Spatiality of Livelihood Strategies

The Reciprocal Relationships between Space and Livelihoods in the Tibetan Exile Community in India

Högskolan på Gotland
Vårterminen 2012
Kandidatuppsats i samhällsgeografi
Författare: Wilda Nilsson
Institutionen för kultur, energi och miljö,
Handledare: Dan Carlsson
Abstract
Research on livelihoods has been conducted across various fields but there has been less focus upon detection and analyzing of the interconnected relationships between space and livelihoods. This study investigates these relationships from a place-specific point of view utilizing the Tibetan exile community in India as a case study. The qualitative method of semi-structured, in-depth interviews has been employed in order to gather primary data. Theoretically, this thesis draws its framework mainly from the human geography perspective on space and place combined with the conceptual Sustainable Livelihood framework.

This thesis argues that it is possible to distinguish four examples of reciprocal relationships between space and livelihoods in the places studied. These are spatial congregation into an ethnic enclave, the altering of place specific time-space relations which in turn alters livelihood possibilities over time, migration and spatial dispersion of livelihoods. These results are case specific and not generalizable.

Keywords: Spatiality of livelihoods, Tibetans in exile, India, livelihood strategies, space, place

Sammanfattning
Forskning kring försörjningsmöjligheter har utförts inom en rad vetenskapliga fält men få har fokuserat på att finna och analysera ömsesidiga relationer mellan space och försörjningsstrategier. Denna studie undersöker dessa relationer med en plats-specifik utgångspunkt och använder det tibetanska exilsamhället i Indien som fallstudie. Den kvalitativa metoden semi-strukturerade djupintervjuer har använts för att samlas in primärdata. Uppsatens drar sitt teoretiska ramverk från det samhällsgeografiska perspektiven på space och place i kombination med det konceptuella ramverket Sustainable Livelihood framework.

Uppsatens menar att det är möjligt att särskilja fyra exempel på de ömsesidiga relationerna mellan space och försörjningsstrategier. Dessa är rumslig ansamling i en etnisk enklav, förändringar i platsspecifika tid-rum relationer vilket påverkar försörjningsmöjligheter över tid, migration och rumslig spridning av försörjning. Dessa resultat anses vara fallspecifica och därför inte möjliga att generalisera.

Nyckelord: Försörjningsstrategiers rumslighet, exil-tibetaner, Indien, försörjnings (livelihood) strategier, sustainable livelihood framework, space, place
Acknowledgements

This thesis would not have been possible were it not for the kind support and encouragement I received from my supervisor Dan Carlsson and the Department of Human Geography at Gotland University and the funding I received from Alfas Internationella Stipendiefond through a scholarship tied to Gotland University. For this I will always be grateful.

I would also like to express my gratitude to Helge Ax:son Johnsons Stiftelse who generously has provided additional funding making it possible to continue this project and expanding it to cover Nepal. The results from the upcoming fieldwork there will, combined with part of the material presented in this thesis, be reworked into popular scientific text.

Advice regarding the upcoming fieldwork was generously provided by Katrin Goldstein-Kyaga, author of Tibet and the Swedish Silence- an Examination of Swedish Foreign Policy Documents and the Press and Tibet- Fredsstaten among other books, and the Swedish Tibet Committee especially through Georgia Sandberg. Thank you.

I am particularly indebted to those who generously gave of their time, knowledge, experiences and support during the process of conducting the fieldwork and writing the thesis. I want to extend a special thanks to my respondents in the Tibetan exile community in India whom kindly answered my many questions and helped me out in every other way they could. I shall not name names because of their wishes to remain anonymous. In Sweden several people deserve more praise than I can ever provide here. Fredrik Göthe, I can never repay the support you gave me during this entire process. Christopher Wingård and Jenny Freij, without you, this text would have been a right mess. I hope all you others who have helped me know how grateful I am.
Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. 2
Sammanfattning .................................................................................................................................... 2
Acknowledgements ............................................................................................................................... 3
List of Maps and Figures .......................................................................................................................... 5
List of Abbreviations ............................................................................................................................. 5
Part 1. Inevitabilities Providing Comprehension of this Thesis ................................................................. 6
  1.1 Introduction ...................................................................................................................................... 6
  1.2 Problem Formulation and Research Questions ................................................................................. 7
  1.3 Purpose .......................................................................................................................................... 8
  1.4 Previous Research ............................................................................................................................ 8
  1.5 Ontology and Epistemology ............................................................................................................ 12
  1.6 Qualitative Research and why it is an Appropriate Method ............................................................. 13
    1.6.1 In-depth, Semi-structured Interviews as a Method .................................................................. 16
    1.6.2 Research Design and Constraints ......................................................................................... 17
  1.7 Delimitations .................................................................................................................................... 19
Part 2. Theoretical Background and Conceptual Framework................................................................. 19
  2.1 Space, Place, Scale and their Relation to Livelihood Strategies ....................................................... 20
  2.2 The Sustainable Livelihood Framework .......................................................................................... 22
    2.2.1 Using the Sustainable Livelihood Framework ...................................................................... 24
    2.2.2 Livelihood Diversification and Spatial Dispersion ................................................................. 26
    2.2.3 Ethnicity and Spatial Congregation ....................................................................................... 29
Part 3. Contextualizing India and the Tibetans residing within .............................................................. 31
  3.1 The Tibet Conflict: Historical Background from 1949 .................................................................. 31
  3.2 The Indo- China Relationship ......................................................................................................... 33
  3.3 Geographies of India ....................................................................................................................... 34
    3.3.1 Geography of India ................................................................................................................ 34
    3.3.2 Economic Geography of India ................................................................................................ 35
    3.3.3 Political and Social Geographies of India .............................................................................. 38
  3.4 Contextualizing Tibetan Settlements in India .................................................................................. 41
    3.4.1 Administration and Leadership in the Exile Community ....................................................... 44
    3.4.2 Economics in Exile ................................................................................................................ 48
Part 4. Analysis of the Relationship between Space and Livelihood Strategies .................................. 56
  4.1 Place Specific Context and the Institutions, Policies and Processes Restraining or Enabling Them .... 57
  4.2 Ethnic Enclaves (Spatial Congregation and the Impact on Livelihoods) ........................................ 61
  4.3 Seasonality and Tourism (The Altering of Place-Specific, Time-Space Relations and the Impact on Livelihood strategies) ........................................................................................................ 67
  4.4 Migration (Spatial Patterns or Processes and their Impact on Livelihood Strategies) .................... 69
  4.5 Spreading out or Diversify? (Spatial Dispersion, Diversification and the Impact on Livelihood strategies) .................................................................................................................................... 73
Part 5. Conclusions and Discussion ........................................................................................................ 75
Part 6. Summary .................................................................................................................................... 78
List of References .................................................................................................................. 80
Literature ................................................................................................................................. 80
Articles ...................................................................................................................................... 81
Reports and statistics ............................................................................................................... 81
Internet ...................................................................................................................................... 82
Interviews ................................................................................................................................. 83
Observations ............................................................................................................................ 85

List of Maps and Figures
Figure 1: The Sustainable Livelihood framework ................................................................. 24
Figure 2: Map of India, New Delhi/Dharamsala and Darjeeling marked out ....................... 34
Figure 3: Types of Settlements. .............................................................................................. 44
Figure 4: Main chowk in McLeod Ganj. Monks, Punjabi tourists and easy money transfer
from abroad .............................................................................................................................. 57
Figure 5: Samyeling scattered settlement .............................................................................. 59
Figure 6: The alleys of Samyeling .......................................................................................... 60
Figure 7: The winding roads of Darjeeling .............................................................................. 61

List of Abbreviations
CCP Chinese Communist Party
CTSA Central Tibetan Schools Administration
CTPD Tibetan People’s Deputies
CTA Central Tibetan Administration
NGO Non-governmental organization
LIT Learning and Ideas for Tibet
PRC People’s Republic of China
SL Sustainable Livelihoods (Framework)
TCV Tibetan Children’s Village
TCHRD Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy
TPiE Tibetan Parliament-in-Exile
TWA Tibetan Women’s Association
UN United Nations
UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
Part 1. Inevitabilities Providing Comprehension of this Thesis

1.1 Introduction

One of the consequences of the complex situation between Tibet and China is that many Tibetans are leaving the country. Lack of adequate healthcare, education, employment opportunities and freedom of expression along with a Chinese suppression of the Tibetan culture has caused (and continues to cause) Tibetans to leave for India, Nepal, Bhutan and the west. In India, many Tibetans reside in close-net communities where especially the older generation is concerned with keeping their cultural traditions alive. These communities are either regulated settlements created by, in most cases, the Central Tibetan Administration or scattered communities without man-made physical boundaries. A life in exile can provide Tibetans with better opportunities to receive education, create and implement their chosen livelihood strategy, receive quality healthcare and relatively freely express their political opinions.

The traditional sustainment possibilities, created by earlier resettlement programs, include agriculture, small scale industries and handicraft making along with private initiatives consisting of seasonal migration for so called ‘sweater selling business’. Although these livelihood strategies are still important, especially within the regular settlements, there has been a major shift towards a diverse tertiary sector. National migration for other reasons than sweater selling has emerged as a livelihood strategy. Additionally, an increased number of young people are proceeding towards a higher degree of education in order to acquire a position of employment where such is required. This leads to the necessity to migrate nationally since there is a lack of job opportunities for the higher educated within the exile community and especially within the regular settlements. Even though new sources of livelihood are being sought after by the Tibetans, unemployment rates remain high. The continuing spread of Tibetans from settlements has resulted in Tibetans living in 224 different places in South Asia, and more Tibetans live in other locations in Europe and North America.

In some of these countries Tibetans concentrate geographically in so called scattered

---

settlements. In these non-regulated places livelihood strategies are implemented on both individual, family and community scale.

Three of these scattered settlements are located in Delhi, Dharamsala and Darjeeling in India. Each of these settlements differentiate profoundly regarding geographical location and socio-economic context but have in common a population which creates its livelihood to a large extent outside the traditional employment sectors. I’m interested in finding out how Tibetan people in India, outside the regular settlements, create and implement their livelihood strategies. I want to put special emphasis on the reciprocal relationships between space and livelihood something that has been neglected by much previous livelihood research. I want to examine how livelihood systems are embedded in socio-spatial articulations that are constructed and reconstructed over time. In order to do this I will draw upon, and partly combine, theories on space, place and livelihoods.

1.2 Problem Formulation and Research Questions

Geographic research on livelihoods has clarified those social networks binding together livelihood systems and structural constraints functions in a different ways across spatial and temporal scales. There has however been less focus upon detection and analyzing of the mutual relationships between space and livelihood. Livelihoods are inherently spatial because they depend on the collection of resources, the integration to social networks and the movement of capital and labor and as such they require a spatial analysis to be properly understood.

Seeing that space/place geographies probably never transcend the entire universe it is undoubtedly necessary not to generalize but rather analyze the relation between space and livelihoods from a place-specific point of view. Brian King has done this using the Mzinti community in South Africa as his case study. He seeks to show how space operates as an enabling and constraining mechanism for livelihood systems, or how livelihoods potentially rework spatial patterns.

7 B. King, pp. 297-313.
8 B. King, pp. 297-313.
9 B. King, pp. 297-313.
10 B. King, pp. 297-313.
11 B. King, pp. 297-313.
12 B. King, p. 300.
I am particularly interested in the multiple geographies existing in India and the various ethnicities that practice the thousands of places there. The study made by Brian King caught my attention and made me wonder whether similar, or completely different, spatial relations between space and livelihoods would be possible to distinguish in other contexts than the South African one.

Due to my personal interest in the South Asian region I was already familiar with the Tibetan exile community in India and decided that this community would be used as a case study in order to see whether King’s hypothesis, that there exist a reciprocal link between space and livelihoods that is necessary to take into consideration, was something applicable on the Indian context as well.

I believe it necessary, as do King, to take both historical and contemporary spatial patterns into account when analyzing livelihoods. Consequently, I shall emphasis the context specific geographies of India before focusing upon the Tibetans living there.

**Research questions**

Is it possible to distinguish a reciprocal relationship between space and livelihoods in certain places in the Tibetan exile community?

If yes, how are space and livelihoods interconnected in the Tibetan exile-community in India?

**1.3 Purpose**

The purpose of this thesis is to find out whether reciprocal links between space and livelihoods exist in specific places the Tibetan exile-community in India and if it does highlight through analysis specific examples of the phenomena.

**1.4 Previous Research**

Integrative, locally embedded, cross-sectorial, informed by a deep field engagement and committed to action, livelihood approaches has been used for decades even though they were not always labeled as such. By the very last decades of the 1900s geographers, social-

---

13 B. King, pp. 297-313.
anthropologists, and socio-economists were able to provide several influential analyses of rural settings because they took into account dynamic ecologies, history, changes over an extended time, gender, social differentiation and cultural contexts. This defined the field of environment and development. Concerns about livelihoods in relation to stress, and the thereby constructed coping strategies or adaptations of strategies, were put on the map. This sort of academic thinking was named political ecology which at the root focuses on the intersection of structural, political forces and ecological dynamics although there are many different strands and variations. Mutual characteristics of the trajectory were the commitment to local level fieldwork that made it possible to explore the complex realities of livelihoods while connecting it to macro-structural issues.

During the 1980-90s concerns regarding linking poverty-reduction and development with long-term environmental shocks and stresses emerged. As a result of the publication of the Brundtland report in 1987, the term sustainability entered the development discourse. With the UN Conference on Environment and Development 1992 in Rio sustainability also became a central political concern. Since then different, often cross-disciplinary, academic research projects have offered diverse insights into the way complex, rural livelihoods intersect with political, economic and environmental processes.

What later came to be known as the Sustainable Livelihood Approach first emerged in 1986 during a discussion around the Food 2000 report for the Brundtland commission. The report, involving M.S Swaminathan, Robert Chambers and others, laid out a vision for a people-oriented development discourse based on local realities. However, it was not until the publication in 1992 of Robert Chambers’ and Gordon Conway’s working paper for the Institute of Development Studies that the now widely accepted definition of sustainable livelihood was pronounced:

A livelihood comprises the capabilities, assets (including both material and social resources) and activities for a means of living. A livelihood is sustainable when it can cope with and recover from stresses and shocks, maintain or enhance its capabilities and assets, while not undermining the natural resource base.\textsuperscript{21}

The sustainable livelihoods approach remained on the margins of debates and political policies for years especially because of the hegemonic neoliberal policy of that period.\textsuperscript{22} In the end of the 1990s and beginning of the 2000s the situation changed drastically. The Washington Consensus was challenged from both activists on the streets and scholars such as Joseph Stiglitz.\textsuperscript{23} In the UK 1997 provided a key moment when the White Paper that committed explicitly to a poverty and livelihoods focus and sustainable rural livelihoods was promoted as a core development priority.\textsuperscript{24}

The sustainable livelihoods approach emphasized economic attributes of livelihoods as mediated by social-institutional processes in order to facilitate productive discussions with economists. In connecting inputs (designated with the term “capitals” or assets) and outputs (livelihood strategies) linking in turn outcomes the framework combined familiar territory of poverty lines and empowerment levels with wider framings of well-being and sustainability.\textsuperscript{25}

Usage of the approach gained momentum and one interesting way in which the approach came into use were the analysis of health care issues such as HIV/AIDS through a livelihood perspective.\textsuperscript{26} Diversification of livelihoods and migration were themes that also benefited from the SL- framework.\textsuperscript{27}

The approach has however been criticized on several points. One potentially negative effect of the focus on assets is that the discussion is firmly kept in the territory of economic analysis thus missing out on wider social perspectives. Others argue that there is not enough focus on economy within the framework or that the holistic method misses out on depth, focus and

\textsuperscript{21} P. Knutsson, pp, 90-99. (As adapted by Scoones 1998, and others)
\textsuperscript{22} P. Knutsson, pp, 90-99.
\textsuperscript{23} P. Knutsson, pp, 90-99.
\textsuperscript{24} P. Knutsson, pp, 90-99.
\textsuperscript{25} P. Knutsson, pp, 90-99.
\textsuperscript{26} W. Masanjala, The poverty-HIV/AIDS nexus in Africa: A livelihood approach, University of Malawi, Zomba, Malawi, Social Science & Medicine, 2007, 64, pp, 1032–1041.
\textsuperscript{27} P. Knutsson, pp, 90-99.
analytical clarity due to the complexity of the development problems it tries to capture. The framework is also argued to lack capacity regarding the ability to analyze politics and power in a more transcending and detailed way, even if the asset “political capital” is used. Another problem is that many of the approaches concerned with sustainable livelihoods became closely related to normative positions instead of solely being analytical tools.

