 1925 (25.78.96).
339 Bundrick 2005, 201.
6. DISCUSSION

6.1 Reactions to music

It is quite apparent that music plays an essential role in the life of the Athenians, at happy and sad times, at religious rituals and at festivals, at parties of drunken men or frenzied women, as well as in everyday life, in the form of work songs and lullabies. This is seen both in the literary sources and the vase imagery. The discussion of this paper concentrates on the perception of and reactions to music, and how they are represented in the vase paintings and the literature. Both mythological scenes and those that are believed to represent mortal people are included in the vase paintings examined. What is important in this case is not so much to get the actual picture of how music is used in reality during this period, since it is impossible to know for sure, but more to discern the attitudes towards music; this is why mythological scenes are included in the study. Myth is a way of presenting the world and one’s position in it. In particular when abstract ideas and values are being represented, there is no other way of expressing them in painting, than with symbols, myths, and personifications. The study will be restricted to vase paintings of the fifth century, which has been the period of interest in this essay.

Before the concept of music’s ethical force becomes a philosophical subject, it is expressed in myths and used in religious cults, medicine, and ceremonies. The myths usually take up themes as the immoderate use of music, the compulsiveness of human nature in responding to the power of music, and the effects of music on humans and nature. Typical examples are the stories of Odysseus and the Sirens, Arion fascinating the dolphins, Amphion using music to move stones, and Orpheus enchanting nature and the humankind with his lyra. Music in all these myths has an immense power that no one and nothing can withstand; it has a spellbinding effect. Another quality of music is that it can lead to ecstasy, mainly in orgiastic cults, such as that of Dionysus and Cybele. According to Aristotle this kind of music and dancing has the benefit of purification and catharsis. With ecstatic dance and music one can be cured when suffering mental illness, as stated in Plato’s Laws, where he describes

---

340 Dowden 1992, 158.
341 Aristotle, Politics 1341a.
how the Bacchants are calmed from their frenzy. It is usually wind and percussion instruments that have this effect on people.

Seebass is of the opinion that, although there are many scenes representing music in general, very few of them actually visualize the power of music. He points out that the power of music is celebrated in myths but not seen as much in the images. In this essay it is suggested that among the vase paintings representing music, there are very few in which the effects of music and how people respond to it are not obvious.

Music is hardly ever a neutral element in the paintings. The presence of musical instruments, especially when being played, indicates a charged atmosphere, where everyone present is influenced by the sound of them: music can soothe and calm, it can entertain, excite, purify, heal, and much more, and all these effects are visualized in the vase paintings. Seebass searches for representations of the myths that directly speak of how music affects the soul. This chapter demonstrates how most scenes representing music display the relation of music to ethos and the soul, directly or indirectly.

Even though the debate concerning the influence of music is held mainly among the philosophers and musical theoreticians, the vase painters create scenes in which the effects of music are apparent. Whether they and their customers are conscious of the effects of music in the same way as the philosophers, cannot be known for sure, since there are no written sources by them. The vase painters are not even necessarily Athenians; they are often non-Greeks or slaves. It is possible that the Athenian citizens at least, are a lot more interested and informed about the philosophical and musical debates than most people are nowadays. First of all, music seems to play a more important role in the Athenians’ lives than it does in the life of the average person today, in which it aims mainly at entertainment. Secondly, these debates take place openly in the agora, and are presented in the theatre, where all citizens are present. As Pericles says about the Athenian citizens:

>You will find united in the same persons an interest at once in private and in public affairs, and in others of us who give attention chiefly to business, you will find no lack of insight into political matters.

---

343 Lippman 1964, 45f.  
344 Seebass 1995, 18.  
345 Price 1999, 12.  
346 Thucydides 2.40.1.
The difference between the people and the philosophers must be the fact that a large part of the population is open for the new ideas in music, while the philosophers are more critical and afraid of the dangers that will follow this lawlessness in music.

6.1.1 The effects of music

The calming and enchanting effect of music

The chapter about ethos treated a group of scenes where the enchanting power of music is very obvious, namely the representations of the mythical musician Orpheus. A good example is the column crater in Berlin, by the so-called Orpheus Painter, with an emotional scene of Orpheus as a musician, sitting on a rock and playing his lyra (Fig. 6). Four men standing around him are all enchanted by his music. One of them has his eyes closed in an expression of pure pleasure and enjoyment. A second is leaning on the first man’s shoulder, eyes staring into space; they both seem lost in the music. The two men on the other side of the Orpheus are watching him intensely. The scene is well balanced and harmonious, referring to the calming effect of music on the souls of the listeners. Orpheus’ ethos is reflected in his serenity and in the instrument he is playing, a chelys lyra, symbol of status and education.

The scenes of Orpheus’ death on the other hand, where he is about to be killed by the Thracian women, show how music is able to cause rage, in contrast to the calm scenes discussed above (Fig. 5). The postures of the depicted figures allude to violence and anger, Orpheus is fearful and protecting himself with his lyra.

The ethos of music and the danger of immoderate use of it are themes of great importance in Plato’s dialogues, and have already been discussed extensively in this essay. Correct education, strict rules, and protection of the traditional music and arts, are his measures in order to create the ideal State. These ideas are reflected not only in the Orpheus scenes, but also in other mythological representations, as those of Marsyas, the aulete competing against Apollo (Fig. 8, 9, 10), and Thamyris, that is punished for challenging the Muses (Fig. 7), as well as in the school scenes, where correct music on the lyra is taught to boys (Fig. 12, 13, 14).

In mythological scenes of Apollo and the Muses the atmosphere is calm and harmonious (Fig. 27, 28, 29, 39). The listeners seem to be once again concentrated

---

347 For example see LIMC s.v Mousai 12, 19.
on the music, as is the one playing it. One gets a feeling of piety and respect for the
musician, and the concepts of harmonia and sophrosyne describe the scene well.
Seebass expresses it as following: "The serious, positive mood that strikes the
onlooker is the result of a visualization of musical eukosmia and eunomia through
gracefulness, order, and a balanced sophisticated distribution of pictorial elements".348

Plato prefers the music of Apollo than that of Dionysos or Marsyas.349 Already
in Pindar Apollo’s lawful and correct music is praised:

'Tis Apollo that alloteth to men and to women remedies for sore
diseases. 'Twas he that gave the cithern, and bestoweth the Muse on
whomsoever he will, bringing into the heart the love of law
(eunomian) that hateth strife.350

Scenes representing female musicians in a domestic setting, most likely mortal
women entertaining themselves, have been mentioned earlier in this essay.351 A good
example of the visualization of the enchanting effect of music is Fig. 30, where one
woman is leaning on the other’s shoulder, standing in front of and staring at a third
woman playing a barbiton: they seem to be totally captivated by the music. They are
listening very focused and seem to be enjoying the performance. Sappho is shown in
similar scenes with her girlfriends.352 Her poems are usually erotic, so it might be
possible to discern an erotic mood in these paintings, in which the women seem very
intimate. These scenes can be compared to the Orpheus scenes in the way they
represent the calmness, harmony, and pleasure in the music.

Concerning women playing music in their homes, there is one reference in
Plato’s Symposium,353 in which he sends the flute girl into the gynaikon, the women’s
quarters, to entertain them. He does not however mention the women themselves
playing music. Plato does insist that women should be (not that they are) educated in
exactly the same way as the men, in music and in gymnastics.