Further, seeing as livelihood approaches comes from a complex disciplinary parentage focusing on the local level it might lack ability to handle big shifts in global markets, and politics. Still, the SL- framework has been used for example by Fazeeha Amzi to connect global markets in terms of the creation of Export Processing Zones in Sri Lanka, to the change in livelihood strategies on the community level. Despite the word sustainable in the title, there is a lack of rigorous attempts to deal with long term secular change in environmental conditions because focus is predominately put on social sustainability. There have however been several researchers who have used the SL- framework as an analytical tool to draw conclusions on both environmental and on social sustainability. One example is the research on ways to strengthen livelihoods of prawn traders and associated groups in southwest Bangladesh. It clearly links the local economic context to wider environmental issues. A future challenge for the approach is to continue to integrate the understandings of local context into the big picture of global environmental change and global economic processes. The relevance of this view comes clear in the paper of Azmi which argues that the increasing globalization has resulted in the contraction of time and space which in turn rapidly changes local contexts, making people change their livelihoods as well. Instead of pursuing unprofitable livelihood strategies in their local sphere people now diversify their livelihoods or move to new locations to exploit new opportunities in order to live the life they prefer.

Lastly there is the critique from King regarding the inability of livelihood approaches to appreciate and take into account the interconnected relationship between space and

33 F. Azmi pp, 1-12.
livelihoods. He demonstrates that space and livelihoods intersect in two specific ways: the persistence of historical geographies in shaping access to natural resources and how historical and contemporary spatial patterns produce intra-community clusters that shape livelihood possibilities in the contemporary period of time and so shows the necessity of taking spatiality into account in livelihood research.

1.5 Ontology and Epistemology

Fieldwork has since the advent of humanism in geography in the 1970s become more participatory in nature. Humanism draws much of its theoretical toolkit from phenomenology and as a result fieldwork moved from being an experimental spatial scientific venture in search of laws to a qualitative and interpretative one in search of spatial and cultural meaning. The humanists emphasized the subjectivity of the researcher and the observed phenomena whereby research questions turned from the land to the people. Because I think the world is subjective and reality a social construction I shall not look for regularities; instead I try to understand the respondent’s subjective perception of reality which makes me draw my epistemological assumptions from the humanistic perspective of human geography.

Space is open to various different ontological conceptualizations. In this thesis the understanding of space as relational is upheld. Regarding the ontology of the relational space it was articulated within human geography by radical geographers such as Marxist and feminist scholars who sought to counter the ontology of absolute space. They challenged the ideas and ideology underpinning spatial science as being highly reductionists and that absolute notions of space emptied space of its meaning and purpose and failed to recognize the diverse ways in which space is produced. The relational conception of space epistemologically demanded a shift from seeking spatial laws to instead focus on how space is produced and managed to create certain socio-spatial relations.

The notion of place used in this thesis is epistemologically drawn from the humanistic geography, meaning that place is a location rendered meaningful by human imagination. But it still accepts the Marxist understanding of the social processes involvement in the

---

34 B. King, 2011.
35 B. King, pp. 298.
37 T. Cresswell, pp. 169-177.
38 R. Kitchin, pp. 268-275.
construction of places. This thesis agrees with David Harvey who stated that place, like space and time, is constructed by social processes.

In sum, based on my ontological assumptions and the view of the humanistic research paradigm on subjective realities this thesis emphasizes that place and the social relations within is constantly produced and reproduced through the changing and interdependent relationships between people and place. Therefore it is difficult, or perhaps not desirable, to create knowledge that transcends time and space. Hence, trying to objectively measure place and the people dwelling within will not further the purpose of this thesis.

1.6 Qualitative Research and why it is an Appropriate Method

Based on the discussion above, the ontological assumptions and my research questions I have chosen to conduct qualitative research mainly through in-depth, semi-structured interviews working from an epistemologically hermeneutic perspective. As space and people are seen as constantly changing I will not try to produce results that the positivistic paradigm would call definite truths, instead I will focus upon individually perceived realities and their implication on livelihood strategies. Fieldwork has been chosen as the overarching method of geographic inquiry because it seemed the most relevant method in order to gather the necessary primary data. It also facilitates an interception of data that other methods, such as the positivistic ones, could not have managed given the chosen ontology and epistemology.

Drawing upon literature on the case study approach, the data collection has been conducted as an intrinsic case study. The intrinsic case study approach means that the researcher has a personal or professional interest in the project which makes it possible for the researcher to play the role of a relatively subjective observer instead of working from a more objective outsider perspective. This has in my opinion made it considerably easier to reach participants, become trusted in the community and to perceive cultural meanings not explicitly told.

I have been inspired by the case study approach since it is an empirical inquiry that facilitates investigations of contemporary phenomenon within a real-life context, especially when the

---

40 T. Cresswell, pp. 169-177.
42 A. Bryman & E. Bell, Företagsekonomiska forskningsmetoder, Liber AB, Malmö, Sweden, 2005.
boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident. Therefore it is able to connect place with phenomenon in a way that is interesting from a human geography perspective. Robert Yin states that one would use the case study method because one deliberately wanted to cover contextual conditions- believing that they might be highly pertinent to the phenomenon of study. I will draw upon his views but not implement his method fully.

Validity and reliability is an important concern in all scientific research. Because of the concern with understanding the phenomenon from the inside using the words and actions of the participants, qualitative information usually does not lend itself to strict protocols and standardized measurement. Analysis and interpretation of qualitative data are neither intended to be subject to standardization or calibration. The research procedures can however make assessment of reliability and validity possible. Audio or video recordings of interviews can be, and has in this case been, turned into detailed transcriptions allowing others direct access to words and actions of research subjects. First-hand account of data should to some extent be accounted in the analysis even though personal integrity and confidentiality is of utmost importance. Additionally, transcripts can be analyzed through coding by several coders and then they can compare results in order to work out discrepancies. Hence, achieving reliability of qualitative data focuses more on research procedures than the data itself. With reference to a construct that is a scientifically informed idea developed to explain some phenomenon such as globalization, segregation or poverty validity can be evaluated. Given my ontology and epistemology using only quantitative research would be unsuitable since they are adapted to a different interpretation of reality. Quantitative research also focuses on replicability which is almost impossible to achieve in qualitative research (although Yin and others believe it to be possible). This because the aforementioned method is grounded in a worldview where materialistic regularity and objectivity reigns and the social and subjective is accepted only if it can be quantified and cause-effect determined. With the qualitative method I acknowledge the situated nature of research.

---

48 O. Ahlqvist, pp. 320-323.
49 O. Ahlqvist, pp. 320-323.
50 Bryan & Bell, 2005.
52 Bryan & Bell, 2005.
Using multiple sources of evidence, such as approaches to data collection like interviews, surveys, field observations, analysis of government and statistical records and spatial analysis is according to S.W Hardwick the best way to accomplish reliability and validity.\textsuperscript{54} This implies that the multi-method approach, which might constitute of both quantitative and qualitative methods of data collection and analysis, is to be preferred.\textsuperscript{55} Due to the limited time and resources available for this study the multi-method turned out too time consuming to implement. Instead the qualitative method is used in this thesis. Secondary quantitative sources such as statistics and government reports have been used to contextualize the qualitative findings in the hope of increasing the validity and reliability of the results.

There is awareness among many contemporary human geographers that no single method of conducting fieldwork provides unmediated, unbiased, and privileged access to the topic of investigation. Thus this thesis embraces the importance of accounting for the positionality and reflexivity of the researcher in the generation of geographic data and knowledge.\textsuperscript{56} Positionality is defined as the recognition that a researcher always operates and produces knowledge in relation to multiple relations of difference, such as class, ethnicity, gender, and age and sexuality.\textsuperscript{57} Reflexivity means the process of critically reflecting about oneself as a researcher.\textsuperscript{58} In the context of social relations and the partiality and subjective nature of data collected in the field and of the knowledge generated through the practice of fieldwork, geographers need to recognize their own position of power.\textsuperscript{59} In my attempt to implement reflexivity I have stated my epistemological and ontological assumptions as well as discussed which method that is the most appropriate. While adopting a hermeneutic perspective I acknowledge my role as subjective. I have presented the purpose of the chosen method and the expected role of the researcher in an intrinsic case study. Through transparently stating epistemological and ontological assumptions and methods including the selection process of the respondents I have tried to achieve credibility. I am also aware that all epistemological stances have weaknesses and through qualitative research particular subjective version of

\textsuperscript{54} S.W Hardwick, pp. 441-445.  
\textsuperscript{55} S.W Hardwick pp. 441-445.  
\textsuperscript{57} F.J Bosco & C.M Moreno, p.119.  
\textsuperscript{58} F.J Bosco & C.M Moreno, p.119.  
\textsuperscript{59} F.J Bosco & C.M Moreno, p.119.
reality will be created through the particular research practices one have chosen. It is necessary to be critical regarding whose interests this might serve.

1.6.1 In-depth, Semi-structured Interviews as a Method

The qualitative research method of choice has been in-depth semi-structured interviews which, even though questions are predetermined, allow interviews to unfold in a conversational manner. These interviews have mostly been conducted individually but were done in groups on a few occasions. In order to understand the participants I did not limit myself to perceived objectivity. Instead I interpreted these individuals with regards to the spatial and social context while being open and receptive to subtle signals and cultural meanings. This method also increased the ability to bridge the cultural divide between me and the respondents which would have been harder if interviews had been conducted over telephone. All in all, through this method it was possible to gather data I would have missed out on if I had instead used a quantitative research method such as a survey.

During the research design I carefully considered how to select and recruit participants, where to meet, how to transcribe interviews and analyze data. The selection process of respondents was made with the overall objective of finding participants that could help explaining people’s experiences in relation to the research topic. In detail, the selection process was first delimited by geographical location with regards to the three chosen sites for the fieldwork (New Delhi, Darjeeling and Dharamsala). Then these places were further narrowed down to consist of the particular areas where a scattered Tibetan community could be determined. In New Delhi the scattered settlement called Samyeling was chosen. In Dharamsala the area called McLeod Ganj and Gangchen Kyishong was chosen while in Darjeeling the Tibetans are dispersed in the entire town as well as having a regulated settlement (Darjeeling Self-Help Center) in close proximity which was also visited. When at the sites of the fieldwork the selection process consisted partly of cold calling, recruiting on site and snowballing. With cold calling I refer to the approaching of people without any prior contact and asking whether they are interested in participating in an interview. The refusal rate was high but this method turned out to be necessary in order to reach people out on the streets with whom I had no other way of coming in contact with. Recruiting on site meant visiting sites relevant to the

---

60 http://www.ccsr.ac.uk/methods, Retrieved 10th December 2011.
63 R. Longhurst, pp. 580-584.
research where I could make contact with potential respondents. This included for example NGO offices, temples, Tibetan trinket markets and language centers. Through snowballing it was possible to, through one participant, acquire contact details to another person and sometimes even personal introductions. As such, the selection has been opportunistic. I have also drawn upon the iterative approach regarding the selection of participants meaning that I have consulted my theoretical framework and drawn the conclusion that I need respondents from different levels of the social strata in order to fully implement the theory.\textsuperscript{64} Thinking critically about the method of choice there is a possibility that a certain kind of people chose to participate but since I was not looking to do a statistical sampling and do not want to generalize this should not have any impact on the results.

Susan Thiemes makes an interesting reflection upon her experience of interviewing respondents in Delhi writing that the process of data collection was more a process of data reception, meaning that respondents are autonomous subjects that decide themselves what information they will provide or not.\textsuperscript{65} She did, as did I, experience the risk of respondents exaggerating the information provided because of their own personal interests. Since this is not anything I can either prove or prevent I merely reflect upon it here. Another issue she points out is the risk of being over-selective and excluding important information from respondents. Thiemes suggest that this can be avoided through methodological selection process and data triangulation in which information from observation, the quantitative survey, interviews and discussions with migrants, immigrant associations, NGOs and international organizations was collected.\textsuperscript{66} I have tried to do this as much as possible. The analysis of the interviews was made through coding the transcripts searching for patterns according to the SL-framework division of data and the theoretical framework on space and place.

1.6.2 Research Design and Constraints
The research design of this thesis was inspired by Bryman and Bell and consisted of several stages.\textsuperscript{67} The initial part consisted of literature studies which focused on theory and methodology as well as background reading on Tibetan and Indian history. The second part was made up of the field study in India where primary data and empirical material was gathered from the three locations New Delhi, Darjeeling and Dharamsala through the

\textsuperscript{64} Bryman & Bell, p. 379.
\textsuperscript{65} S. Thieme, Social networks and migration: Far West Nepalese Labour migrants in Delhi, LIT Verlag Münster, 2006.
\textsuperscript{66} S. Thieme, 2006.
\textsuperscript{67} Bryman & Bell, 2005.
qualitative methods accounted for above. The following stage involved transcribing and analyzing the data collected in the field again according to the methodology accounted for above.

This study was conducted with both financial and time constraints which, along with other issues, impact the validity of the research results and need mentioning.

**Empirical material:** Regarding both the amount of collected first hand empirical material and the ontological and epistemological assumptions generalizations are not possible to make based on this thesis alone.

**Statistics:** The first statistic survey of the Tibetan exile-community was conducted in 1998 and the second one in 2009. However, this material needs to be questioned seeing the producer of the reports, the Central Tibetan Administration (CTA), is not a neutral research body. It is rather the opposite and CTA has strong interests in presenting statistics favorable to their fundraising concerns.\(^{68}\) Therefore I have balanced my use of these statistics with critical analyses from other researchers as well as weighing the statistics to my first hand empirical material.

**Communication:** Differences in language sometimes made it hard to conduct the interviews and information might have been lost. Sometimes friends would help to translate from Tibetan to English but generally many of the respondents spoke enough English. To counter the issues with communication I repeated their answers and asked questions in different ways when they did not understand what I wanted to know. Still, one of them expressed that if it were not for the language barrier she could have told me more.

**Biased responses:** During the interviews I believe to have encountered biased responses from certain people who believed they themselves had something to gain from me, answering what they thought I wanted to hear. Even though I tried to ask questions in ways that would not reveal any of my private views on the matter biases sometimes were inevitable. This concerned especially my questions on gender equality. It seems as though many Tibetans in the exile-community have realized that gender equality is something important to westerners (NGOs, donors etc.) and that they therefore might accommodate the answers accordingly.

\(^{68}\) S. Roemer, 2008.
This was a huge problem seeing as my initial idea was to explore gender relations in the household and at the workplace but it was simply too hard to get valid data and so I had to change my focus.

1.7 Delimitations

With regards to the purpose of this thesis, which is to examine possible reciprocal relationships between space and livelihood strategies in the Tibetan exile-community in certain places, the initial delimitation necessary was to decide upon which places that should form the basis of the case study. CTA divides the Tibetan exile population according to place of residence seeing that settlements have been established in different parts of South Asia. In addition to the regular settlements individuals are geographically dispersed in the country and the CTA identifies ten places in which they have gathered, defining these as scattered settlements in contrast to the handicraft/industrial-based and agricultural-based settlements. In believing that reciprocal relationships between space and place was predetermined when regulated settlements was built I found it more interesting to examine possible reciprocal relationships in non-regulated spaces and so I chose to focus on the scattered settlements. To enhance the possibility of finding different connections between space and livelihoods I decided to conduct fieldwork in more than one place.

The choice fell upon Samyeling Settlement in New Delhi, McLeod Ganj and Gangchen Kyishong in Dharamsala and Darjeeling all located in northern India, hence somewhat further delimiting the thesis geographically. The assumption was that a mega city, Delhi, would provide a different context in which to construct livelihoods compared to former hill stations close to the Himalayas. Dharamsala was chosen because it is the administrative seat of the exile community, the permanent residing place of His Holiness the 14th Dalai Lama and the place in which so called new-arrivals from Tibet arrive. It is hence a key node place in the Tibetan exile community. Darjeeling was chosen to provide a place in which the geography is similar to Dharamsala but with different social, cultural, economic and political geographies.

Part 2. Theoretical Background and Conceptual Framework

This thesis argues that spatial and cultural spaces and places (contexts) influence conditions and possibilities for individuals to create and implement a sustainable livelihood strategy.

Therefore theoretical background on space and place will be provided before moving on to the conceptual framework on sustainable livelihoods.

2.1 Space, Place, Scale and their Relation to Livelihood Strategies

Space as a concept can be used in the forms of absolute, relative and cognitive space. It organizes into places which in turn could be defined as territories of meaning. In understanding space as relational, space is conceived to be contingent and active. As something that is produced and constructed through social relations or practises. Hence, in this thesis space is not perceived as an absolute geometric container in which social and economic life takes place, instead it is seen as constitutive of such relations. The spatial form of the world is neither static nor fixed; it is constantly altering, being updated, rebuilt and constructed through the interplay of complex socio-spatial relations. The most important contribution of humanistic geography to the discipline of human geography is the distinction between an abstract realm of space and an experienced and felt world of place.

Places are seen as bounded settings in which social relations and identities are constituted. Places can be either informally organized sites of intersecting social relations, meanings and collective memory or officially recognized geographical entities such as cities. The geographical entity place has since the 1970’s been conceptualized as a particular location that has acquired a set of meanings and attachments. As such, place is a meaningful site that combines location, locale and sense of place.

Location refers to the geographical site of the place and should according to King not be seen as the critical element in understanding access regimes and the effectiveness of particular livelihood strategies but rather as a factor shaping livelihoods and a starting point for theorizing the complex relationships between time and space. According to King, livelihoods ought to be theorized as fluid systems entangled in horizontal and vertical linkages.

---

72 R. Kitchin, pp. 268-275.
73 R. Kitchin, p. 273.
74 T. Cresswell, p. 172.
76 T. Cresswell, p. 169.
77 B. King, p. 300.
that are constructed and reconstructed through relationships that are often spatially and temporally variable.\textsuperscript{78}

Locale includes the materiality of the place which works as a setting for social relations and include material structures such as buildings, streets, parks and so on. The physical landscape and time-space relations of places is altered over time through spatial practises that vary in their pacing, some more noticeable than others.\textsuperscript{79} One example of this functioning of space is the seasonality of tourist destinations.\textsuperscript{80} Meaning associated with place, such as the feelings and emotions a place evokes, constitutes the sense of place.\textsuperscript{81} Meanings are created, contested and open to counter meanings produced through other representations.\textsuperscript{82} When sense of place is shared then the sense is based on mediation and representation. Finally, places are practiced as people do things in place. Practice is partly responsible for the meaning a place might have, particularly the reiteration of practice on a regular basis influence the sense of place. Experience is at the heart of what place means.\textsuperscript{83} Places are however often \textit{represented} in text or pictures in such a way that only a certain sense of the place or a certain part of the locale is visible.\textsuperscript{84} The representation of place often covers inequalities and differences within places as well as veiling the relationship between a certain place and the rest of the world.\textsuperscript{85}

To give a short comment on another core concept of human geography, geographical scale provides an organizing framework for understanding the units defined as places.\textsuperscript{86} In this thesis national scale is used in the chapter contextualizing the Tibetans in India whilst the analysis focuses on local scale. Importantly to note though is that spatial relationships and place-based processes operate within and across scales.\textsuperscript{87} King problematizes the use of the household level of analysis seeing that many people construct their livelihood strategies across spatial and temporal scales.\textsuperscript{88} Livelihoods depend upon the collection of resources, the movement of labor and capital and integration to social networks, livelihoods are inherently

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\bibitem{78} B. King, p. 300.
\bibitem{79} R. Kitchin, p. 273.
\bibitem{80} R. Kitchin, p. 273.
\bibitem{81} T. Cresswell, p. 169.
\bibitem{82} T. Cresswell, p. 169.
\bibitem{83} T. Cresswell, p. 169.
\bibitem{86} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung, p.19.
\bibitem{87} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung, p.20.
\bibitem{88} B. King, pp. 297-313.
\end{thebibliography}
spatial as thus, in order to be properly understood, they require a spatial analysis.\textsuperscript{89} According to King, production and reproduction of livelihoods are interlinked with the processes producing and reproducing space.\textsuperscript{90} Places are important because they provide a site where socio-cultural processes, such as the place-based formation of ethnic-specific labor markets, to play themselves out.\textsuperscript{91}

In summation, space is in this thesis perceived as relational, meaning space is conceived to be contingent and active, as something that is produced and constructed through social relations or practises.\textsuperscript{92} Places in turn are conceptualized as a particular geographical location that has acquired a set of meanings and attachments. As such, place is a meaningful site that combines location, locale and sense of place. Places are practiced as people do things in place. Place is commonly connected with a particular identity and spatial divisions, in turn creating social divisions.\textsuperscript{93}

\subsection*{2.2 The Sustainable Livelihood Framework}

Capabilities, assets and activities required as means of living constitutes a definition of livelihood. It is in turn sustainable when it can cope with and recover from external stresses and shocks, and maintain or enhance its capabilities and assets now and in the future.\textsuperscript{94} The creation of livelihood is seen as an ongoing process where the elements included in the definition above change over time and the important characteristic being adaptability of the implementers in order to survive.\textsuperscript{95}

The combination of activities that people choose to undertake in order to achieve their livelihood goals is called livelihood strategies.\textsuperscript{96} Livelihoods are in some cases predetermined. Ascriptive livelihoods are predetermined when for example someone is born in to a certain caste which is tied to an occupation. This is still common in India even though the caste system has officially been banned.\textsuperscript{97} Inherited livelihoods are also predetermined meaning somebody is born in a family of for example pastoralists and hence inherit the livelihood

\begin{thebibliography}{99}
\bibitem{89} B. King, pp. 297-313.
\bibitem{90} B. King, pp. 297-313.
\bibitem{91} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung, p.27.
\bibitem{92} R. Kitchin, pp. 268-275.
\bibitem{93} D. Perrons, p. 225- 26.
\bibitem{95} F. Ellis, \textit{Rural Livelihoods and Diversity in Developing Countries}, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2000.
\bibitem{96} http://www.eldis.org/go/topics/dossiers/livelihoods-connect/what-are-livelihoods-approaches/livelihood-strategies, Retrieved 5\textsuperscript{th} January 2012.
\end{thebibliography}
strategy of their parents. The most interesting form of livelihoods for the purpose of this thesis is the less predetermined livelihood strategies. These are created by people responding to their social, economic and physical environment. The goals and the strategies might however differ significantly between places and individuals. The strategies include choices of productive and reproductive activities as well as investment strategies. Livelihood strategies could for example be agricultural intensification or de-escalation, livelihood diversification and/or migration. If a livelihood strategy sustains the household’s wellbeing over time without causing a heavy strain on the environment the livelihood strategy is defined as sustainable. The sustainability is hence divided into social and environmental sustainability.

To analyze livelihood strategies this thesis draws upon the Sustainable Livelihood-framework. The SL-framework is not a theory or method per se, rather it should be considered as a conceptual framework which helps researchers to think about phenomena, order material and reveal patterns. This framework is people-centered and especially useful for analysis on the household level. By using a livelihood approach one tries to understand the factors behind people’s decisions as well as the strategies they use. The framework makes it possible to identify the main factors that affect people’s livelihoods. It also takes into account the relation between people and the context in which the livelihood strategy is implemented, hence being compatible with the human geography perspective on space and place.

Choosing a livelihood strategy is a dynamic process and many people use a combination of strategies or change strategy depending on changing circumstances to meet their needs. The competition for limited resources is a principle which heavily affects the implementation and the outcome of livelihood strategies. Here, social protection provided by the state, community or NGOs might prove vital to extremely poor people when they are unable to compete with those having greater access to assets. Livelihood strategies can be changed by both internal and external factors. Internal factors might be an altered preference towards a certain job, or a

---

100 http://www.poverty-wellbeing.net/media/sla/index.htm, 5th January 2012.
drive for more wealth. Through livelihood research it has become increasingly possible to highlight intra-household differences. The problems arise when the household is seen as a homogenous unit of corresponding interests when in fact the interests of household members are not always consistent with broader family goals which are why this thesis tries to capture individual goals and strategies as well.\textsuperscript{104}

2.2.1 Using the Sustainable Livelihood Framework
The SL-framework has four main components; vulnerability context, livelihood assets, livelihood strategies and polices, institutions and processes which together leads to livelihood outcomes.\textsuperscript{105}

![Figure 1: The Sustainable Livelihood Framework.\textsuperscript{106}]

\textbf{Vulnerability context}
The external environment influence people to a great extent. People are according to the SL-framework considered to live within a vulnerability context which implies that they are exposed to risks, both through sudden shocks (violent, unexpected events such as natural disasters or economic crises and price fluctuations), stresses (changes in laws and policies) and temporal changes such as seasonality which is considered low-level environmental stress.


\textsuperscript{105} F. Owusu, 2009.

\textsuperscript{106} F. Owusu, 2009.

24
to livelihood strategies and means that the availability of resources increases or decreases depending on season. These external factors are generally impossible for people to control, forcing them instead to adapt their strategy by morphing it into a coping strategy. These coping strategies can include lending money, sales of physical assets and/or the usage of stocks. With regards to the human geographic theoretical framework of place, it is also necessary to analyze the place people live in, not just from a vulnerability perspective but also seeing possibilities and how people make use of place (practice place) in order to further their livelihood goals.

**Livelihood assets and capabilities**

People use livelihood assets and capabilities to create and implement their livelihood strategy. These capitals form the asset pentagon in the figure above and consist of five parts. Access to the assets is very important since livelihood strategies can be improved not only by increased assets but also by increasing the access to assets. Assets however are more than means to create a livelihood strategy; they are also goals in themselves. The assets give people the capability to act.

- **Human capital:** including for example skills, experience, as well as knowledge and labor productivity.
- **Natural capital:** including for example resources like land, access to water, forests, and livestock.
- **Physical capital:** including for example buildings, tools, and machinery, infrastructure, and health facilities.
- **Financial capital:** including for example savings, credit, pensions, money in hand, and remittances.
- **Social capital:** including for example the quality of relations between people and the way they work together, by ties of social obligation, reciprocal exchange, group membership, and mutual support between relatives and community members.

---

Even though these assets indeed are critical to livelihood production there is according to King a tendency to theorize them as aspatial and in overly materialistic ways that limit the understanding of how spatial processes structures and enable livelihood systems.108

Livelihood strategies
Livelihood strategies are the combination and range of activities and choices people implement and make in order to achieve their livelihood goals.

Policies, institutions, and processes
Policies, institutions, and processes are the transforming structures and processes109 such as institutions, organizations, policies and legislation that determine access to assets and choices of livelihood strategies through enhancing or restricting power.110 Policies on different government levels affect people’s decision making power and the ability to use assets in a desired way. Institutions also include informal ones such as social norms.

Livelihood outcomes
Outcomes of livelihoods are effects of the previous dimensions of the SLF framework and include more income, increased well-being, reduced vulnerability, improved food security and a more successful use of the natural resource base.111

2.2.2 Livelihood Diversification and Spatial Dispersion
Diversification is a way for many people to generate income. This diversity means switching occupation one or several times during one’s life or to engage in multiple-part time occupations in order to earn a substantial income. Another word used for this phenomenon is pluractivity and it characterizes rural as well as urban households.112

108 B. King, pp. 298.
112 F. Ellis, 2000.
Diversity refers to the existence, at one point in time, of many different income sources, thus also typically requiring diverse social relations to underpin them. Diversification, on the other hand, interprets the creation of diversity as an ongoing social and economic process, reflecting factors of both pressure and opportunity that cause families to adopt increasingly intricate and diverse livelihood strategies.\textsuperscript{113}

Here, livelihood is perceived as more than mere income. It comprises income; both cash and in kind, but also social institutions (kin, family, compound, village, and so forth), gender relations and property rights required to support and sustain a given standard of living.\textsuperscript{114} Livelihood diversification refers to the process by which households construct a diverse portfolio of activities and social support capabilities in order to survive and improve their standard of living.\textsuperscript{115} Livelihood diversification also includes access to, and benefits derived from, social and public services provided by the state such as education, health services, roads and water supplies and thus making livelihood strategies interdependent of the policies, institutions, and processes discussed above.\textsuperscript{116}

Livelihood diversification can be found on the level of the individual, the household or any larger social grouping. Occurring on the household level it could mean that each member has a single occupation.\textsuperscript{117} This way the strategy does not take away the advantages of specialization, although when diversification occurs it is necessary to problematize the notion of women’s work which is heavily connected to certain types of employment sectors. A household using diversification as a strategy might lead to women ending up in sectors were they already dominate. Interestingly though, unequal gender relations have a resilience or durability that can withstand changing forms of employment, which means that work is not just a bearer of gender roles but also an arena for unequal gender relations to be reborn.\textsuperscript{118}

There can be many reasons for households or individuals to engage in livelihood diversification including risk reduction, overcoming income instability caused by seasonality, improving food security, taking advantage of opportunities provided by nearby or more distant labor markets, generating cash in order to meet family objectives such as the education

\textsuperscript{113} F. Ellis, p. 14.
\textsuperscript{114} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{115} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{116} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{117} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{118} F. Ellis, 2000.
\textsuperscript{119} D. Perrons, p.120.
of children and, sometimes, the sheer necessity of survival following personal misfortune or natural and human disasters.\textsuperscript{119} Diversification is used by people of various socioeconomic backgrounds but for different reasons.\textsuperscript{120} Causes and consequences of diversification are differentiated in practice by location, assets, income level, opportunity, institutions and social relations; and it is therefore not surprising that these manifest themselves in different ways under different circumstances.\textsuperscript{121}

Linked to livelihood diversification is the proliferation of multi-local livelihoods which include nontraditional household living arrangements and transnational networks.\textsuperscript{122} Livelihood diversification often requires a more spatially extended understanding of the household. Through spatial dispersion of members in a household, advantage can be taken of economic opportunities in multiple rural and urban places or multiple countries. These households are referred to as divided households and comprise of members working in urban centers or abroad.