The exciting effect of music

The bacchic scenes show a totally different effect of music on people (Fig. 1, 2, 3). In
the case of Orpheus the music is by a lyre. In this case the music is by aulos, barbiton,

349 Plato, Republic 399e.
350 Pindar, Pythian 5.60-7.
351 See p. 40f. in this essay.
352 See Seebass fig. 20, Athens, National Archaeological Museum, 1260, ARV 1060.145.
353 Plato, Symposium 176e.
and percussion instruments. The aulos is known for its strange effects on people’s behavior, with its ability of imitating sounds and the high pitch it can reach. In addition, the loudness and especially the rhythmic steady beat that percussion instruments can produce are important elements in building up an ecstatic ambience. The women in these scenes seem influenced by the music, and are dancing so vividly that the moves of their bodies appear uncontrolled. The wide-open arms to the side and the head tipped back are indicative gestures of ecstatic mood. Music in these scenes is a way of coming closer to god and to nature, away from society and civilization, while it frees the women from everyday burdens. There are parallels of this frenzied dancing with flinging of the head even today, for example in African tribes and in South America, especially in cases where the people are struck by poverty or diseases. Modern psychologists often interpret it as a need to try and free the spirit from the body and unite it with the deity, liberating it from everyday sufferings. This type of music with a steady repetitive beat can even be compared to modern rave parties, where people dance intensely to rhythmic music, bringing themselves into an ecstatic mood.

Plato believes that the frenzied bacchic women can be healed with ecstatic music and dancing, as a sort of catharsis, in the same way that babies can be soothed and calmed with singing and rocking. Here Plato is referring to the healing and calming power of music. He explains it in the following way: both the Bacchants and the children have an emotion of fear, caused by a poor condition of the soul. So when one applies external agitation (music and movement in this case), it overshadows the fear, bringing calmness and peace to the soul. It helps the children sleep, and brings the Bacchants to a stable state of mind, by dancing to the aulos, and with the help of the gods they are worshipping. Lippman points out that these orgiastic rituals are similar to "the epileptic fits of the shaman, the dancing epidemics of the Middle Ages, the seventeenth century outbreaks of tarantism, or the uncontrollable jerking of American revivalist meeting". He notes the importance of religion in every case of orgiastic rites.

In the symposion scenes a variety of reactions may be discerned. When the men are seen playing music themselves, they are often singing about their love for

---

354 Lawler 1964b, 96.
355 Plato, Laws 790d-e.
356 Plato, Laws 790e-791b.
357 Lippman 1964, 46.
some other man or boy (Fig. 18, 19, 21). Their pose is indicative of immense pleasure or even ecstasy, with the head tipped back and/or the hand lifted towards it. The listeners are sometimes oblivious of their surroundings, enchanted by and focusing only on the music. But it is not only the symposiasts that are depicted; they are often accompanied by the professional female musicians and dancing girls (Fig. 4, 23, 26). The atmosphere becomes erotic and this is represented with indicative poses too.

Dancing is often shown in komos scenes,358 indicating the enthusiastic rhythm of the music and the happiness or drunkenness of the participators (Fig. 23). Music is sometimes seen as an erotic symbol: an interesting metaphor of this is Fig. 26, where a hetaera places an aulos in front of a symposiast’s erected penis.

The symposion is for Plato a place where the younger are to be educated by the elders with discussion and song. He allows moderate drinking of wine by the ones that are older, so that they can have the courage to dance and sing in order to pass on their important knowledge and wisdom from life-experience to the younger.359 He offers a very idealized picture of the symposion, without the drunkenness, sexual orgies, and indecent behavior that probably are quite frequent (Fig. 25). He does mention at some point that if there is a leader at the symposion they might avoid becoming as drunk as usual and stay away from fights.360

The reason why Plato presents an idealized picture of the symposion has to do with the fact that he is not describing reality; he is giving an account of how things should be ideally, according to him. Even when he says he is describing how things are in his times, he exaggerates and idealizes the past. In the vase paintings there is drunkenness, erotic games, dancing girls, as well as male and female professional musicians, all of which are indirectly criticized by Plato and Aristotle.

The pedagogical use of music

Even school scenes might allude to the power of music over people. First of all, the ambience in these scenes is strict and serious, with both teachers and students fully concentrated on playing music or singing. In addition, these scenes refer to the importance given to music in education, and bring Plato’s ideas to mind: musical

---

358 For example see Bundrick 2005 fig. 11, exterior of a cup by the Foundry Painter from c. 480 BC, at the Toledo Museum of Art, purchased with funds from the Libbey Endowment, Gift of Edward Drummond Libbey (1964.126).
359 Plato, Laws 666a-d.
360 Plato, Laws 671a-e.
education is intended to form citizens with a good ethos, and that in its turn will contribute to the wellbeing of the \textit{polis}. On the Douris cup the students are paying attention to their teachers and to their own music playing. A boy playing the lyra seems absorbed by the music, for his eyes are just staring into space \textit{(Fig. 12, 13)}. In another painting, a paidagogos is leaning on his stick to listen carefully \textit{(Fig. 14)}. These school scenes may be said to visualize the idea of music’s power in the education of the young, and thus its contribution to the welfare of the city.

From the early fifth century there are scenes of musical performances on the bema, with aristocrats playing the lyra or kithara: the instrument is a symbol of their high status, while their pose and garments inspire respect \textit{(Fig. 37)}. Some have their heads tipped back while playing, a posture that possibly shows how the musician is affected by the music. One can compare these scenes with Plato’s ideal of musical contests between the citizens, where the winner will be the one with the best ethical teachings in his song.

Music is connected with athletic competitions and military marches as well. In the vase paintings these activities are often accompanied by the aulos or the salpinx. In the athletic scenes an auletes playing music is very frequent \textit{(Fig. 16, 17)}, in contrast to Plato’s view of the aulos as a less manly instrument producing strange effects on people. Maybe it is exactly this stimulating effect of the instrument that is meant in these paintings. The music helps the athlete to keep the rhythm, encourages and motivates him. Herodotos talks of the “marching to the sound of pipes and harps and flutes bass and treble”. \textsuperscript{361} The importance of good rhythm in battle, especially in the formation of the hoplites, is infused into the citizens already with the practicing of war dances, as the pyrrhic. \textsuperscript{362} Even Plato points out that

\begin{quote}
We should live out our lives playing at certain pastimes – sacrificing, singing and dancing – so as to be able to win Heaven’s favour and to repel our foes and vanquish them in fight.\textsuperscript{363}
\end{quote}

Victory songs, such as Pindar’s epinicia, are also part of the athletic competitions: they praise the winner and inspire others to similar deeds. These songs become very important and prestigious, since music’s goal is changing; from it being the inspiration of bravery on the battlefield, music now ”aimed at cultivation for a

\textsuperscript{361} Herodotos 1.17.
\textsuperscript{362} Wallace 2004, 262.
\textsuperscript{363} Plato, \textit{Laws} 803e.
leisured way of life compound of sport and intellectual pleasures, with political activity as the typical serious pursuit”.

Dr. Costas Karageorghis, a reader in sport psychology, has studied how listening to music while exercising can improve one’s training results. Music works as a motivator, as well as a distraction from negative feelings, as fatigue. The results of this study show that if one listens to music one enjoys, with a moderate to fast tempo, depending on the type of exercise, and encouraging lyrics, exercise endurance increases by up to 20%. It can be assumed that in the ancient world music is used during athletics and in battle for the same reason.

Music in religion and death

In religious scenes music is an accompaniment to the rituals, as the procession and the sacrifice (Fig. 42). Although there is not much reaction by the people pictured, since they concentrate on the ritual, it is obvious that music is very important for the correct execution of a religious rite. There is almost always an aulos player present in these scenes. As Plato says, the prayers to the gods should be composed correctly; it can be very dangerous if the poets ask for the wrong things from the gods. Hence mousike is a way of communicating with the gods, holding a very important position in rituals, both in the paintings and in Plato. Herodotos considers it worth mentioning if an auletes is absent from a sacrifice, so his presence is probably taken for granted by the the Greeks.

In the white-ground lykethoi there is a connection of music, or better lack of music, to grief (Fig. 29, 32, 33). The emptiness in the white background may refer to silence and grief from the loss of a beloved one. Seebass notes the emotional intensity, the simplicity, and the intimacy of these scenes. This brings Aeschylus to mind, when he describes war as “foe to the dance and lute, parent of tears”. In his Eumenides, Athena says:
And in their dealings with mankind, visibly, perfectly, they (the Erinyes) work their will, unto some giving song, unto others a life bedimmed by tears.  