Households can also have dual or multiple residency arrangements. They may for example have an urban and a rural home which they can move between depending on season or for other reasons.\textsuperscript{123} The role of nonresident family household members in contributing to the well-being of the household is also important.\textsuperscript{124} These members include different forms of migrants such as urban migrants, circular migrants and seasonal migrants.

Migration seems to be a successful strategy, especially for those families with relatives working abroad, due to the fact that these households are able to receive remittances that usually are higher than those internal migrants are able to provide.\textsuperscript{125} The theory on spatial dispersion agrees with the opinion of Kendra McSweeny regarding spatial elasticity.\textsuperscript{126} She points out that livelihoods can appear spatially bounded but are often reproduced through the extra-local mobilization of resources and as such the character of livelihoods can often be deemed multi-sited.\textsuperscript{127}

\textsuperscript{119} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{120} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{121} F. Ellis, p. 6.
\textsuperscript{122} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{123} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{124} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{125} F. Owusu, 2009.
\textsuperscript{127} K. McSweeny, pp. 638-66.
2.2.3 Ethnicity and Spatial Congregation

Ethnicity is about difference, marked or coded in various ways. Ethnicity only becomes significant when it is juxtaposed with different groups and as such ethnicity is always a relational concept. As a collective identity it includes and excludes at the same time. Ethnicity is based upon a common (real or imagined) historical experience, ancestry or cultural commonality, for example, due to language or religion. It is important to note that even though ethnicity is used as a basis for discussion there is always an inclination to create groups and categories and to assume that they are both meaningful and homogenous implying that ethnicity is something essential while in reality ethnicity is a complex and contradictory phenomenon and we should not assume that it predicts any particular forms of economic practice or exhibits any essential characteristics. Cultural and social processes are integral to how economic processes work, but they are not necessarily determining.

However, people commonly connect a certain place with a particular identity and proceed to defend it against the threatening outside with its different identities. Niel M. Coe argues that fundamentally geographic processes create neighborhoods dominated by specific ethnic groups. Diane Perrons also made observations on how migrants often form their own communities or enclaves on the basis of ethnic or cultural identities often out of necessity or self-protection and that this can simultaneously alienate the majority population and reinforce racism and exclusionary practices. An enclave is defined as a spatially concentrated area in which members of a particular population or group, self-defined by ethnicity of religion or otherwise, congregates as a means of enhancing their economic, social, political and/or cultural development. These spatial divisions, which in turn lead to social division, are often easily identified in the urban landscape and are caused by competitive bidding for land, planning, market forces or a combination of the three. Income, abilities, needs and lifestyle

---

130 N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung, p.381.
134 T. Cresswell, p. 176.
preferences influence the way people join and leave communities. High income thus makes it possible to leave a certain area while low paid workers are forced to stay behind.\textsuperscript{138}

The creation of ethnic commercial clusters within a city such as a Chinatown, Little Italy or Little India reflects distinct spatial patterns of economic activity that shape the economic lives of residents in both positive and negative ways.\textsuperscript{139} Coe brings the spatiality of some of the assets accounted for in the SL- framework to the fore front.\textsuperscript{140} Regarding human capital such as qualifications and skills the possibility to acquire these are powerfully place-based meaning that if one, for example, grows up in a working-class community his/her chances to attend university might be slim partly due to the parents’ inability to support their child both financially and intellectually.\textsuperscript{141} Hence, place-based processes are important in determining what kind of qualifications a person will later bring to the labor market.\textsuperscript{142} The residential segregation inherent in ethnic enclaves can translate to occupational segmentation as the geographical scope of possible jobs is limited.\textsuperscript{143} Social networks, which form a part social capital and often are important in helping immigrants finding jobs, are usually local and place-based in nature and lead to a certain kind of job.\textsuperscript{144} Also, institutional barriers are constructed on the basis of administrative territory or jurisdictions and might pose impassable barriers for migrants to enter certain kinds of professions which, in the case of India, will be presented below.

The emergence of ethnic entrepreneurship and self-employment as a livelihood strategy is more common when cultural barriers to employment are difficult to surmount.\textsuperscript{145}

\textit{Co-ethnic networks may provide capital for the initial establishment of a business, and credit during its operation, but they may also provide information on how to navigate the bureaucratic intricacies of establishing a new business, market intelligence on where opportunities are to be found, as well as the suppliers, employees, and costumers that a new business needs.}\textsuperscript{146}

\textsuperscript{139} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung. 2007.
\textsuperscript{140} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung. 2007.
\textsuperscript{141} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung. 2007.
\textsuperscript{142} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung. p.386
\textsuperscript{143} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung. 2007.
\textsuperscript{144} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung. 2007.
\textsuperscript{145} N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung. p.387.
In many cases, a feature of these ethnic businesses is their congregation in spatial clusters making space to seemingly play an important part in the emergence of an ethnic economy.  

These clusters are usually located in the midst of residential neighborhoods connected to the same ethnicity where both the concentration of possible employees and costumes are high. Another advantage is the existing co-ethnic networks and resources discussed above. The cluster and neighborhood as a whole may carry an attraction for tourists, and as such, locating once business within it is a way to gain access to a wealthy tourist clientele.

**Part 3. Contextualizing India and the Tibetans residing within**

So far space, place, scale and livelihood strategies have been conceptualized within a theoretical framework grounded in previously stated ontological and epistemological assumptions. What is left is now to *contextualize* which means the placing of current events and changes in historical and spatial contexts which in turn will enhance meaning and expand our perspective. Anthony Bebbington argues that histories of places are helpful for tracing actual processes of livelihood and landscape transformation and the institutional interventions that have accompanied them.

### 3.1 The Tibet Conflict: Historical Background from 1949

After proclaiming the People’s Republic of China (PRC) in 1949 Mao Zedong and the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) started to assert control over the Tibetan regions that previously had been controlled by the Qing dynasty. Whether China has the right to Tibet or not is a much debated issue since the Chinese view differs from the West and from the opinion of the Central Tibetan Administration. In China’s opinion Tibet has for centuries belonged to China and it is currently considered that Tibetans nowadays live with considerable freedom compared to the situation when the monasteries held power. The opposite view implies that China invaded and occupied an independent country and that the CCP now are trying to assimilate the Tibetan people.

---

When China moved into Tibet the Tibetans were unprepared and their military was neither big, educated nor experienced enough to make adequate resistance. The British had left India after its independence in 1947 and they were more interested in having good relations with the PRC than assisting Tibet. After the PRC had consolidated its grip over the eastern Tibetan regions Amdo and Cham in 1950 Mao did not wish to engage in a drawn out conflict. He desired a peaceful liberation of the Tibetans from what he believed was a feudal system of oppression. Through neutralizing the Tibetan army in Chamdo while blocking the escape route to central Tibet, PRC made the governor of Chamdo capitulate in October 1950. PRC did not pursue a proper invasion in the hope that Tibet would realize the best solution were to join China peacefully. China made promises not to change the Tibetan structure of administration, to allow the Lamas and other religious leaders to continue their role and function and promised that they would not implement any reforms without the Tibetan people’s consent. The then 15 year old 14th Dalai Lama Tenzin Gyatso handed over power in 1950 but the promises from China were later to be broken. This occurred mostly during the Cultural Revolution between 1966 and 1976 when much of the traditional Tibetan culture was destroyed. In 1959 the Dalai Lama escaped from Tibet to India. According to the CTA in 1984 1, 2 million Tibetans had perished as a direct result of the Chinese occupation of Tibet. This number is readily used by the Central Tibetan Administration and various NGOs but is, in fact, hard to verify.

During the 1980’s, under Chinese party secretary Hu Yaobang, some restoration of Tibetan culture and an enlarged freedom of movement ensued. Still, demonstrations in support of the Dalai Lama around 1987 resulted in violence which reached its prime in 1989 and several demonstrators were killed. Meanwhile, the happenings at the Tiananmen Square stole the world’s attention. Relations between China and Tibet worsened further when China appointed a new Panchen Lama of their own after the one who was chosen by the Dalai Lama suddenly had disappeared.

The contemporary CCP highlights economic development to a greater extent than its predecessor as a key to solve the conflict. Massive investments have been made but as a

---

152 M. T. Kapstein, p. 280.
155 S. Roemer, p. 62.
156 M. T. Kapstein, pp. 296-297.
consequence of Chinese migrant workers moving into Tibet it has not necessarily been the Tibetans who profited from these investments.\textsuperscript{157} The challenge for China is, among other things, to make sure that the Tibetans profit from the economic development as well as the Chinese. Apart from economic development, education and healthcare also need to develop significantly. China’s rule in Tibet today is marked by well documented crimes against the human rights.\textsuperscript{158} In combination with poor education possibilities and healthcare shortages thus results in many Tibetans leaving Tibet every year.\textsuperscript{159}

3.2 The Indo- China Relationship

The relationship between India and China has been, and still is, complex due to historical reasons as well as contemporary struggles for influence and power, politically as well as economically, within the Asian region. In the 1950’s Jawaharlal Nehru (the first prime minister of India) and Chou Enlai (prime minister of China) promoted the idea of the two countries trusting each other and even agreed to a joint declaration in which they advocated Five Principles of Coexistence (\textit{pancha sheela}). Nehru’s trust was to be misused and tensions over the border areas intensified after China’s occupation of Tibet in October 1950.\textsuperscript{160} When the Dalai Lama and several thousand Tibetans fled to India in 1959 they received refuge which China considered as India supporting a group striving for Tibet to secede from China.\textsuperscript{161} In addition, China’s non-recognizing of the McMahon line, which was negotiated with Tibet and drawn by the British in 1914 to clarify the border between China and India, combined with China’s fear of India being duplicitous over Tibet were major reasons for the Indo- Chinese war in 1962.\textsuperscript{162} Much of the subsequent interaction with China has been colored by the Indo- China war which was lost by India.\textsuperscript{163}

That the Tibetan Government in Exile and the Dalai Lama still operate from India fuels suspicion from China and they believe that the riots in March 2008 were coordinated from the exile government.\textsuperscript{164} Another problematic issue is the border of Arunachal Pradesh, an eastern frontier of the Himalaya, and the town of Tawang has featured prominently in the dispute. This is because the town hosts a Tibetan monastery and it was through this town the Dalai

\textsuperscript{157} M. T. Kapstein, pp. 296- 297.
\textsuperscript{158} http://www.tibetjustice.org/reports/women/violence.html, Retrieved 10\textsuperscript{th} March 2011
\textsuperscript{160} N. DeVotta, pp. 100- 1.
\textsuperscript{161} N. DeVotta, 2010.
\textsuperscript{162} N. DeVotta, 2010.
\textsuperscript{163} N. DeVotta, pp. 100- 1.
\textsuperscript{164} N. DeVotta, 2010.
Lama travelled while fleeing Tibet. Out of the 2 600 mile long border between China and India, 2 043 miles are contested today.\textsuperscript{165} China wish India to disband the Tibetan government in exile but this is not likely seeing that India remains divided in the issue and most Indians are in general sympathetic towards the Tibetans even though some think they cause an unnecessary strain in the relationship between the two countries.\textsuperscript{166}

3.3 Geographies of India

Bustling, colorful, chaotic and serene, India is a diverse country full of paradoxes. Understanding the complex geographies of one of the world’s largest countries is extremely difficult but an overview of the geographic, economic, political and social geographies on the national level will be provided here. These geographies constitute the space in which the Tibetan livelihood strategies are taking place and are hence important parts for the contextualizing of the exile community.

3.3.1 Geography of India

India’s geographical location is in Asia and the country is considered to be a part of South Asia. India shares land borders with Pakistan in the west, China, Nepal and Bhutan in the north/northeast and Bangladesh and Burma (Myanmar) in the east. India is bounded by the Arabian Sea on the southwest, the Indian Ocean on the south and the Bay of Bengal on the southeast.\textsuperscript{167} India shares maritime borders with the Maldives to the west, Sri Lanka in the south and Thailand and Indonesia in the southeast.\textsuperscript{168} The capital of India is New Delhi while the financial capital is considered to be Mumbai (previously Bombay).

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{figure2.png}
\caption{Map of India, New Delhi/Dharamsala and Darjeeling marked out. Source: Google Maps.}
\end{figure}

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{165} N. DeVotta, pp. 110-11
\item \textsuperscript{166} N. DeVotta, p. 111.
\item \textsuperscript{167} http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/India, Retrieved 10\textsuperscript{th} March 2011.
\item \textsuperscript{168} http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/India, Retrieved 10\textsuperscript{th} March 2011.
\end{itemize}
India’s total area is 3,287,263 sq km out of which 2,973,193 sq km is land area, hence making India the seventh largest country in the world.\(^{169}\) Due to the vastness of the country the climate zones varies from tropical monsoon in the south to a temperate climate in north.\(^{170}\) The terrain shifts from mountainous areas of the Himalayas in the north, to deserts in the west and a flat to rolling plain along the river Ganges to the upland plain called Deccan Plateau in the south.\(^{171}\) The elevation varies to the extreme with the Indian Ocean obviously located on sea level and the highest point, the peak of Kanchenjunga, elevating 8,598 meters above sea level.\(^{172}\)

India’s natural capital consists mainly of the following resources: coal, iron, manganese, mica, bauxite, rare earth elements, titanium, chromite, natural gas, diamonds, petroleum, limestone and arable land.\(^{173}\)

The main natural hazards affecting India include droughts, flash floods as well as widespread and destructive flooding from monsoonal rains, severe thunderstorms and earthquakes.\(^{174}\) Current environmental issues disturbing the country are deforestation, soil erosion, overgrazing, desertification, air pollution from industrial effluents and vehicle emissions, water pollution from raw sewage and runoff of agricultural pesticides, tap water is not potable throughout the country and the huge and growing population is overstraining the natural resources.\(^{175}\)

### 3.3.2 Economic Geography of India

The Indian economy is one of the world’s most complex and dynamic in which Indians overall strive not just to make a living but also quest for an expanding standing of living for themselves and their children. India ranks 134\(^{th}\) out of 182 nations in the United Nation’s Human Development Index (HDI) while it ranks as the twelfth largest economy and fourth in terms of purchasing power parity. The economy is developing into an open market economy and since the 1990’s economic liberalization has taken place which has included industrial deregulation, privatization of state-owned enterprises, and reduced controls on foreign trade

---


India’s economy is diverse and encompasses traditional village farming, modern agriculture, handicrafts, a wide range of modern industries, and a multitude of services. The agricultural products produced in India are mainly rice, wheat, oilseed, cotton, jute, tea, sugarcane, lentils, dairy and meat products, onions and potatoes. The industries are active in producing and processing textiles, chemicals, foods, steel, transportation equipment, cement, mining, petroleum, machinery, software and pharmaceuticals.

The Indian labor force consists of 478.3 million people out of whom 52% work within agriculture, 14% within industry and 34% within services. Even though slightly more than half of the work force is engaged in agricultural activities, services comprise the foremost source of economic growth. Hence, the rise of the gross domestic product (GDP) of about 8-9% per year has mostly benefitted people working in the service industry which is a sector from which women are disproportionately excluded. The educated English-speaking population has been able to carve out a livelihood as exporters of information technology services and software workers. The unemployment rate is estimated to 10.8%.

GDP (composition by sector):
- Agriculture: 16.1%
- Industry: 28.6%
- Services: 55.3% (2010 est.)

The organized economy compounds of a minority of India’s population seeing as many work outside of the organized sector of the economy in the so called informal sector. This sector is vast and provides occupation in the most diverse ways including everything from tea vendors

---

and vegetables sellers to rickshaw drivers, shop keepers and construction workers.\textsuperscript{187} These workers all have in common the uncertainty regarding legal protection, contracts, lack of pensions and benefits. Many are required to pay informal rents and rely on their ability to pay bribes to avoid being harassed by authorities.\textsuperscript{188}

It is estimated that 42\% of the Indians live below the poverty line of USD 1.25 per day and women are overrepresented among these people.\textsuperscript{189} This reflects the marginal place women hold in the economy of India. Women are often employed in the agricultural and unorganized (informal) sector. It is important to note that the situation of women in India cannot solely be attributed to so-called “traditional” social norms which often are the given reason.\textsuperscript{190} However, urban and college- educated young women have also seen new employment opportunities emerge. In the last fifteen years the number of women working in India within service-sector jobs has more than doubled.\textsuperscript{191}

According to numbers from 1999, 52\% of the Indian males participated in the labour force, a number which did not vary much between regions.\textsuperscript{192} Out of the women on the other hand only 22\% were full- time workers, largely because they were active in their households as mothers, cleaners, and cookers.\textsuperscript{193} These contributions in the households are not accounted for or measured in active labour force or GNP statistics. There are great differences between the states of India reflecting regional attitudes towards women. In states where the women are above average regarding educational and literacy levels women have higher participation rates in the labour force. In such states fertility rates and population growth rates are also lower. Especially in the northern states women’s participation is lower.\textsuperscript{194}

In 2010, the Indian economy rebounded from the global financial crisis, largely due to strong domestic demands, resulting in the growth exceeding 8\% year-on-year in real terms and the merchandise exports also returned to pre-financial crisis levels.\textsuperscript{195} The inflation peaked at about 11\% in the first half of 2010 due to industrial expansion and high food prices but has

\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{187} N. DeVotta, 2010.
\item\textsuperscript{188} N. DeVotta, 2010.
\item\textsuperscript{189} N. DeVotta, p. 147 and http://hdrstats.undp.org/en/countries/profiles/IND.html, Retrieved 5\textsuperscript{th} September 2011.
\item\textsuperscript{190} N. DeVotta, pp. 181- 2.
\item\textsuperscript{191} N. DeVotta, 2010.
\item\textsuperscript{192} N. DeVotta, 2010.
\item\textsuperscript{193} N. DeVotta, 2010.
\item\textsuperscript{194} N. DeVotta, 2010.
\item\textsuperscript{195} N. DeVotta, pp. 181-82.
\end{itemize}
since decreased following a series of central bank interest rate hikes. The high food prices were caused from the combined effects of the weak 2009 monsoon and inefficiencies in the government’s food distribution system.\textsuperscript{196} The long term threats and challenges affecting the Indian economy include widespread poverty, inadequate physical and social infrastructure, limited non-agricultural employment opportunities, insufficient access to quality basic and higher education, and accommodating rural-to-urban migration.\textsuperscript{197}

\begin{quote}
Underutilization of women’s effort and talent is one reason why India’s economy lags and is ill prepared for global competition, which depends on productivity, innovation, and overall high levels of education for both women and men.\textsuperscript{198}
\end{quote}

As can be seen below India’s debt-equity ratio is high with their expenditures higher than revenues:

Budget: revenues: $170.7 billion\textsuperscript{199}
Expenditures: $268 billion (2010 est.)
GDP (Purchasing Power parity): $ 4.06 trillion (2010 est.)\textsuperscript{200}
GDP (per capita): $ 3,500 (2010 est.)\textsuperscript{201}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income indicator</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>GDP per capita in PPP terms (Constant 2005 international $)</td>
<td>2,993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GNI per capita in PPP terms (constant 2005 international $) (Constant 2005 international $)</td>
<td>3,468</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


3.3.3 Political and Social Geographies of India

The political history of the Indian sub-continent is complex and the nation-state we know as India has only existed in its present form since the 15\textsuperscript{th} of August 1947 when India (and

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{196} N. DeVotta, pp. 181-82.
\item\textsuperscript{197} N. DeVotta, pp. 181-82.
\item\textsuperscript{198} N. DeVotta, pp. 135.
\item\textsuperscript{199} https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/in.html, Retrieved 10\textsuperscript{th} October 2011.
\item\textsuperscript{200} https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/in.html, Retrieved 10\textsuperscript{th} October 2011.
\item\textsuperscript{201} https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/geos/in.html, Retrieved 10\textsuperscript{th} October 2011.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
around the same time Pakistan) received independence from British colonial power.202 Today, India is the largest constitutional democracy with a parliamentary system of governance in the world.203 Most Indians today maintain a deep philosophical commitment to democracy and embrace the fundamental idea that state authority must derive solely from the non-coerced consent of the majority, tested regularly through open, competitive elections.204 Still, corruption and violence is all too common and socioeconomic inequalities are persistent.205

The Constitution of India, adopted in 1950, proclaimed India as a sovereign federal democracy and embodied the citizens’ fundamental rights which even today take precedence over any other law.206 One of these civil rights is the right to own and sell property which will be proven relevant in regards of Tibetans.207 In the Indian Constitution the “minorities” are given the right to establish and administer their own educational institutions and to preserve a distinct language, script and culture.208 The national governance comprises of three key institutions; the executive (composed by the President and the council of ministers), the Parliament, and the Supreme Court. Even though executive power is formally vested in the President (who is the head of state) the power, both in theory and practice, is concentrated in the Prime Minister making him/her, the de facto head of the executive branch.209 This is because the president exercises executive powers on the advice of the Council of Ministers, which is headed by the Prime Minister. The supreme legislative body of the country is the Parliament which consists of a two-house legislature made up of the Lok Sabha (House of the People- the lower house) and the Rajya Sabha (Council of States- the upper house). Seats in the Lok Sabha are allotted among the states on basis of population.210

The power to make decisions regarding policies is concentrated at the highest levels of authority, with the Prime Minister, his or her cabinet, and high-level officials and bureaucrats (through their control of the various government ministries) taking the initiative. The primary responsibility to draft legislation and introduce bills into either house of Parliament lies with the government although financial bills for taxing and spending (known as money bills) only

203 N. DeVotta, p. 67.
204 N. DeVotta, pp. 67-68.
can be introduced in the Lok Sabha. Even though significant legislative powers lies within the central government power is also divided between the central government and the states.\textsuperscript{211} The highest legal tribunal is the Supreme Court making it the ultimate interpreter and guardian of the constitution and the laws of the land.\textsuperscript{212}

The social geography of India is impossible to generalize because the states differ profoundly regarding ethnicities, religion, social norms and practices. Below only the most general statistics will be presented.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Health indicator</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Under-five mortality rate (per 1,000 live births) (%)</td>
<td>6.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life expectancy at birth (years)</td>
<td>65.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Education indicator</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expected Years of Schooling (of children) (years)</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adult literacy rate, both sexes (% aged 15 and above)</td>
<td>62.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean years of schooling (of adults) (years)</td>
<td>4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Combined gross enrolment in education (both sexes) (%)</td>
<td>62.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demography indicator</th>
<th>Value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population, total both sexes (thousands)</td>
<td>1241492</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population, urban (%) (% of population)</td>
<td>30.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population, female (thousands)</td>
<td>600477.34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Population, male (thousands)</td>
<td>641014.62</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


\textsuperscript{211} N. DeVotta, p. 71.  
\textsuperscript{212} N. DeVotta, p. 70.
3.4 Contextualizing Tibetan Settlements in India

According to the international law on refugees the ‘UN Convention on Refugees’ a political refugee is a person:

(...) who is outside of his nationality, or if he has no nationality, the country of his formal habitual residence because he has or had well-founded fear of his persecution by reason of his race, religion, nationality or political opinion or is unable or, because of such fear, is unwilling to avail himself of the protection of government of the country of his nationality, or, if he has no nationality, to return to the country of his former habitual residence.\(^{213}\)

Even if a country has ratified the Geneva Convention it is up each country to either recognize certain people as refugees or not.\(^{214}\) In the case of India, the United Nations Refugee Convention from 1951 and its Protocol from 1967 has not been signed and India lacks a refugee protection framework.\(^{215}\) Still, asylum is granted to refugees from neighboring states and India respects UNHCR's mandate for other nationals. The Indian government protects and assists Tibetans\(^{216}\) but the legal status of the Tibetans in India depends on the year of their arrival.\(^{217}\) Tibetans who arrived before 1962 are officially considered political refugees according to the aforementioned UN criteria. This status provides them and their children with access to the formal Indian economic sector, such as job opportunities with the Government of India (GOI) and entrance to Indian universities. Entering India after 1962 entails several educational and professional disadvantages since these Tibetans are considered to be foreigners of Tibetan nationality.\(^{218}\) If over 18 years of age, Tibetans need to hold a Registration Certificate (RC) that is issued under the Foreigners Registration Act of 1946. The RC is valid for only one year after which an application for extension must be approved by the GOI ensuring that Tibetans are unable to settle permanently in India. This insecurity causes considerable instability for the Tibetans in terms of investment in housing, employment and schooling. It is possible for Tibetans to apply for Indian citizenship but this is discouraged by the CTA.\(^{219}\)

\(^{213}\) S. Roemer, p. 36.
\(^{214}\) S. Roemer, p. 37.
\(^{216}\) http://www.unhcr.org/cgi-bin/texis/vtx/page?page=49e4876d6, Retrieved 10\(^{th}\) October 2011
\(^{217}\) S. Roemer, p. 62.
\(^{218}\) S. Roemer, p. 62.
\(^{219}\) S. Roemer, p. 62.
After an agreement between the Indian government and the Dalai Lama two large transit camps were built in Missamari and Buxa in West Bengal the 1960’s to handle the influx of Tibetan refugees.\textsuperscript{220} Nehru in turn gave the Tibetan problem high priority on the domestic political agenda since this was favorable for himself and contributed to rebuild the trust and support of the local Indian population.\textsuperscript{221} Many Tibetans joined the Indian Special Frontier Force which fought in the Sino-Indian war in 1962.\textsuperscript{222} The Tibetans were suited for the mission due to their ability to work in high altitude environments and their motivation to fight the Chinese. This was followed by the establishment of other temporary camps such as Balukpon, Tuting, Sandeo/Bhakawa and Tak Menthang. In the camps free clothing, food and medical facilities were available but still many refugees died of sicknesses\textsuperscript{223} such as tuberculosis.\textsuperscript{224} On the request of the Dalai Lama the Indian government approved of the proposed move of the camps to cooler places such as Shimla and Kullu in Himachal Pradesh.\textsuperscript{225} A common livelihood strategy for the refugees, both male and female, during this time were to work as laborers at road construction sites in the areas of Shimla, Champa, Kullu and Kangra. This work was also common in Ladakh and neighboring countries Bhutan and Nepal. The work was dangerous and parents often had to bring their children along.\textsuperscript{226}

International aid along with Indian aid was, and still is, of utmost importance to the Tibetans in exile. When the likelihood of finding an imminent solution had faded focus shifted to finding long-term solutions.\textsuperscript{227} The Government of India wanted to disperse the Tibetans around the country as a measure against them organizing against the Chinese.\textsuperscript{228} The Tibetans were however not assimilated into the Indian culture. Nehru asked the state governments about availability of land for resettlement purposes. Karnataka State government (then called Mysore) agreed to lease 3000 acres of land to the Tibetans. The settlement was named Lugsum SamdupLing.\textsuperscript{229} In Tibet most people were farmers and nomadic pastoralists but

\textsuperscript{220} The Tibet Museum, \textit{Tibet’s Journey in Exile}, Dharamsala, 2008, p. 31.  
\textsuperscript{221} S. Roemer, p. 64.  
\textsuperscript{222} S. Roemer, p. 64.  
\textsuperscript{223} The Tibet Museum, p. 31.  
\textsuperscript{225} The Tibet Museum, p. 31.  
\textsuperscript{226} The Tibet Museum, pp. 31-33.  
\textsuperscript{227} S. Roemer, p. 68.  
\textsuperscript{228} S. Roemer, 2008.  
\textsuperscript{229} The Tibet Museum, p. 34.
were in India forced to adapt to new circumstances and learn new skills in order to survive. Residents of Lugsum SamdupLing pursued agriculture and with these revenues the refugees expanded their livelihood strategies to include sweater-selling ventures, restaurants, and shops. Interestingly, some Indian politicians expected an economic development of backward rural areas through the resettlement of Tibetans there. In the tourist and transport sectors indirect economic spill-over effects have been noticed due to that the segments expanded with the influx of western tourists in later years.