Music in the case of representations of the dead may even be interpreted as a way of communication between the two worlds, of the living and the deceased, as it is between mortals and gods. This type of communication between two separate worlds with the aid of music has been attested in certain African tribes, in which music is a means of contacting dead ancestors.

*The multifunctional aulos*

There are many vase paintings in which the aulos is being played, showing the varying attitudes towards the instrument. On the one hand it is present in Dionysian scenes, where satyrs play it and it represents the lack of control, the ecstasy, and the illogical (Fig. 1). In symposion scenes the aulos is often part of creating an erotic atmosphere and even seen as an erotic symbol (Fig. 4, 26). However, it is even depicted in scenes of Apollo and the Muses, something that comes in contrast with the philosophical sources, which want Apollo and the Muses playing the lyra (Fig. 27, 28, 40). Additionally, the auletes Pronomos is pictured in the center of a vase painting, showing the respect he had gained with his talent (Fig. 38). Thus, the aulos scenes both agree and contradict the literary sources.

Plato idealizes the past when saying that the lyra was considered the only worthy instrument of education, since even in early fifth century vase paintings there are school scenes where both the lyra and the aulos are being taught (Fig. 13). Besides, Aristotle says that his forefathers played the aulos a lot and had it in their educational program (although he does make sure to point out that they realized it was of no good). For Aristotle the aulos is only good for catharsis and not for education. It is too dangerous to be played by the citizens and should only be played by professionals. The anecdote of Alcibiades rejecting the aulos has been taken up earlier in this essay.

---

370 Danfulani 1996, 36f.
371 For example see *LIMC* s.v. Mousai 44b, s.v Apollo 696b. There is even a scene in which Apollo is pictured with a kithara, and the four Muses are holding krotala, in *LIMC* s.v Mousai 36b.
372 See p. 18 in this essay.
373 Aristotle, *Politics* 1341a.
374 See p. 18 in this essay.
Plato is concerned about the orgiastic and hypnotic power of music. The passage where he speaks of the calming music of the aulos in the case of the Bacchants was mentioned above.\textsuperscript{375} In the \textit{Republic} he bans the aulos from his ideal city. He says that one should prefer Apollo and his instruments to Marsyas and his instruments.\textsuperscript{376}

In the \textit{Symposion} however, an admiration as well as fear of the aulos and its effects can actually be discerned: Socrates’ way of enchanting people with words is compared to the enchanting music of the aulos-player Marsyas.\textsuperscript{377} Plato speaks of Marsyas in quite a different tone, admiring his talent:

\begin{quote}
So that if anyone, whether a fine flute-player or paltry flute-girl, can but flute his (Marsyas’) tunes, they have no equal for exciting a ravishment, and will indicate by the divinity that it is in them who are apt recipients of the deities and their sanctifications.\textsuperscript{378}
\end{quote}

It must be emphasized that the aulos plays a very important role in cult rituals and religious festivals, especially in dramatic contests. In vase scenes with sacrificial processions and sacrifices the aulos is almost always present (Fig. 42),\textsuperscript{379} as is the auletes during a theatrical play (Fig. 38, 41). Even at the symposion, the spondeion and the paean are sung to the accompaniment of the aulos, something that proves that the instrument has a serious and ritualistic side to it as well.\textsuperscript{380}

6.1.2 \textit{Comparison of the sources}

From the investigation of the two types of sources in the previous chapters, and the above study of reactions to music, it is possible to draw a few conclusions on the type of information each source provides. In the case of the vase paintings, even though their use is still connected with the upper class in the fifth century, since many of the vessels are created for example for the aristocratic symposion,\textsuperscript{381} they seem to reflect the attitudes of a large group of people; they could be called the ‘popular culture’ of the time. They reveal the values, ideals, and attitudes of the Athenian citizens to whom they belong. The vase paintings illustrate the existence of a very rich music life that is not always apparent in the literary sources.

\textsuperscript{375} See p. 63 in this essay.
\textsuperscript{376} Plato, \textit{Republic} 399e.
\textsuperscript{377} Plato, \textit{Symposium} 215b-216b.
\textsuperscript{378} Plato, \textit{Symposium} 215c.
\textsuperscript{379} Nordquist 1990, 145f.
\textsuperscript{380} Bundrick 2005, 81.
\textsuperscript{381} Price 1999, 12.
The written sources on the other hand, although of great importance when studying the past, offer a one-sided story. They reveal the opinions of their (male) authors only: Plato comes from the aristocratic class and has aristocratic ideas. He shows his dislike of the new ways of entertainment at “the wine parties of the common market-folk” through Socrates in Protagoras. Aristophanes complains about the young people’s disregard of old-fashioned songs and symphonic customs in his Clouds. Unfortunately the written sources from the fifth century concerning music and its use are limited. The philosophers who are not even contemporary, present only their own opinions and criticisms. They strive to find the best for society, and only indirectly, through their criticisms, do they provide information on the real situation. Aristophanes, though a comedian, probably offers more direct information, since his comedies include open criticisms of or satires on his contemporaries and the musical reality of the time. Besides, theatrical plays are directed to a more general public than the philosophical treatises.

However, the vase paintings cannot be viewed as representations of reality either. Painting is art, and that means it includes artistic elements controlling the degree of truth in the representations; the aesthetic pleasure is usually prioritized before a realistic representation, while it is not rare to encounter idealism, symbolism, and anachronisms. Thus, the information about what the musical instruments look like or when, where, and by whom music is played is not always accurate.

On the other hand, the pottery from this period is plentiful and varied. Besides, all kinds of art are products of the society in which they are created, and are undoubtedly influenced by and often a representation of it in one way or another. The vase paintings provide quite a broad picture, including men, women, and children, higher and lower classes, mythological and historical figures, gods and mortals. By studying the vases as a whole, through time and in thematic groups, there is a lot to learn from them; they offer a more complete and varied story than the literary sources. One can discern broader tendencies, repetitions, similarities, changes, and how themes become more or less popular through time in the imagery; all this may in fact offer some of the desirable information.

In addition, the vases are contemporary to the period they represent. The literary sources on the other hand, are in their majority from a later period. Even in the

382 Plato, Protagoras 347c-d.
383 Aristophanes, Clouds 1353-79.
case of Plato and Aristotle, their works are written decades after the time they
describe. Both are subjective and idealistic. Plato and Aristotle, as well as most others
that criticize the New Music, have created an idealized and timeless musical past, in
which music is seen as manly, dignified, and autochthonous, while the New
Musicians are seen as effeminate, vulgar, and bringing influences that are not Greek,
thus degrading music and the Athenian society as a whole.

One of the advantages of literary sources is certainly the fact that they can
express abstract ideas, ideals, and values, such as ‘democracy’, ‘hubris’, and ‘ethos’
for example, with the help of words. This cannot be done in the visual arts; in this
case the artists use symbols, personifications, and myths in order to express and
visualize these, which today can create difficulties in the interpretation.

In general, the two types of sources basically confirm each other, although
there are some contradictions. They are two different types of sources with entirely
different purposes, and the information from them depends precisely on their purpose.
In the case of Plato, a philosopher attempts to create an ideal State, seeking the best
way of ruling it: education of the citizens and strict censorship of anything that harms
their characters is prioritized. His criticism of the actual situation in the Athenian
society can be distinguished and offer indirect information. In the case of the vase
paintings, the aesthetic pleasure decides over the representation. The themes that are
depicted are in one way or another connected to reality, and thus provide information
on the musical life of the time. The way the sources are interpreted is crucial in both
cases, since there is hardly any direct information in either of them. Nevertheless, the
combination of two different types of sources has the advantage of allowing the
information to be crosschecked and offering a more complete picture of reality.