More agricultural-based settlements were built in south India but, and although relatively successful in rehabilitating Tibetan refugees into life in India, there was not enough land available for new arrivals and so other sustainment alternatives were needed. What can be seen here are the lacks in spatial planning, which in turn made diversification necessary. Small-scale industries and the production of Tibetan handicrafts proved an answer. The industries were meant to be rather simple and hence not requiring much training of the employees. The Tibetan Industrial Rehabilitation Society was founded in 1965 and they established for example the Woolen Mill in Bir (Kangra) and tea estates in Bir and Chauntra. A craft community in Dharamsala was also established. Handicraft centers consisted of both new ways of sustainment and a possibility to preserve the Tibetan culture in the forms of traditional handicraft. The first exile handicraft center in India was the Dalhousie Tibetan handicraft center, established in 1959. The CTA was able to dominate the resettlement process due to its access to international supporters and the aid provided by them. By 1990 nearly five thousand Tibetans had resettled abroad. An estimated number of 101,242 Tibetans currently reside in India. The Department of Home has established 58 Tibetan settlements in India, Nepal and Bhutan. 39 are located in India, 12 in Nepal and 7 in Bhutan administered through 43 local Tibetan administrative offices. The Department of Home works in close cooperation with the Government of India and NGOs involved in helping

---

231 The Tibet Museum, p. 40.
232 S. Roemer, p. 69.
233 B. King, p. 303.
235 The Tibet Museum, p. 41.
236 The Tibet Museum, p. 41.
237 S. Roemer, p. 72.
238 The Tibet Museum, p. 42.
239 Department of Information and International Relations, Introduction to the Central Tibetan Administration, Dharamsala, 2011.
240 Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, p. 13.
Tibetans to improve their livelihoods.241 The settlements are assisted by the Government of India and several voluntary aid organizations apart from the Central Tibetan Administration.242 The official Tibetan settlements are sorted according to whether they are agricultural-based, handicraft/industrial-based or they are considered scattered communities.243

Figure 3: Types of Settlements.244

3.4.1 Administration and Leadership in the Exile Community

In April 1959 the 14th Dalai Lama re-established the Tibetan administration in Mussoorie which in May 1960 was moved to Dharamsala. The Central Tibetan Administration, known to many as the Tibetan government in exile, is not formally recognized by any country as the representatives of Tibetans living in Tibet. Neither the Government of India has recognized the legitimacy of the CTA even though they cooperate extensively regarding practical matters such as resettlement of the Tibetans in India.245 Many Tibetans both inside and outside of

241 Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, p. 12.
244 http://www.ctrc.tibet.net/settlements.html, Retrieved 5th January 2012.
245 S. Roemer, p. 64.
Tibet consider the CTA as their representatives\textsuperscript{246} although not all.\textsuperscript{247} The CTA is portraying itself as the \textit{de facto} government of Tibet even though it does not rule over either people or a defined territory. \textit{The CTA exists as organization within the Indian Union and therefore depends on the goodwill of the host}.\textsuperscript{248} The success of the exile community in terms of organizational unity, stability and the resettlement of thousands of Tibetans depended, and still depend, a lot on patterns of pre-exile leadership and organizational structures.\textsuperscript{249}

The CTA has been interacting with the Government of India on behalf of the Tibetan community since the beginning of the period in exile as well as being the sole representative of the Tibetan community in contact with international NGO. CTA’s role as a representative of the Tibetan community is rarely questioned. Stephanie Roemer extensively analyzes the CTA’s claim of being democratic and comes to the conclusion that the CTA aims to function according to Western secular concepts of democracy but that democracy has not been fully achieved in the CTA structures.\textsuperscript{250}

Under the CTA different departments have been created in order to deal with different issues. The Financial Department was set up in 1969 with the purpose of creating sufficient financial means for the Tibetan administration to be self-supporting.\textsuperscript{251} Currently there are seven departments: Department of Religion and Culture, Department of Home, Department of Finance, Department of Education, Department of Health, Department of Security and Department of Information and International Relations.\textsuperscript{252} There are also three independent bodies, the Election Commission, the Public Service Commission and the Office of the Auditor General.

On the 2 of September 1960 a parliament, then called the Commission of Tibetan People’s Deputies (CTPD), was instituted by the 14\textsuperscript{th} Dalai Lama in order to bring about democratic changes in the administration.\textsuperscript{253} The CTPD developed to a legislative body, coming to be known as the Assembly of the Tibetan People’s Deputies (ATPD). Since 2006, ATPD has

\textsuperscript{246} The Tibet Museum, p. 89.
\textsuperscript{247} S. Roemer, 2008.
\textsuperscript{248} S. Roemer, p. 88.
\textsuperscript{249} S. Roemer, p. 90.
\textsuperscript{250} S. Roemer, 2004.
\textsuperscript{251} Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, p. 14-15.
\textsuperscript{252} The Tibet Museum, p. 89.
\textsuperscript{253} The Tibet Museum, p. 89.
formally been addressed as Tibetan Parliament-in-Exile (TPiE). Further democratic progress was made in May 1990 when the Dalai Lama instigated reforms dissolving the ATPD and Kashag (Tibetan Cabinet), of which members until then had been chosen by the Dalai Lama himself. This was followed by an election in the same year where exiled Tibetans living in the Indian sub-continent and more than 33 other countries elected 43 of 46 members to the expanded Eleventh Assembly of the Tibetan People’s Deputies. The Dalai Lama appointed the other three while he was the formal head of state. The Supreme Justice Commission was also instituted.

46 elected members comprise the parliament and U-tsang, Kham and Amdo, the three traditional provinces of Tibet, elect ten members each with at least two female candidates while four members are elected by Tibetans living in the West; two from Europe and two from North America. The four schools of Tibetan Buddhism and the traditional Bön faith elects two members each. This system is implemented to ensure that the interests of these groups are properly represented. The CTA is subjected to their own constitution in addition to the Indian constitution and laws. The Tibetan constitution is called The Charter of Tibetans in Exile. The Charter Tibetans-in-exile is the constitution of the exile population and it is the supreme law governing the functions of the exile Tibetan administration. It is based on the spirit of UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights and guarantees equality for all Tibetans before the law. It ensures fundamental rights and freedom without discrimination on the basis of sex, religion, race, language and social origin.

In the charter detailed guidelines on the functioning of the CTA with respect to those living in exile can be found along with the protection of freedom of speech, belief, assembly and movement. The charter was amended in 2001 to provide for the direct election of the Kalon Tripa (Executive chief elected directly by the exile community to serve a term of five years) by the exile population. The first directly elected Kalon Tripa-Samdhong Rinpoche-took oath to office on 5th September 2001 and was re-elected in August 2006. During the

254 Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, p. 12.
255 Department of Information and International Relations, 2011.
256 The Tibet Museum, p. 92.
257 Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, pp. 7-8.
258 Department of Information and International Relations, 2011.
259 The Tibet Museum, p. 92.
260 Department of Information and International Relations, 2011.
261 Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, p. 3.
spring of 2011 an election was held were Lobsang Sangay was elected Kalon Tripa.\textsuperscript{262} In turn, the Kalon Tripa nominates candidates for the post of other Kalons (ministers) and seeks the parliament approval for their appointment.\textsuperscript{263} Since 11\textsuperscript{th} March 2011\textsuperscript{264} the Dalai Lama renounced any formal political authority, which in terms of democracy, was an important step forward.\textsuperscript{265} He has formally announced to the Assembly of Tibetan People's Deputies his intention to transfer all his administrative and political powers and responsibilities to the elected leaders of the Central Tibetan Administration.\textsuperscript{266} However, he is still officially the symbol and protector of the nation and will continue to meet with world leaders and speak on behalf of the Tibetan people as well as to appoint representatives and envoys hence going against basic democratic principles.\textsuperscript{267}

Any Tibetan aged 18 or above is entitled to vote. In the elections to the parliament any Tibetan aged 25 or above is eligible to contest.\textsuperscript{268} At the grass-root level people have the right to either elect their own local administrator or request the Department of home to appoint one.\textsuperscript{269}

The following three major areas where development is necessary have been pointed out by the CTA:\textsuperscript{270}

1. Improved means of educational, health and economic opportunities that enable Tibetans to maintain their culture and traditions.
2. Effective secular and non-secular institutions that uphold the unique Tibetan culture and traditions and inculcate Tibetan identity by providing a sound basis for achieving individual and collective aspirations.
3. Improving living conditions with accessible fundamental and basic education and other opportunities to join the mainstream programs.

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{footnotes}
\item[262] http://www.tibetsociety.com/content/view/164 Retrieved 10\textsuperscript{th} February 2011.
\item[263] Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, p. 9.
\item[268] Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, p. 8.
\item[269] Department of Information and International Relations, 2011, p. 12.
\item[270] The Tibet Museum, p. 89.
\end{footnotes}
\end{footnotesize}
3.4.2 Economics in Exile

The Tibetan settlements of India were designed to become self-sufficient agricultural and handicraft economies for a limited time with the hope of the Tibet situation being solved. However, the settlements have now become permanent and integration into the overall Indian economy has proven necessary.\textsuperscript{271} The revenues of the CTA have constantly increased despite the economic bottleneck in the early 1960’s. This is largely due to the CTA’s ability to raise international economic support which is then channeled through its structures. This means that the CTA can use the control over economic resources in order to secure loyalty from exiled individuals and organizations that otherwise would be excluded from financial support.\textsuperscript{272}

In the beginning of the exile period Indian aid was essential but now international aid has become more important.\textsuperscript{273} The monetary transfers continually improve the standard of living of the exile Tibetans. There are many Tibetans who live in better conditions than the local Indian and Nepali population.\textsuperscript{274} This paradox between their relative wealth and the anticipated picture of displaced people and refugees considerably affect the credibility of their economically aided needs. Another critical aspect regarding the international financial help is the absence of an independently functioning exile Tibetan economic sector and a widely communicated economic self-sufficiency.\textsuperscript{275} Roemer argues that the dependency on foreign aid has a considerable impact in discouraging the development of a properly working economic sector.\textsuperscript{276}

Tibetans have been creating their livelihoods in sectors which were not centrally planned and the core of the Tibetan exile economy has lain in the informal economy. Especially during the 1970s and 1980s the exiles hence created the “sweater-business” which proved more lucrative than the planned economic activities. Hand-knitted sweaters were made and sold during the cold season (October-February) and as business grew Tibetans started to buy machine-made sweaters in bulk from factories. Out of season most returned to settled activities such as agriculture and so created a diversification of livelihoods. Others went on with year round trade targeting tourists and pilgrims. The innovative trade made the Tibetan diaspora

\textsuperscript{271} D. Bernstoff & H. von Welck, p. 209.
\textsuperscript{272} S. Roemer, pp. 118-119.
\textsuperscript{273} S. Roemer, 2004.
\textsuperscript{274} S. Roemer, p. 119.
\textsuperscript{275} S. Roemer, p. 119.
\textsuperscript{276} S. Roemer, p. 120.
economically better off compared to the average Indian peasants thus showing the advantage of diversification.277

The rapidly growing population is one of the greatest problems in the settlements due to increased birthrate in the community and constant arrival of new refugees/migrants. The result is a strain on the already fragile economy and infrastructure of the settlements. The housing facilities, sanitation, health clinics, schools and other facilities are no longer equipped to deal with the number of people currently residing within the settlements.278 These, among other reasons, lay behind the increased migration from the settlements.279 Furthermore, there are practical consequences since Tibetans in India have access to limited leasehold land and the dependency ratio is high due the need to support the young and the monastic community. Therefore the desire to be self-sufficient is yet to be realized.280

Change in occupational structure is closely related to generational changes. The mind-set, literacy levels, the know-how and the external exposures of present generation is different from the previous generation. Between the two demographic surveys, a significant number of widespread civil society movements have been recorded in the growth of NGOs in unprecedented fashion. During the period (1998-2009) a more educated population has joined these societies and NGOs rather than the CTA and its affiliated organizations. A steady growth is also recorded within household industries, informal business (mainly sweater selling business) and teaching professions.281

Tibetans has overall transacted and integrated in the lower (often informal) levels of the Indian economy but Roemer predicts that the new generation is increasingly likely to face serious problems of employment and economic activities suited to their education and skills unless they integrate their economy and employment with the larger economic systems beyond the settlements.282

Regarding the Tibetan exile community on a national scale, here including Tibetans in South Asia (India, Nepal and Bhutan) due to that they are accounted for together in the demographic

279 The Tibet Museum, p. 42.
280 Ibid.
282 D. Bernstoff & H. von Welck, p. 211.
survey of 2009 (TDS’09), there has been a shift from the earlier resettlement programs focused primarily on agricultural activities towards a more diversified tertiary sector.\textsuperscript{283} Only 8.1\% of the Tibetan workforce in South Asia\textsuperscript{284} has farming as their primary activity compared to 22.5\% 1998.\textsuperscript{285}

**Workforce status of the Tibetans (15-64 years)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>14 135</td>
<td>10 048</td>
<td>24 183</td>
<td>2 225</td>
<td>2 290</td>
<td>4 515</td>
<td>18 247</td>
<td>13 270</td>
<td>31 517</td>
<td>2 225</td>
<td>2 290</td>
<td>4 515</td>
<td>18 247</td>
<td>13 270</td>
<td>31 517</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>1 690</td>
<td>1 151</td>
<td>2 841</td>
<td>389</td>
<td>562</td>
<td>951</td>
<td>2 159</td>
<td>2 839</td>
<td>4 998</td>
<td>389</td>
<td>562</td>
<td>951</td>
<td>2 159</td>
<td>2 839</td>
<td>4 998</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>251</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>516</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>16 076</td>
<td>11 464</td>
<td>27 540</td>
<td>2 642</td>
<td>2 883</td>
<td>5 525</td>
<td>20 508</td>
<td>16 247</td>
<td>36 755</td>
<td>20 508</td>
<td>16 247</td>
<td>36 755</td>
<td>5 525</td>
<td>18 247</td>
<td>36 755</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: TDS ’09 2010:53 table no 29

In total, the workforce population consists 75 031 individuals out of which 27 540 are workers, 5 525 are marginal workers, 36 755 are non-workers and 5 211 are not respondents.\textsuperscript{286} The CTA defines the workforce, generally, as one consisting of the population aged 15-64 since they are mostly likely to be engaged in economically gainful activities.\textsuperscript{287} In the statistics of the demographic survey of 2009 participation in any economically productive activity is considered work while performing household chores are not.\textsuperscript{288} The workforce population is in turn divided into main workers, marginal worker and non-workers. An individual is considered a main worker if she or he has worked for more than 183 days or 6 months during the reference period, although not necessarily at a stretch or continuously. A marginal worker is an individual who worked less than the aforementioned period while individuals who did not engage themselves in any economically productive activity throughout the reference period are considered as non-workers.\textsuperscript{289}

\textsuperscript{283} TDS’09, 2010, p. 14.
\textsuperscript{284} TDS’09, 2010, p. 56.
\textsuperscript{286} TDS’09, 2010, p. 53.
\textsuperscript{287} TDS’09, 2010, p. 53.
\textsuperscript{288} TDS’09, 2010, p. 53.
\textsuperscript{289} TDS’09, 2010, p. 53.
Totally, the workforce population consist of 70,031 individuals out of which 27,540 are main workers, 5,525 marginal workers, 36,755 non-workers and 5,211 did not respond. Out of the workforce population who responded regarding their capacity utilization rate 30,594 are female, 39,226 are male. As can be seen in the table below, the female to male ratio of workforce participation is close to India.

**Workforce participation (%)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Male</th>
<th>Female</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>48</strong></td>
<td><strong>47</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: TDS '09 2010:53, fig 19

A further look into the economically productive activities performed by the main and marginal workforce on the national level will now be provided. In TDS '09 respondents were asked to list their primary source of income if an individual had more than one job. Hence, analyzing the importance of diversification on individual level is hard due to lack of data.