6.2 “Good” and “bad” music

It is interesting to compare Plato’s fear of New Music and what he calls the
‘degeneration of music’ in general, with twentieth century warnings against jazz,
rock’n’roll, twist, rock, disco, punk, rave, rap, and probably anything else that is new
and threatening for the conservative members of a society. It is worth quoting what
the Music Journal said about teenagers listening to rock’n’roll, in the 1950s, because
it is just as if reading Plato:

Definitely influenced in their lawlessness by this throwback to jungle
rhythms. Either it actually stirs them to orgies of sex and violence (as
its model did for the savages themselves), or they use it as an excuse
for the removal of all inhibitions and the complete disregard of conven- tions of decency… (rock’n’roll) has proved itself definitely a menace to youthful morals and an incitement to juvenile delinquency. There is no point in soft-pedalling these facts any longer. The daily papers provide sufficient proof of their existence… It is entirely correct to say that every proved delinquent has been definitely influenced by rock’n’roll.\footnote{As quoted in Frith 2004, 23; quoted from Martin & Seagrove 1988, 53.}

“Bad music” is of course a very subjective definition; what is seen as “bad music” depends on who is criticizing it and on the historical and social context of it. Washburne & Derno believe that music, especially popular music, should not only be judged by aesthetic criteria. Many other criteria must be taken in account when one is about to value music, including the status of the performer and the listener (class, ethnicity, gender), the politicized message of the song, as well as the culture in which the music is produced and in which it is listened.\footnote{Washburne & Derno 2004, 5f.}

As the Athenian society and the entire Greek world undergoes vast changes during the fifth century BC, especially in the political and economic spheres, it is natural that the effects are felt in other areas as well, from public festivals and competitions, to philosophical thought, art, and private life. Music is one of the spheres wherein these changes are apparent, as seen in the sources, which tell of the expansion of musical competitions, the participation of musicians from all over the Greek world, and the innovations made in music.

Plato believes that changes in music cause changes in the society.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Republic} 424c.} He thinks that by disobeying the laws of music one disrupts the harmony of the polis. The traditional musical forms are given by the gods and should not be changed.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Laws} 657b-c.} Music, according to Plato, is good depending to how close it is to the truth. It should not be judged by the pleasure it gives, but by how correct it is.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Laws} 657d-659a.} The artists of the New Music in contrast, believe that music has no standard of correctness; good music is what satisfies the listener.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Laws} 700a-701a.} Plato is afraid that once the young people notice that disobedience is allowed, they will start disobeying their rulers, their elders, and then the laws of the state. In the end they will not even fear the gods. The young themselves, having grown up used to change will end up changing the laws of the
state, which will be disastrous according to Plato.\footnote{Plato, \textit{Laws} 700d-701b.} However, it appears more likely that music and the society are in constant interaction. Musical education becomes accessible to a larger part of the population when democracy is established, while the musical competitions become panhellenic, and virtuosi musicians come to Athens from all over the Greek world with their innovations. It seems like the society and the changes in it influence music more than music could ever influence society.

It is apparent that the transformations in music during the second half of the fifth century are unlike any earlier, both in the speed that they occur and in their range. Changes are made on musical instruments, as the adding of strings, allowing music to become more complex with innovations in melodies and rhythms, at the same time as professionalism increases. The competitive ambience triggers the musicians to try out new ways of playing to impress the public, and many become virtuosi. It is possible that there is less order in public gatherings, given that with the democratic system they become open to a much larger crowd, something that worries the aristocratic class.

The critics of New Music seem to connect it to anything that is not good in democracy during the fifth century. The elite can no longer claim their superiority in musical knowledge (one of their status symbols being good musical education) since they are compared to the virtuosi professionals. This specialization and professionalism is not only discerned in music. Already in the sixth century vase painters, and later on sculptors, start signing their work.\footnote{For more information on signatures and inscriptions on the vases, see Robertson 1992, 3-5, 45f, 186; Morris 2006, 188.} From the fifth century onwards the names of musicians from musical, dramatic, or dithyrambic competitions, appear in texts, vase paintings, and inscriptions.\footnote{See n. 305 in this essay.} Some examples are the auletes Antioxos from the beginning of the fifth century, pictured on a vase;\footnote{Stefanis 1988, 211a.} the famous auletes Pronomos from the fifth century, who is named in many sources and depicted on a vase painting;\footnote{Stefanis 1988, 2149.} the kitharodos Herakleitos Tarantinos who participated in the wedding celebrations of Alexander the Great in Sousa;\footnote{Stefanis 1988, 1093.} and the kitharistes/kitharodos Strattonikos Athenaios, from the first half of the fourth century,
named in various sources.\textsuperscript{396} It is a time when specialization in a certain area starts taking the place of the general knowledge one had earlier.

The elite criticizes the New Music as immoral and the musicians as degraded, effeminate, and unreasonable. Professionals are accused for playing for payment and to please the masses. Csapo is of the opinion that the real reason professionalism is disliked by the aristocratic class, is the fact that the elite can no longer claim cultural superiority, since the professionals often come from lower classes. As has already been pointed out, the musical past that the critics of New Music speak of is an idealized creation. It is a utopia of how music used to and should be, by idealizing music of the past and in some cases the music of Sparta, Crete, and Egypt. The simplicity and order (\textit{haplotes} and \textit{eutaxia} or \textit{eukosmia}) that is said to have characterized traditional music are, according to Csapo, terms invented by the critics of New Music. The aristocrats identify themselves with these ideals, while the demos is characterized by the opposites, especially ‘lack of order’ (\textit{ataxia}).\textsuperscript{397} Csapo’s opinion is that the negative attitude of the traditional elite towards these changes derives from the division of Athens at the time, into ‘Old Oligarchs’ and ‘New Democrats’; a polarization that is reflected in debates concerning more than just changes in music.\textsuperscript{398}

Plato, an aristocrat, gives the impression of being more concerned about the consequences of the transition of the power into the hands of the ‘vulgar’ demos and less about the actual loss of power his class suffered in the fifth century. He investigates ways of bringing back the ethos and virtue of the citizens. It is interesting how Plato admires the music of Egypt, Crete, and Sparta. The author admires Sparta for its aristocratic system as well, something that he believes to be of great importance in keeping the state in order. It is doubtful, however, that Plato had heard Spartan and Cretan music at all, let alone Egyptian. Plato connects the decline of the Athenian society, as he sees it, with the lack of order in music. Sparta manages to defeat Athens in the Peloponnesian war, and it is possible that Plato sees Spartan military music as one of the reasons for Sparta’s superiority, since discipline is one of its main characteristics.\textsuperscript{399}

\textsuperscript{396} Stefanis 1988, 2310.
\textsuperscript{397} Csapo 2004, 236-238.
\textsuperscript{398} Csapo 2004, 246.
\textsuperscript{399} About Sparta’s marching song, the embaterion, see Csapo 2004, 241f.
6.3 Music in real life

The most reliable information on ancient Greek music comes from the papyri or inscriptions containing musical notations. This music is mostly what would today be called religious, consisting of hymns to the gods, while there are a few fragments of songs from theatrical plays. However, putting together the information from literary sources and vase paintings, and making a few speculations on the types of music that might be left out of the sources, the picture of the musical reality might become more complete.

Judging from both the literary sources and the vase paintings, music is certainly played at religious festivals, in which dramatic and dithyrambic competitions, large processions, dances, sacrifices, and more, are included and accompanied by instrumental music and singing. It is apparent from the sources that music is an essential part of the symposion: apart from the spondeion and the paean, the guests sing the skolia to the accompaniment of the lyra, while later in the fifth century the musical entertainment is taken over by professional musicians. Private ceremonies, as weddings (where the hymeneal is sung), athletic victories (when the epinicia are sung), and funerals, also include music. These are the most commonly mentioned events where music is played.

However, judging from fragmentary information in the sources studied, music seems to be present in many more occasions in the Athenians’ lives. It is most likely there exist cradlesongs and lullabies, some kind of nursery rhymes, and other children’s songs, which are not mentioned much in any of the sources, but probably occur in most households with small children. Plato does mention songs sung by the nurses to help babies sleep and calm down, but does not go into detail. He even gives instructions on how the games of small children should be organized; they seem to consist mainly of dancing and singing. In addition, there are rituals that include dancing and singing by young children. Good examples are the various transition rituals helping girls become women and boys become men, but there is not much information about the music in either source. The ‘bear-ritual’ (arkteia) in honor of

---

400 As for example the transcriptions from Euripides’ plays *Orestes* and *Iphigeneia in Aulis*; West 1992, 284-286. For other examples of musical notation see Anderson 1994, 210-227; West 1992, 283-326.

401 See description of Bacchic scenes p. 62f. in this essay.

402 See p. 28f. in this essay.
Artemis at Braurona is one of them, in which the girls dress up as bears and participate in a procession, a race, and a dance.\textsuperscript{403}

Working songs are another kind of music largely neglected by the sources. They are mentioned in Aristophanes’ \textit{Frogs}, where the chorus sings to help Dionysos keep the rhythm while rowing the boat.\textsuperscript{404} These songs are probably sung during many types of activities where synchronizing and a good tempo are needed. Unfortunately only speculations can be made on the nature and use of this music.

Plato’s \textit{Symposium} shows that women can entertain themselves with music, when Socrates sends away the professional auletria into the women’s quarters.\textsuperscript{405} There are even representations of women playing music in domestic settings in the vase paintings. Nevertheless, it is still uncertain if female Athenian citizens play music themselves, and if they do, what this music sounds like.

Most likely there is music to all kinds of merry-making and dancing, simple songs for private celebrations in everyday life, which are not mentioned at all. It is apparent that certain areas receive less attention from research than others. One of them is the role of music in private life and the family; another is music in the lower classes of the society. The reason seems to be the limited information in the ancient sources, which do not consider these types of music worth noting. The role of music in lower class families may be very different than in the higher classes. An example is that, since the poorer families can probably not afford nurses, it is the mother’s duty to sing the lullabies to the baby and teach the child it’s first songs, so music might play an important role in forming a tighter bond between them. In addition, in these families the members have to work harder, so they probably engage more often in the so-called working songs, which are basically neglected both by the ancient sources and the modern scholars. Finally, the study of the relation of children to music, in their games or at school, is also worth deeper research.

It is interesting to make a comparison with what is written by scholars about music in modern times, even though there is always a risk of applying one’s own ideas and values anachronistically to a society that existed under totally different circumstances. Today there is a large amount of studies of classical or liturgical music.
for instance, while not much is written about popular music.\textsuperscript{406} It is perhaps a similar situation in ancient Athens, where more attention is given to the 'higher quality' music in the philosophical discussions, than to what the people actually listen to and play themselves. Luckily there are some examples of everyday music from the comedies, and we can get hints of it from the vase paintings. However, it is doubtful that the full picture of the world of music in ancient Athens will be revealed, since so much information is lost or has never been put down on paper.

Carl Dahlhaus’ essays on what he calls “trivial music”, aim at finding the best way of judging this music aesthetically; he tries to find a balance between the aesthetic and other powers that are included in the formation of music, as history, politics, religion, or society. According to Dahlhaus, “low music” exists in all times. Until the eighteenth century there were three main reasons of contempt against it: musically, the performers did not follow the rules; morally, they were indecent; and socially, they came from the lower classes.\textsuperscript{407} He notes that the criticism of trivial music “is often based on the idea of a universal, undivided music”.\textsuperscript{408} The above ideas bring to mind the contempt that emerges in the aristocratic class against the professional musicians of the second half of the fifth century in Athens.

However, this musical debate between “high” and “low” quality music concerns only a very little group of people, while the rest of the society probably finds it irrelevant. This picture is seen in Classical Athens of the fifth and fourth centuries, where the musical debate is going on besides the actual musical reality of the time and the preferences of the people, while the musicians continue making innovations, in spite of the criticism they receive.

6.4 Modern theories concerning the psychological power of music

As mentioned above, the comparison of societies from different times and places should be avoided, since the values and the way of thinking differ depending on the circumstances. Nonetheless, the power of music over human behavior and its ability to move the soul and body are not only debated in antiquity. In 1768, Jean-Jacques Rousseau makes a list of stories representing the power music has in creating

\textsuperscript{406} Lately there has been an increased interest in the study of popular art forms. Some examples are Stahl 2004; Rodel 2004; Ganetz 2008.

\textsuperscript{407} Dalhaus 2004, 336.

\textsuperscript{408} Dalhaus 2004, 350.
civilizing or exciting effects on people, in his *Dictionnaire de Musique*. Around the end of the eighteenth century the Musical Society of Turku or *Musikaliska Sällskapet i Åbo*, becomes the most important forum for discussing this subject, and the belief that music has an affective power is strong. As Sarjala says in the preface to his book *Music, moral, and the body*:

This book rests on the idea that music should not, in the first place, be studied as a rationalistic domain of autonomous forms and structures, but as a domain of magic, a complex net of secret forces and tensions which appear as passions and affects. The power of music has been praised for hundreds and thousands of years; if one ignores it, one not only violates music, but loses insight into the richness and variety of its history.

In Old Norse literature there is a belief that music has magical power, and according to the mode the musician plays he can induce any emotion he wishes to the listener. There is even a certain war song, its purpose being “to incite men’s fighting spirits before a battle”. Many scholars have been interested in studying contemporary uses of music in, amongst others, African and Australian tribes or Brazilian communities. There are certain tribes in Nigeria for example, where music and dance play an important role in the religious life of the people. During special festivals, it is through music they believe they come into contact with their dead ancestors.

In the Afro-Brazilian Macumba community in Salvador, Brazil, the members have been able to communicate and keep their traditions alive through their religious and social rituals and their “deep symbols of music and dance”, regardless of the inhuman treatment they received as slaves of the white. The Portuguese colonists perceived their music and dancing as pure entertainment, while in reality it was a way of communicating and giving energy. Ritual trance is also used in these communities, in order to come in contact with the gods for advice on problems or needs of the members. The mediums, which are priests or priestesses, manage to

---

409 Sarjala 2001, 11.
414 Danfulani 1996, 36f.
come into a state of trance with the help of special rhythms, movements and drum-beating patterns.\textsuperscript{416}

The AMUSE (Appraisal in Music and Emotion) project, organized by Uppsala University, aims at creating a model of psychological mechanisms that will be able to explain and predict people’s responses to music. The results can even be used in the application of music therapy. Patrik Juslin is a member of the above research team and in his thesis concludes that the music performers are able to communicate emotions to listeners with the use of certain cues, as tempo, sound level, articulation, and spectrum, by both the performers and the listeners, as a sort of nonverbal code. This process of communicating emotions can even be improved, according to Juslin, who suggests possible ways for the performers to become better in this procedure.\textsuperscript{417} What Juslin notes, however, is that his studies can be criticized with the argument that, even though the listeners are probably not used to making precise judgments of emotional expressions in music, they are often exposed to it in daily life\textsuperscript{418} and, of course, are already familiar to Western music.

The most recent study on how music communicates emotions is published in March 2009 and chooses another approach. A team led by cognitive scientist Thomas Fritz of the Max Planck Institute for Human Cognitive and Brain Sciences in Leipzig, Germany, studies how the Mafa farmer’s in Cameroon, Africa, interpret various types of music. Two things are noteworthy before giving the results of this experiment: first, the Mafa do not have a separate word for music; music is seen as an important ingredient in their rituals, but never independently. Second, the music of this people only ever expresses joy and happiness. What is important for Fritz is to find a group of people that have never come in contact with Western music before, and the Mafa have not. He tests one group of Mafa people and one group of Germans, giving them various melodies to listen to, and then guess what kind of emotions they express. The results of the study are that music seems to have a universal way of expressing emotions, such as happiness, sadness, and fear. A second result is that melodies that are consonant are more pleasurable to listen to for both groups, while the digital modifications of these melodies into dissonant are not perceived as pleasurable at all.