**Economic activity of the main and marginal workers**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Cultivator</th>
<th>Sweater seller</th>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>CTA/alike service</th>
<th>NGO service</th>
<th>Household industry</th>
<th>Health service</th>
<th>Others</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>2,337</td>
<td>4,714</td>
<td>2,018</td>
<td>2,993</td>
<td>757</td>
<td>872</td>
<td>1,534</td>
<td>9,603</td>
<td>3,870</td>
<td>698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>329</td>
<td>177</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>338</td>
<td>141</td>
<td>1,812</td>
<td>736</td>
<td>3,792</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>233</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>137</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,673</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,762</strong></td>
<td><strong>2,352</strong></td>
<td><strong>3,173</strong></td>
<td><strong>882</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,285</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,680</strong></td>
<td><strong>11,552</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,706</strong></td>
<td><strong>6,065</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Percent</strong></td>
<td><strong>8.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>14.4</strong></td>
<td><strong>7.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>9.6</strong></td>
<td><strong>2.7</strong></td>
<td><strong>3.9</strong></td>
<td><strong>5.1</strong></td>
<td><strong>34.9</strong></td>
<td><strong>14.2</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: TDS '09 2010:56, table no 34

---

290 TDS’09, 2010, p. 58.
### Economic activity of the main and marginal workers (male)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Cultivator</th>
<th>Sweater seller</th>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>CTA/alike service</th>
<th>NGO service</th>
<th>Household industry</th>
<th>Health service</th>
<th>Others</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>1 035</td>
<td>2 240</td>
<td>1 061</td>
<td>2 226</td>
<td>502</td>
<td>430</td>
<td>694</td>
<td>5 990</td>
<td>2 182</td>
<td>16 360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>189</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>1 066</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>2 079</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>279</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1 189</td>
<td>2 260</td>
<td>1 254</td>
<td>2 334</td>
<td>565</td>
<td>668</td>
<td>755</td>
<td>7 124</td>
<td>2 569</td>
<td>18 718</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>6.7</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>38.1</td>
<td>13.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: TDS '09 2010:56, table no 35*

*Table no 35 is misprinted as a copy of the total number of main and marginal workers in the TDS '09, hence I have created this table by subtracting the statistics of the female workforce from the total number.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Cultivator</th>
<th>Sweater seller</th>
<th>Teacher</th>
<th>CTA/alike service</th>
<th>NGO service</th>
<th>Household industry</th>
<th>Health service</th>
<th>Others</th>
<th>Unknown</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>1 302</td>
<td>2 474</td>
<td>957</td>
<td>767</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>442</td>
<td>840</td>
<td>3 613</td>
<td>1 688</td>
<td>12 338</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>133</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>746</td>
<td>403</td>
<td>1713</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1 484</td>
<td>2 502</td>
<td>1 098</td>
<td>839</td>
<td>317</td>
<td>617</td>
<td>925</td>
<td>4 428</td>
<td>2 137</td>
<td>14 347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>30.9</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: TDS '09 2010:57, table no 36

**Cultivators** are individuals engaged either as employers, single workers or as family workers in the cultivation of land no matter whether the land is owned by the household to which the person relates. There are 2 673 cultivators amounting to 8.1 % of the working Tibetan population in exile in South Asia. There are more women than men engaged as cultivators, 10.3 % females compared to 6.4 % males.

**Sweater sellers** are Tibetans engaging in the selling of hosiery and garments during the winter season of the year, often including migration to various towns and cities of India. The sweater-selling season usually begins in September and runs through the end of January. 14.4 % of the total working population is occupied with sweater-selling with a higher participation rate among the females (17.4 % as opposed to 12.1 % for males).
**Teachers:** There are 2 352 individuals working as teachers in the exile community in South Asia which equals 7.1 % of the working population. There are a slightly higher percentage of women, 7.7 %, working in this occupation than men, 6.7 %.

**CTA/Alike services:** This category includes all the civil servants of Central Tibetan Administration (CTA) and its affiliated offices such as the settlement offices. The CTA has had a significant role as employer of the Tibetan working population resulting in that 3 173 Tibetans, or 9.6 % of the working population, is employed within the CTA and its allied/affiliated offices. The male participation within these services is significantly higher with a participation rate of 12.5 % compared to 5.8 % amongst women.

**NGO service:** In various settlement locations there are a number of non-governmental organizations (NGOs) that employ 882 Tibetans. Out of these, the male participation rate is 3 % while the female participation rate is 2.2 %.

**Household industry:** A household industry must fulfill the four criteria: 1) be ran by the head of household and members of household, 2) be located within the premises of the settlement or within the premises of the residential houses; 3) the majority of the workers must consist of household members and lastly 4) it should not be run on the scale of a registered factory.

3.9 %, or 1285 individuals, of the total working population are engaged in the household industry work. Proportionately speaking, there are more females participating in this work category (4.3 %) as opposed to 3.6 % amongst the males. The most common household industry is running a restaurant followed by carpet industries. Others household industries are incense making, apron making, import and export business, carpentry/woodcarving, thangka painting, noodle making, gold/silver/blacksmith, souvenir shop, tailoring and food processing.

**Health services:** The category includes doctors, nurses and health workers. There are 1 680 people engaged in this work category amounting to more than 5 % of the entire working population.

---

294 TDS’09, 2010, p. 56.
295 TDS’09, 2010, p. 56.
296 TDS’09, 2010, p. 57.
297 TDS’09, 2010, p. 57.
298 TDS’09, 2010, p. 57.
population. Nursing is one of the more popular job careers among the Tibetan women and as such there is a higher number of female participants within this working category both in terms of numbers (925 females as opposed to 755 males) and also in terms of proportion to the working population (6.4 % of females as against 4 % of the male working population).  

**Others:** This final category includes workers who are not covered under the aforementioned categories of workers. It includes traders or merchants; professionals; shop and restaurant owners and workers, travel agents, beauticians, call center workers and so on that are not included in the household industry category. Almost 35 % of the entire working population belongs to this set of categories of workers with around 38.1 % participation rate among males and 30.9 % among the female working population.  

**Class of workers**

Workers are classified according to four categories: employer, employee, single worker and family worker. Single workers are those who are self-employed while family workers include individuals who work for a family run business without receiving wages in cash or kind.  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Class of workers</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Employer</th>
<th>Employee</th>
<th>Single worker</th>
<th>Family</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>1 384</td>
<td>10 376</td>
<td>3 337</td>
<td>6 484</td>
<td>21 581</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>340</td>
<td>1 513</td>
<td>679</td>
<td>318</td>
<td>2850</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>368</td>
<td>493</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>1 725</td>
<td>11 915</td>
<td>4 114</td>
<td>7 170</td>
<td>24 924</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: TDS '09 2010:59, table 38

Non-workers are in turn divided in five categories and on the national level (South Asia) there are 17 824 students, 4 558 household workers, 4 586 dependents, 164 pensioners and 3 130 others. In addition 5 599 individuals are accounted for as not reported or misreported.

There are gendered differences to be found in these statistics on the national level especially regarding the percentage of women (24 %) compared to men (4 %) that engage only in

---

299 TDS'09, 2010, p. 57.  
300 TDS'09, 2010, p. 57-58.  
301 TDS'09, 2010, p. 59.
household work considering the Tibetan population in the entire South Asia region\textsuperscript{302}. Similarly, there are 55\% male students but only 43\% females in the entire South Asia region\textsuperscript{303}. The other categories varied with 1-6\% between men and women.

**Categories of non-workers (15-65 years)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Students</th>
<th>Household workers</th>
<th>Dependents</th>
<th>Pensioners</th>
<th>Other</th>
<th>Not reported</th>
<th>Misreported</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>India</td>
<td>16 487</td>
<td>3 757</td>
<td>3 269</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>2 568</td>
<td>4 351</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>795</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepal</td>
<td>1 254</td>
<td>722</td>
<td>1 276</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>533</td>
<td>921</td>
<td>97</td>
<td>4 829</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>237</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>17 824</td>
<td>4 558</td>
<td>4 586</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>3 130</td>
<td>5 275</td>
<td>324</td>
<td>861</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percent</td>
<td>49.7</td>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>8.7</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: TDS '09 2010:58, table no 37

According to TDS '09 the dependency ratio has decreased from 53\% in 1998 to 41\% in 2009. The child dependency ratio was 39\% in 1998 while it is 27\% 2009. Old-age dependency has remained at 14\% since the previous survey.\textsuperscript{304} Poverty is a problem especially regarding the elderly and the sick that are unable to support themselves. About 2,100 individuals within the exile community are identified as living in poverty (using the measure of 'less than a dollar per capita per day' standard).\textsuperscript{305} Many of the elderly inhabitants of the exile community have suffered brutalities in Tibet during their escape and suffer trauma of exile, devoid of skills and host country language which make the issue of poverty further problematic.\textsuperscript{306}

**Household type and size**

As per definition of the Central Tibetan Administration used in the separate survey “Household List” here also two forms of households are recognized.\textsuperscript{307} A *normal household* is considered to be comprised of a group of individuals who regularly live together and take

\textsuperscript{302} TDS’09, 2010, p. 53.
\textsuperscript{303} TDS’09, 2010, p. 53.
\textsuperscript{305} http://tibetgov.net/poverty.html Retrieved 10\textsuperscript{th} February 2011
\textsuperscript{306} TDS’09, 2010.
\textsuperscript{307} TDS’09, 2010, p. 23.
their meals from a common kitchen unless exigencies of work prevent any of them from doing so. Institutional households are formed exclusively of unrelated individuals and could for example be school homes/dormitories, old age homes, institutions for disabled persons and monasteries/nunneries.

In South Asia, there are 22,060 Tibetan households out of which 20,709 are normal households and 1,351 are institutional households. Based on the 16,987 normal households with accurate Household List Number the average Tibetan normal household size is 4.0 individuals with the lowest number in India (3.8) and highest in Bhutan (5.2). The size in Nepal comprise of 3.9 individuals.

**Part 4. Analysis of the Relationship between Space and Livelihood Strategies**

This analysis consists of four examples of phenomenon that could be deemed to be reciprocal relationships between space and livelihoods. These four were the most commonly appearing patterns regarding space and livelihood in the empirical material. In order to analyze whether these spatial patterns indeed are examples of interdependent relationships between space and livelihood the theoretical framework accounted for above will be implemented. Initially however an analysis of the place specific spatial constraints and possibilities inherent in Dharamsala (McLeod Ganj and Gangchen Kyishong), Delhi (Samyeling) and Darjeeling and the institutions, policies and processes related to them is provided. Not every aspect of life and context in these places will be accounted for. With regards to the purpose of this thesis only aspects and factors deemed relevant by the respondents for their subjective situation will be provided as overarching processes and policies have already been accounted for in part three of this thesis. It is important, because of the qualitative method chosen, to provide an accurate picture of the place specific context affecting people who live there. Without it, spatial analysis of livelihood strategies would not be possible. These places will not only be analyzed from a vulnerability perspective but will also take into account the possibilities and how people make use of place (practice place) in order to further their livelihood goals.
4.1 Place Specific Context and the Institutions, Policies and Processes

Restraining or Enabling Them

Dharamsala

Nestled in the pine tree covered hills of Himachal Pradesh in northwestern India is McLeod Ganj. It is a former British hill station that was largely abandoned after the Kangra earthquake in 1905. Today however, the village has expanded enormously and become a compact, bustling town filled with shops, restaurants, guesthouses and NGO offices. It is also the home of the 14th Dalai Lama Tenzin Gyatso. Gangchen Kyishong is the governmental district located below McLeod Ganj and here the CTA has its offices as well as it being a home to many CTA workers. Together these two villages constitute the center of Tibetan exile politics and culture. Sometimes the area is even referred to as “Dhasa”, playing with the name of the nearby city Dharamsala and the capital in Tibet, Lhasa. Both McLeod Ganj and Gangchen Kyishong are parts of Dharamsala and are usually referred to, together with some other villages, as Upper Dharamsala.

![Figure 4: Main chowk in McLeod Ganj. Monks, Punjabi tourists and easy money transfer from abroad. Photo: Wilda Nilsson](image)

From the central square, main chowk, which doubles as a bus stop, several roads spread in different directions. Many hotels, restaurants, travel agents and souvenir-shops are located along Bhagsu Road besides the office of the Tibetan Women’s Association. Above it, Tipa

---


Road leads upwards towards Tibetan Institute of Performing Arts passing additional guesthouses and restaurants as well as the Men-Tse-Khang Clinic and the office of Tibetan Youth Congress along the way. Jogibara Road leads down toward Gangchen Kyishong and sports western inspired cafés, Korean restaurants, temples, and additional NGOs. If following Temple Road you will pass many market stalls before reaching Tsuglagkhang Temple. Scattered between the businesses catering to travelers and NGO offices are private houses but these seem quite few compared to the large amount of hotels in such a small village. Namgyel, who works at the Planning Commission of CTA attests that the biggest problem on the individual level in Dharamsala is unemployment and the lack of housing, especially for newly arrived Tibetans from Tibet.\(^\text{310}\) She continues to say that it is easier for Tibetans born in India to get jobs and housing.\(^\text{311}\)

Several of the students attending free English-classes at Learning and Ideas for Tibet (LIT) agree upon the biggest problem in McLeod Ganj; the lack of housing and employment, the narrow alleyways, lacking water supplies and poor sanitation.\(^\text{312}\) The roads are indeed noticeably narrow and the constant flow of traffic during the day makes walking hard seeing as one has to jump to the side, often on to the thresholds of stores, not to be hit by the fast moving vehicles. In terms of sanitation, the Clean Upper Dharamsala Project is contracted to take care of cleaning but they cannot keep up with the littering. The situation regarding quality of roads, sanitation and so on seems considerably improved in the exile government area Gangchen Kyishong down the hill from McLeod Ganj. There are not as many people there either.

Tenzin points at the difference between regulated settlements in south India and scattered settlements such as Dharamsala regarding livelihood strategies. In the south, sustainment possibilities are often created by CTA but in scattered settlements you have to arrange everything for yourself.\(^\text{313}\) In the Dharamsala-area, Tibetans do not have any land to lease from the Indian Government, therefore main sources of livelihood are the owning and managing of small restaurants, shops, seasonal petty business and handicraft work.\(^\text{314}\)

\(^{310}\) Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3  
^{311}\) Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3  
^{312}\) Group interview with students from LIT 17th June 2011  
^{313}\) Respondent reference: Dharamsala 14  
Delhi

The union territory Delhi has 12.6 million residents and consists of two cities, Shahjahanabad (Old Town) and New Delhi. Around 6 000 Tibetans live in Delhi and out of these approximately 361 families lives in Samyeling Tibetan settlement in Majnu Ka Tilla situated on the riverbank of Yamuna River in the northern, older part of Delhi. It was historically a centrally planned refugee camp starting out with tents but today it is accounted for as a scattered settlement and houses have sprung up without any proper urban planning, sometimes illegally. The settlement is also known under the name New Aruna Nagar and Tibetan Colony. Samyeling is a very small neighborhood, approximately only 500 meters long and 200 meters across and surrounded by Ring Road/ DR KB Hedgewar Road on the western side and Yamuna River on the eastern side. Within, the settlement buildings stand so close that it is impossible to drive with a car between them anywhere in the settlement. Instead rickshaws, bicycles with passenger seats, have to be used to deliver goods to stores and to transport people. Along one of the main alleys several market stalls cater to a diverse clientele and down even smaller side streets entrances to hotels can be located. In front of the temple is a small square where people gather to pray, talk or snack.

Figure 5: Samyeling scattered settlement. Source: Google Maps, highlighted by the author.