\textsuperscript{416} Demarinis 1996, 71.
\textsuperscript{417} Juslin 1998, 44.
\textsuperscript{418} Juslin 1998, 45.
This finding provides thus, the first solid evidence for a universal human ability to distinguish basic emotions in music.\textsuperscript{419}

Just as in the scenes of Orpheus, Apollo, and mortals, where the music is enchanting its listeners, and similarly to the literary sources of Classical Athens, modern studies also engage in the understanding of the power of music over the soul and the body. The ritual trance and the ecstatic condition that the Bacchants reach with music and dance is observed in other cultures as well, not only in Africa and South America, but even in the Western world, in the form of rave parties for instance. As mentioned earlier, even the presence of music during athletics and battles, both in the imagery and the literary sources, could be paralleled with modern studies of the usefulness of listening to music while exercising. The intention with mentioning the above studies is to point out that what the philosophers in Classical Athens are concerned about is not something unique. Music has certain universal characteristics that exist in many different cultures. Music is one of the most common ways of communicating emotions, ideas, and values, and the power of music over one’s behavior and feelings is something that will arouse excitement, wonder, and curiosity long into the future, given that after 2500 years it is still a subject of modern research.

\textsuperscript{419} Bower 2009.
7. CONCLUSIONS

As demonstrated in the previous chapters, although the vase paintings may in certain cases contradict the literature, most of the times they confirm and even go beyond the information in the literary sources, giving a more complete picture of the world of music. Nevertheless, both types of sources must be approached critically, since neither of them aim at a realistic description of music and its use in Classical Athens.

Different types of sources have different purposes. Plato is creating an ideal State; Aristophanes and the other comedians criticize society in a humoristic way; and the vase painters are at the service of a large group of people, decorating vases for religious or everyday use, and aiming at an aesthetically pleasant result. The purpose of each source should always be taken into account. A combination of sources, and especially of different types of sources, has the advantage of allowing crosschecking of the information and of offering a broader picture of the past. No single source presents the entire picture of musical life in Athens, but they give evidence of the attitudes and feelings towards music, both its intellectual and emotional side. All sources suggest that music plays an important role in the ancient Greeks’ lives and causes an intense debate.

The extensive reaction towards the New Music during the fifth century BC in Athens is an example of the constant struggle between the conservative and the progressive groups of a society. It is not the first time innovations are made in music: music certainly undergoes changes before the fifth century and continues to do so after it; the New Music is probably not as extreme and dangerous as presented in the sources. Nonetheless, the changes of this specific period are most likely greater than any time before. They are a consequence of the vast changes in the Athenian society of the fifth and fourth centuries, with the establishment of democracy, and the accessibility of music to a much broader audience. New Music becomes associated with a modernity many do not approve of. Music in general is part of the political and social life of Athens and is included in a broader political debate between the extreme democrats and the traditional oligarchs. Plato seems to be trying in his dialogues to bring stability back into the changing society of his time, by reorganizing the musical education of the citizens and censuring the arts.

It seems very likely that, even though the criticisms of New Music gain an important place in theory, they hardly influence the actual practitioners of it. Innovations continue to take place in the world of music, as in every other aspect of
society, despite the disapproval of the traditionalists. “Revolutionists” of the fifth
century, such as Timotheus and Philoxenus, actually become classics in the education
of the youths in later centuries and are played in the competitions of boys and men in
choral singing.\textsuperscript{420} The same pattern of the elder conservatives idealizing the past, and
criticizing and discarding the habits of the young progressive citizens, is recognized in
most societies through time. Another recurring pattern seems to be the division of art
into “good” and “bad”, the “good” representing the preferences of the philosophers
and the experts, and the “bad” the preferences of the people.

The main goal of this paper has been to examine the relation of people to
music and in particular the effects it is believed to have on them. Both the literary
sources and the vase paintings represent the music life in classical Athens as very rich
and acknowledge the influence music has over the human body and soul. The power
of music is recognized long before the first treatises by the philosophers are written,
but it is in the Classical period that it becomes a subject of philosophical investigation
instead of being represented in the form of myths.

The two main areas, according to Plato, in which music exercises power, are
the religious and the educational, areas that are not as independent in Classical Athens
as today. Music’s religious function is obvious in the fact that prayers, sacrifices, and
other religious rituals are accompanied by music. It is a means of coming in contact
with the gods and securing their help and protection. Music’s educational function is
apparent mainly in the belief that it can form a moral example for the citizens. Their
characters will be shaped according to the example of the “musical man” (\textit{aner
mousikos}), and this will secure the welfare of the whole city-state.

The vase paintings offer a much broader picture of the effects of music. They
depict the entertaining, exciting, calming, inspiring, and healing qualities of music,
the expression of emotions and the erotic symbolism, as well as the practical function
of military music. In general, the vase paintings represent the power of music over a
person’s emotions and reactions, while Plato sees music as a means of education,
insuring the welfare of the society. Music in everyday life, the family, and the lower
classes of society, as well as the relation of women and children to music, receive less
attention in general, and are subjects that require further research.

\textsuperscript{420} Polybius 4.20.8-9.
The concerns of the philosophers and musical theorists of Classical Athens are not unique. Music has certain universal characteristics seen in many different cultures. It is one of the most celebrated forms of art, for its ability to communicate emotions, ideas, and values. The power of music has been concerning people in all times and modern research continues to study music’s effects on one’s behavior and feelings.

The musical debate that takes place in Classical Athens is not unique either. Even if the circumstances are very different, there is an ongoing debate concerning the quality of music still today. Since the categorizing of art into “good” and “bad” is subjective, a culturally conscious society with freedom of speech will always be prone to debates. It is these debates and the continuous discussion and questioning that keep the cultural life vibrant.
GLOSSARY

Aoidos: epic singer; very often poet-composer-singer⁴²¹.
Auletes: aulos player.
Auletris and auletria: female aulos-player; often a professional engaged to play at banquets.
Aulodos: performer on the aulos who is accompanied by a singer⁴²².
Aulos: wind instrument of which the main body was a pipe of reed with a number of fingerholes.
Barbitos or barbiton: stringed instrument, a narrower and longer variety of the lyra.
Chelys: tortoise. The earlier type of lyra was called a chelys-lyra called because its sound-box was a tortoise-shell.
Chiton: tunic worn next to the skin⁴²³.
Choreia: (in Plato) choir-training.
Chorus: dance; choir; the chorus of the ancient drama.
Cymbala: percussion instrument consisting of two hollow hemispheric metal plates.
Demos: the people, the inhabitants; the common people⁴²⁴.
Dithyrambos: a lyric song of an enthusiastic character in honor of Dionysus.
Emmeleia: the dance of the chorus in ancient tragedy, distinguished by its lofty, dignified and restrained character.
Epinikion melos: a song praising a victory in war or in a musical or athletic contest.
Eunomia: good order or good custom⁴²⁵.
Eukosmia: orderly behavior, good conduct, decency⁴²⁶.
Harmonia: in music it indicates the octave, and the different disposition of the notes in a system with its parts adjusted so as to form a perfect ensemble.
Heterophonia: diversity of note⁴²⁷.
Himation: an outer garment worn above the chiton⁴²⁸.
Homophonia: the unison of note.
Hubris: arrogance and excessive pride, especially in the face of the gods⁴²⁹.
Hymeneos: a nuptial or bridal song, sung by the bride’s friends on her way from her parents' house to that of the bridegroom.
Hyporchema: song and dance in honor of Apollo.

⁴²¹ All explanations of the Greek terms are found in Michaelides 1978, if not noted otherwise.
⁴²² Bundrick 2005, 239.
⁴²³ Liddell-Scott 1996 s.v. chiton.
⁴²⁴ Liddell-Scott 1996 s.v. demos.
⁴²⁵ Bundrick 2005, 239.
⁴²⁶ Liddell-Scott 1996 s.v. eukosmia.
⁴²⁷ Liddell-Scott 1996 s.v. heterophonia.
⁴²⁸ Liddell-Scott 1996 s.v. himation.
⁴²⁹ Bundrick 2005, 239.
Kampe: turn, sudden change.

Kithara: a stringed instrument, that differed from the lyra as to the sound-box, size and sonority.

Kitharistes: a kithara player.

Kitharodikos nomos: a song with kithara accompaniment, dedicated to Apollo.

Kitharodos: a musician who sang and accompanied himself on the kithara.

Komos: a riotous procession with singing and dancing, to or from a symposion. Komos was also the name of the public procession in honor of Dionysus.

Kordax: a comic dance; a dance of the ancient comedy.

Krotala: a percussion instrument consisting of two hollow pieces of shell, wood or metal in various forms, usually fastened one on each hand.

Lyra: Stringed instrument which consisted of a sound-box of wood – earlier a tortoise shell – with long, slightly curved arms, joined at the upper end to a cross-bar, strings stretched between the cross-bar and the sound-box.

Melos: In music song; tune; choral or lyric song; melody generally.

Nomos: in its general sense, law, custom, convention. In music nomos was the most important type of musical composition and performance.

Paean: choral song, hymn addressed to Apollo and Artemis, especially as thanksgiving for deliverance from evil. In general it was a solemn ode.

Pathos: in a general sense everything that one could suffer, experience or undergo.

Pyrrhiche: a war-dance. The pyrrhiche was a majestic, quick, brilliant and impressive dance, while carrying arms and imitating the movements of warriors.

Pythikos nomos: a composition describing the combat of Apollo with the monster Python.

Rhapsodos: someone who recites epic poems.

Salpinx: trumpet.

Skolion: a song to lyra accompaniment sung at a symposion.

Skenikos: theatrical.

Sophrosyne: soundness of mind, prudence, discretion, sanity; moderation in sensual desires, self-control, temperance.\(^{430}\)

Spondeion: In music, a song sung or an instrumental melody played during the pouring of libations.

Syrinx: Pan's pipe, shepherd’s pipe.

Thiasos: The entourage of Dionysos, including nymphs and satyrs.\(^{431}\)

Tropos: mode, way, style.

Tympanon: percussion instrument made of a cylindrical box with skin membranes stretched on both sides, played by the hand.

\(^{430}\) Liddell-Scott 1996 s.v. sophrosyne.

\(^{431}\) Bundrick 2005, 240.
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

Fig. 1: Exterior side of a cup by the Brygos Painter with followers of Dionysos; c. 490-480 BC. Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Cabinet des Médailles (576). Photo: Bibliothèque Nationale de France. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 63.

Fig. 2: Interior side of a cup by the Brygos Painter with Dionysos and satyrs; c. 490-480 BC. Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale, Cabinet des Médailles (576). Photo: Bibliothèque Nationale de France. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 62.

Fig. 3: Attic red-figure krater by the Retorted Painter, with Dionysos and his entourage. Toronto, Royal Ontario Museum, 919 V 13.21. – Photo: Museum. ARV 1490/13. After Nordquist 1995 fig. 4.

Fig. 4: Stamnos by Smikros with symposion; c. 510-500 BC. Brussels, Royal Museums of Art and History (A 717). Photo: Museum. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 68.

Fig. 5: Cup by the Painter of Louvre G 265 with death of Orpheus; c. 480-470 BC. Cincinnati Art Museum, John J. Emery, William W. Taylor, Robert S. Dechant, and Israel and Caroline Wilson Endowments (1979.1). Photo: Museum. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 71.

Fig. 6: Orpheus playing the lyra while Thracian men listen. Berlin, Antikenmuseum, 3172, front side. – Photo after Fyrtwängler 1890: pl. II. After Seebass 1995 fig. 5.


Fig. 8: Red figure bell-krater with Marsyas playing the aulos; Paris, Louvre, G 490. – Photo: Museum. ARV 1190,21. After Voutira 1995 fig. 10.

Fig. 9: Apulian pelike with Apollo playing the lyra and Marsyas holding the aulos; c. 420 BC. Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, 3231. – Photo: Museum. After Voutira 1995 fig. 8.

Fig. 10: Red figure bell-krater with Marsyas playing the lyra. Heidelberg, Ruprecht-Karls-Universität, Archäologisheses Institut, 208. Photo: Museum. ARV 1189,19. After Voutira 1995 fig. 11.

Fig. 11: Red figure cup with a woman choosing the lyra rather than the aulos. Bologna, Museo Civico Archeologico, PU 271. – Photo after CVA, Bologna, Museo Civico, III I pl. 118. After Voutira 1995 fig. 12.

Fig. 12, 13: Cup by Douris with school scene, c. 490-480 BC. Antikensammlung, Staatliche Museen zu Berlin, Preussischer Kulturbesitz. Photo: Bildarchiv Preussischer Kulturbesitz/Art Resource, NY. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 1, 2.

Fig. 14: Hydria by Phintias with instruction in lyra playing; c. 510-500 BC. Munich, Staatliche Antikensammlungen und Glyptothek (2421). Photo: Museum. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 35.

Fig. 15: Hydria by the Painter of the Yale Oinochoe with the judgment of Paris. London The British Museum E 178. ARV 503,20. After Boardman 1989 fig. 34.

Fig. 16: Unattributed hydria with diskos thrower, athlete with javelin, trainer, and aulos player; c. 510-500 BC. London, The British Museum (E 164). Photo: The British Museum. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 47.
Fig. 17: Unattributed hydria with pyrrhic dance, including aulos player; c. 500 BC. New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Rogers Fund, 1921 (21.88.2). Photo: The Metropolitan Museum of Art. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 48.

Fig. 18: Red figure cup by the Brygos Painter with young symposiast singing a skolion and holding a bough of myrtle; c. 480. Florence, 3949; ARV 376/90. After Lissarrague 1990 fig. 99.

Fig. 19: Red figure cup with symposiast singing; c. 490. Athens, MN1357. After Lissarrague 1990 fig. 102.

Fig. 20: Red figure kalathos by the Brygos Painter with Alkaios and Sappho; c. 470 BC. Munich, 2416; ARV 385/228. After Lissarrague 1990 fig. 95.

Fig. 21: Red figure amphora with lyre player singing; c. 520 BC. Paris, Louvre G 30; ARV 15/9. After Lissarrague 1990 fig. 103.

Fig. 22: Red figure cup with symposion scene, where the symposiasts are playing a game with the cups; c. 490 BC. Private collection; M. Vickers, Greek Symposia (London, n.d.), fig. 17, p. 15. After Lissarrague 1990 fig. 68.

Fig. 23: Stamnos by the Chicago Painter with man dancing and woman with krotala. Cape Town, South African Museum H 4810. J. Boardman and M. Pope, Greek Vases in Cape Town (1961) no. 14. After Boardman 1989 fig. 27.

Fig. 24: Hydria by Polygnotos with acrobats, musicians, and dancers. Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale, 3232, from Nola. ARV 1032,61. After Boardman 1989 fig. 138.

Fig. 25: Black figure oenochoe by Kleisophos with revelers in a komos; c. 530 BC. Athens National Museum, 1045. ABV 186. After Lissarrague 1990 fig. 77.

Fig. 26: Amphora by the Kleophrades Painter with revelers, including woman with aulos; c. 500-490 BC. Martin-von-Wagner Museum der Universität Würzburg (L 507). Photo: Museum (K. Oehrlein). After Bundrick 2005 fig.70.

Fig. 27: Bell krater by the Danae Painter with Apollo and Muses; c. 440-430 BC Vienna, Kunsthistorisches Museum (IV 697). Photo: Museum. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 25.

Fig. 28: Neck amphora by the Peleus Painter with Mousaios and the Muses Melousa and Terpsichore. London, The British Museum E 271, from Vulci. ARV 1039,13. After Boardman 1989 fig. 144.

Fig. 29: Lykethos by the Achilles Painter with Muses on Helicon. Munich, Schoen 80, from Greece. ARV 997,155. After Boardman 1989 fig. 262.

Fig. 30: Bell krater by the Danae Painter with women playing barbitos and listeners; c. 440-430 BC. New York , The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Rogers Fund, 1923 (23.160.80). Photo: The metropolitan Museum of Art. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 59.

Fig. 31: Red figure hydria with women in domestic setting; c. 450 BC. Switzerland, private collection. – Photo: D. Widmer, Basel. After Voutira 1995 fig. 5.

Fig. 32: White-ground lekythos by the Achilles Painter with woman, playing phorminx, and companion; c. 460-450 BC. Stockholm, National Museum (G 2107). Photo: Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Athens (neg. Athen Varia 699). After Bundrick 2005 fig.60.
Fig. 33: White-ground lekythos from Gela by the Achilles Painter: one woman sitting with a kithara, the other standing with the lyra. Oxford, Ashmolean Museum, 1889.1016. – Photo: Museum. Beazley *ARV*: 1000.195. After Seebass 1995 fig. 24.

Fig. 34: Stamnos by the Chicago Painter with women celebrating a ritual before an image of Dionysos, a so-called Lenaia-scene; c. 450 BC. San Antonio Museum of Art, Gift of Gilbert M. Denman, Jr. (86.134.64). Photo: Courtesy of San Antonio Museum of Art. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 93.

Fig. 35: Volute krater attributed to the Group of Polygnotos with cult procession before two seated divinities; c. 440-430 BC. Ferrara, Museo Archeologico Nazionale di Spina (2897/T 128). Photo: Scala/Art Resource, NY. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 94.

Fig. 36: Lebes gamikos by the Washing Painter with women preparing for a wedding, the bride playing the harp, and Eros, c. 430-420. New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Rogers Fund, 1916, 16.73. *ARV* 1126,6. After Boardman 1989 fig. 207; Bundrick 2005 fig. 19. Photo: The Metropolitan Museum of Art.

Fig. 37: Pelike by the Pan Painter with kithara player mounting a *bema*; c. 480-470 BC. New York, Solow Art and Architecture Foundation. Photo: Foundation. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 98.

Fig. 38: Drawing of volute krater by the Pronomos Painter with theatrical scene and the aulos player Pronomos in the centre; c. 400 BC. Naples, Museo Archeologico Nazionale (81673/H3240). Photo: Deutsches Archäologisches Institut, Rome (neg. 69.176). After Bundrick 2005 fig. 102.

Fig. 39: Bell krater by the Villa Giulia Painter with Apollo, Artemis, and Leto; c. 460-450 BC. New York, The Metropolitan Museum of Art, Fletcher Fund, 1924 (24.97.96). Photo: The metropolitan Museum of Art. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 85.


Fig. 41: Unattributed calyx krater with comic scene; c. 415-410 BC. Malibu, CA, The J. Paul Getty Museum (82.AE.83). Photo: Copyright The J. Paul Getty Museum. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 101.

Fig. 42: Stamnos by Polygnotos with roasting of sacrificial meat; c. 440 BC. London, The British Museum (E 455). Photo: Copyright The British Museum. After Bundrick 2005 fig. 90.
ILLUSTRATIONS

Fig. 1. Exterior side of a cup by the Brygos Painter with followers of Dionysos.

Fig. 2. Interior side of a cup by the Brygos Painter with Dionysos and satyrs.
Fig. 3. Attic red-figure krater by the Retorted Painter, with Dionysos and his entourage.
Fig. 4. Stamnos by Smikros with symposion.

Fig. 5. Cup by the Painter of Louvre G 265 with death of Orpheus.
Fig. 6. Orpheus playing the lyra while Thracian men listen.

Fig. 7. Apulian hydria with the myth of Thamyris.
Fig. 8. Red figure bell-krater with Marsyas playing the aulos.

Fig. 9. Apulian pelike with Apollo playing the lyra and Marsyas holding the aulos.
Fig. 10. Red figure bell-krater with Marsyas playing the lyra.

Fig. 11. Red figure cup with a woman choosing the lyra rather than the aulos.
Fig. 12. Cup by Douris with school scene.

Fig. 13. Cup by Douris with school scene.
Fig. 14. Hydria by Phintias with instruction in lyra playing.

Fig. 15. Hydria by the Painter of the Yale Oinochoe with the judgment of Paris.
Fig. 16. Unattributed hydria with diskos thrower, athlete with javelin, trainer, and aulos player.

Fig. 17. Unattributed hydria with pyrrhic dance, including aulos player.
Fig. 18. Red figure cup by the Brygos Painter with young symposiast singing a skolion and holding a bough of myrtle.

Fig. 19. Red figure cup with symposiast singing.
Fig. 20. Red figure kalathos by the Brygos Painter with Alkaios and Sappho.

Fig. 21. Red figure amphora with lyra player singing.
Fig. 22. Red figure cup with symposion scene, where the symposiasts are playing a game with the cups.

Fig. 23. Stamnos by the Chicago Painter with man dancing and woman with krotala.
Fig. 24. Hydria by Polygnotos with acrobats, musicians, and dancers.

Fig. 25. Black figure oenochoe by Kleisophos with revelers in a komos.
Fig. 26. Amphora by the Kleophrades Painter with revelers, including woman with aulos.
Fig. 27. Bell krater by the Danae Painter with Apollo and Muses.

Fig. 28. Neck amphora by the Peleus Painter with Mousaios and the Muses Melousa and Terpsichore.
Fig. 29. Lykethos by the Achilles Painter with Muses on Helicon.

Fig. 30. Bell krater by the Danae Painter with women playing barbitos and listeners.
Fig. 31. Red figure hydria with women in domestic setting.
Fig. 32. White-ground lekythos by the Achilles Painter with woman, playing phorminx, and companion.
Fig. 33. White-ground lekythos from Gela by the Achilles Painter: one woman sitting with a kithara, the other standing with the lyra.
Fig. 34. Stamnos by the Chicago Painter with women celebrating a ritual before an image of Dionysos, a so-called Lenaia-scene.
Fig. 35. Volute krater attributed to the Group of Polygnotos with cult procession before two seated divinities.

Fig. 36. Lebes gamikos by the Washing Painter with women preparing for a wedding, the bride playing the harp, and Eros.
Fig. 37. Pelike by the Pan Painter with kithara player mounting a *bema*.

Fig. 38. Drawing of volute krater by the Pronomos Painter with theatrical scene and the auletes Pronomos in the centre.
Fig. 39. Bell krater by the Villa Giulia Painter with Apollo, Artemis, and Leto.

Fig. 40. Stamnos by the Villa Giulia Painter with Apollo and the Muses.
Fig. 41. Unattributed calyx krater with comic scene.

Fig. 42. Stamnos by Polygnotos with roasting of sacrificial meat.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Ancient sources


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Editions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
Modern sources

Anderson 1966

Anderson 1994

ARV
J. D. Beazley, *Attic Red-Figure Vase-paintings*, 1956.

ABV
J. D. Beazley, *Attic Black-Figure Vase-paintings* (second edition) 1963.

Barker 1984

Boardman 1975

Boardman 1989

Bundrick 2005

Comotti 1989

Csapo 2004

CVA
*Corpus Vasorum Antiquorum*

Dahlhaus 2004

Danfulani 1996

Demarinis 1996

Dowden 1992

Frith 2004
Simon Frith, ‘What is Bad Music?’ in *Bad music. The music we love to hate*, ed.

Ford 2004

Ganetz 2008

Godwin 1981

Guthrie 1975

Guthrie 1978

Juslin 1998

Lawler 1964a
Lillian B. Lawler, The dance of the ancient Greek theater, Iowa City 1964.

Lawler 1964b

LIMC
Lexikon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae, 1981-.

Lippman 1964

Lissarrague 1990

Liddell & Scott 1996

Maas & Snyder 1989
M. Maas and J. McIntosh Snyder, Stringed instruments of Ancient Greece, Yale U.P. New Haven, CT, 1989.

Martin & Seagrove 1988
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>


Washburne 2004

West 1992

Williams 1983

Wilson 2004

Internet sources


Kurutz, Steven, They’re playing my song. Time to work out, at: http://www.nytimes.com/2008/01/10/fashion/10fitness.html?_r=2 (24/04/09)