317 Respondent reference Delhi 5: Interview with respondent Pem-Tse La, secretary of Dorjee Dhondup president of New Aruna Nagar Colony Resident Welfare Association and owner of Kora Travels, in Samyeling, male, Tibetan, 31st May, 2011
318 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
319 Personal observations in Delhi in February 2011
The Department of Home is represented in Samyeling by the Tibetan Welfare Office. In Delhi Tibetans elect their own representative to the local assembly. Their tasks include acting as intermediaries with relevant authorities, pass on information, settle disputes and collect tax payments. The main source of the settler’s livelihood constitutes of business within the private sector. The most common livelihood strategies in Samyeling are running a guesthouse, restaurant, smaller business enterprise or selling wares at the local market. Many residents stay only for a short period of time before moving on to other places and Samyeling acts as a crossroad for tourists, pilgrims and newly arrived Tibetans heading towards Dharamsala or other places in India.

**Darjeeling**

Darjeeling is located in the state West Bengal and has 145 900 residents. The town is located 2 200 meters above sea level and experiences mild climate. The Tibetan population is either living in the Tibetan Refugee Self- Help Handicraft Center, which is considered to be a regular settlement, or they sustain themselves outside the center. This thesis concerns itself with those Tibetans residing outside the regulated settlement.

---

321 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
323 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
Sonam thinks the poor roads are a problem in Darjeeling as well as public transport. The road in front of his market stall broke three years ago and it has not been repaired yet.\textsuperscript{326} Because Darjeeling is extremely hilly he employs Nepali porters to carry his wares to and from the market stall every day.\textsuperscript{327} Shortage of water is also considered a problem by several respondents and Pema states that how much water you get depends on which area you live in and whether you have a good landlord or not.\textsuperscript{328} Otherwise, health care is lacking in Darjeeling and the area is prone to landslides.

Residents from several ethnicities such as Indians, Tibetans, Nepali, Sikkimese and Gorkhas inhabit Darjeeling. Many tourists, both Indian and foreign visit this old British hill station and the tea estates surrounding it.

\subsection*{4.2 Ethnic Enclaves (Spatial Congregation and the Impact on Livelihoods)}

Stepping out of the metro station Vidhan Sabha in New Delhi, Samyeling is easy to find. Simply saying that you want to go to the Tibetan colony is enough to have a rickshaw driver take you there. Samyeling corresponds readily to the definition of an ethnic enclave as a spatially concentrated area in which members of a particular population or group, self-defined by ethnicity of religion or otherwise, congregates as a means of enhancing their economic, social, political and/ or cultural development.\textsuperscript{329} The particular group, in this case the Tibetans, are indeed defining themselves as Tibetans even though they admit the heterogeneity among themselves regarding origins in Tibet, language and religion.\textsuperscript{330} In Samyeling, which is a residential neighborhood, there are many businesses owned and managed by Tibetans. Drawing upon the theory on ethnic businesses, the congregation of Tibetan businesses in a spatial cluster makes an important part in the emergence of an ethnic

\begin{figure}[ht]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{Figure_7}
\caption{The winding roads of Darjeeling. Photo: Wilda Nilsson}
\end{figure}

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\bibitem{326} Respondent reference Darjeeling 2: Group interview with 2 respondents in Darjeeling, male and female, Tibetan, April, 2011
\bibitem{327} Respondent reference: Darjeeling 2
\bibitem{328} Respondent reference Darjeeling 3: Interview with respondent in Darjeeling, female, Tibetan, 9\textsuperscript{th} April, 2011
\bibitem{329} D. Perrons, 2004.
\bibitem{330} Respondent reference: Delhi 2
\end{thebibliography}
economy. The concentration of potential customers is high and many of the stores sell products this clientele requires such as yak cheese, Tibetan bread, momos and Tibetan language books. Other stores and market stalls cater to tourists and pilgrims selling rosaries, incense, prayer flags and souvenirs. Still others sell modern clothes and sneakers which are required by the young Tibetans and Delhites alike. The business cluster and neighborhood as a whole clearly carries an attraction for tourists which make locating ones business within Samyeling a potential way of accessing a wealthy tourist clientele. Tourists are enticed by the texts in guidebooks as well as travelers gossip on the cafes in other parts of Delhi. The Lonely Planet guidebook describes the Tibetan colony as;

*The antidote for anyone who’s got the big city blues (...)It’s packed with travel agents, cyber cafés and trinket markets, and you’ll rub shoulders with maroon-clad Buddhist monks, curio vendors and local residents.*

As such, Samyeling is represented as a place with an inherent force of attraction consisting of something rather exotic, an idyllic and authentic place that will extract the visitor from the otherwise chaotic city. The representation of place often covers inequalities and differences within places as well as veiling the relationship between a certain place and the rest of the world. Meanings are created, contested and open to counter meanings produced through other representations. It will become clear from this analysis that Tibetans residing in Samyeling contest this representation of their neighborhood.

The effects of historical and contemporary spatial formation produced and continue to reproduce Samyeling. As described above, GOI and CTA instigated the spatial formations of settlements and this is an important part of the place history of Samyeling that affect the area today and is important to both its creation and its continued existence. One of the contemporary official policies of the CTA is to enhance and preserve the Tibetan culture and this is according to the CTA best and most effectively achieved through preserving especially the regulated settlements but also through integrating the scattered population. Many

---

335 T. Cresswell, p. 169.
individuals agree on this. According to Palden who is a resident of Samyeling, preserving the culture is a good reason for Tibetans to stay together also outside the regular settlements rather than spreading out. Pasang and Tenzin, both males in their fifties who also live in Samyeling, say that they prefer to live in tight knit communities with other Tibetans. The examples above show that social processes such as the wish to preserving culture affect the spatial formation of an ethnic enclave. Combining this with the arguments regarding Samyeling being an ethnic enclave with ethnic businesses provides an example of the reciprocal relationship between space and livelihoods.

Chendons states that she sometimes feels insecure in Samyeling due to the threat of eviction and relocation coming from the Yamuna Removal of Encroachment Monitoring Committee. Pem-Tse La, secretary of Dorjee Dhondup who is president of New Aruna Nagar Colony Welfare Association, is also worried even though the case has not yet been settled in court. Pem-Tse says that the Tibetans do not want to move to another area and that they do not want to be separated. Seeing as housing is scarce in Delhi, the possibility of recreating the ethnic enclave seems slim. The breaking up of the ethnic business cluster would profoundly affect business, and hence livelihood strategies, for the worse. The businesses would be particularly negatively affected if they had to change location due to regulations not allowing street markets in regular residence areas according to Pem-Tse La. Apart from the worries of losing place-specific sustaintment possibilities Tibetans do not want to lose their temple, community center and the Tibetan clinic and many in the older generation have sentimental bonds to the area. Hence, livelihoods in the ethnic business cluster seem place-based and once again the spatiality of livelihood strategies emerges.

Even though space can act enabling with regards to livelihood strategies such as it does in the above cases space can also operate as a constraining mechanism for livelihood systems.

337 Respondent reference Dharamsala 7: Group interview with 4 respondents in McLeod, males and females, Tibetan, 17th June 2011
338 Respondent reference Delhi 4: Group interview with 2 respondents in Samyeling, male, Tibetan, 30th May, 2011
339 Respondent ref: Delhi 1, female, 19 years
340 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
341 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
343 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
344 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
345 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
346 B. King, pp. 297-313.
Tenzin and Pasang state that the biggest place-specific problem they experience in Samyeling is the lack of living space, the narrow alleys obstructing transportation and they also feel it is too dirty and that sanitation does not work sufficiently enough. The Tibetan Welfare Association of Samyeling tries to pressure the local government to assert the problem. Local Indian authority has announced that they will attain to the problem but nobody knows how long it is going to take. Pasang manages a shop selling wares that look antique but really are newly produced by Indians and his opinion is that potential customers get thwarted by the filth in the area making them less inclined to buy something in his shop which has the entire front open right out to one of the alleys where garbage sometimes accumulates in piles before it is removed. Here, place-specific problems make space work as a constraint on Pasangs choice of livelihood.

Chendons family is renting the business locale in which her mother has her grocery store. They earn 8 000 INR per month after which they pay the rent of 3 000 INR/month for the store and an additional 3 000 INR/month in rent for the house in which they live. This makes it hard for them to save money and they cannot make any investments for the future. They have a savings account with around 10 000-15 000 INR at the moment which means they could pay for private health care if necessary but the saving are not sufficient in the long run would a more severe situation emerge. The biggest problem for their household according to Chendon is that they have to rent their house and store space which eats up a considerable amount of their small income every month. As has been accounted for above Tibetans who arrived after 1962 or has not applied for Indian citizenship are not allowed to own land or real-estate which is a policy severely constraining livelihood systems for many and Chendon’s situation could be seen as an example of this. As such, the space of India acts restraining for her family’s livelihood because of the policies controlling it. On the other hand, this policy is enabling for others such as Pasang’s wife who works as a nurse at Indian Government Hospital which is something Tibetans can only do if they either arrived before

347 Respondent reference: Delhi 4
348 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
349 Respondent reference: Delhi 5
350 Respondent reference: Delhi 4
351 Respondent reference: Delhi 4
352 Respondent ref: Delhi 1, female, 19 years
353 Respondent ref: Delhi 1, female, 19 years
354 Respondent ref: Delhi 1, female, 19 years
355 Respondent ref: Delhi 1, female, 19 years
1962 (Pasang says he arrived during the 1960’s but can’t remember which year\(^1\)) or if they have applied for Indian citizenship.

“I am so sad!”\(^{356}\) Jampa feels she does not have a choice apart from renting the market stall in Samyeling from a Tibetan acquaintance even though her income is very low while she waits for her Tibetan visa.\(^{357}\) She has applied for a visa to Tibet because she wants to visit her parents who are growing old.\(^{358}\) She has not seen them for several years. In India she does not have any children and is not married.\(^{359}\) Her previous visa application was denied and she estimates that she will have to wait in Delhi for a year and a half.\(^{360}\) Seeing she speaks only a limited amount of Hindi she would face a hard time trying to establish herself on the labor market outside the Tibetan community. In this case the paradox of an ethnic enclave economy is visible. The positive side including the ethnic resources, such as her acquaintance being able to provide her with an income opportunity stands against the negative in terms of low wage, poor working conditions and limited possibilities to expand outside the enclave.\(^{361}\)

With the formation of an ethnic enclave a spatial division has taken place which leaves the rest of the city outside. The spatial division often leads to social division between the enclave and the outside space.\(^{362}\) Less easy to see perhaps is the social division within the Tibetan enclave with regards to the younger generation’s priorities compared to that of the older generation. This could possibly further contribute social division and gentrification of Samyeling when especially lifestyle preferences is a driving force behind young educated people’s wish to leave the enclave possibly indicating that it is the low paid workers and the elderly that is forced to stay behind.\(^{363}\) The preference for a certain job or drive for more wealth is according to the SL-framework an internal factor affecting livelihood strategies.

Previously few Tibetans acquired higher education but the trend among young people today is to attend university.\(^{364}\) This might turn out hard, especially since the possibility to attend higher education is powerfully place-based and generally not widespread in working-class

\(^{356}\) Respondent reference Delhi 3: Interview with respondent in Samyeling, female, Tibetan, 30\(^{th}\) May, 2011

\(^{357}\) Respondent reference: Delhi 3

\(^{358}\) Respondent reference: Delhi 3

\(^{359}\) Respondent reference: Delhi 3

\(^{360}\) Respondent reference: Delhi 3


\(^{364}\) TDS’09, 2010.
areas. To counter this and to encourage higher education the CTA and several NGOs provide scholarships thus making it possible for additional young people to study. The chief of the Planning Commission of the CTA, Dr. Kunchok Tsundue, states that if the parents are educated, the kids will acquire education as well. He especially mentions the support system in educated families. The possibility to get a scholarship makes it possible people from working class families to attend university. Chendon, whose family situation was analyzed above, is one of them and her scholarship to Delhi University makes it possible for her to study commerce and so further her dreams of a career in banking. Her friend however, has no possibility to attend university seeing as her family cannot afford it and she did not get a scholarship. Here, we can see both how Indian space constrain Tibetans possibility to achieve education but also how CTA tries to overcome this without having Tibetans applying for Indian citizenship which would possibly conquer the spatial limitation. Still, even if Tibetans received Indian citizenship, their parents’ inability to pay schooling fees might be an impassable constraint and according to the theory of working class areas this might be a circle that is hard to break out of.

Heidi Swank defines McLeod Ganj and Gangchen Kyishong as a Tibetan enclave. There, a place-based feature of informal organized education affects the relationship between space and livelihoods. Knowledge in English greatly enhances the opportunity for exiled Tibetans to obtain employment in the ever expanding tourism industry and furthers dreams of migrating to the west or makes it possible to return to Tibet as English teachers or to stay in India working as translators. English classes are provided free of charge by many NGOs and one of them is Learning and Ideas for Tibet (LIT). Living in McLeod Ganj or Gangchen Kyishong makes it possible to attend these lessons which are place-based in the meaning that they depend on western volunteers to be teachers and they prefer to stay in this particular place rather than, for example, settlements in the south of India and that the NGOs are located there, which in turn makes the choices of possible livelihoods bigger for those living in this place and attending the lessons.

367 Respondent reference Dharamsala 2: Interview with respondent from Chief Planning Officer of the Planning Commission of the CTA Dr. Kunchok Tsundue, male, Tibetan, 16th June 2011
368 S. Roemer, 2008.
369 Respondent reference Delhi 1: Interview with respondent in Samyeling, female, Tibetan, 1 June, 2011
370 Respondent reference: Delhi 1
372 LIT
Places are important because they provide a site where socio-cultural processes, such as the place-based formation of ethnic-specific labor markets, to play out. When the ethnic enclave is a place lacking the possibilities to implement a certain livelihood strategy migration might be the livelihood strategy of choice and that will be analyzed further below.

4.3 Seasonality and Tourism (The Altering of Place-Specific, Time-Space Relations and the Impact on Livelihood strategies)

When the May-heat in New Delhi raises towards unbearable temperatures and droves of flies’ hordes in the dirty alleyways of Samyeling, the perceived serene atmosphere and fresh air of former British hill stations provides a lure most tourists seemingly cannot resist. Temporal changes such as seasonality are considered a low-level environmental stress to livelihood strategies and imply that the availability of resources increases or decrease depending on season. Seasonality is clearly related to spatial patterns of climate which in turn affect where the tourists go and when. Access to resources in terms of tourists and their money is depends on season but also on socially constructed temporalities such as when Dalai Lama is or is not in residence and giving teachings.

The CTA states that tourism is important for hotels and restaurants and such businesses. When His Holiness is in Dharamsala and gives teachings every guesthouse is full but when he is not there tourism decreases. In McLeod Ganj, Pasang works with her sister at a market stall along Temple Road very close to Tsuglagkhang Temple where the Dalai Lama resides. She says their business is very sensitive to seasonal changes related partly to the tourist season and partly to when the Dalai Lama is in residence which leads to both pilgrims and tourists visiting the place. She says that Dalai Lama is very important to all kinds of business in the area. It seems to worry people to think about what will happen to their livelihood strategies when the Dalai Lama passes away. Many seem afraid that tourism might decline and then people might be forced to change livelihood strategy or to take their current strategy with them someplace else. Yangzom is one of those who are worried that when Dalai Lama

---

373 N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung, p. 27.
374 Respondent reference Dharamsala 3: Interview with respondent from Planning Commission of the CTA, female, Tibetan, 16th June 2011.
377 Respondent reference Dharamsala 11: Interview with respondent from Learning and Ideas for Tibet, western women, volunteer, 10th June 2011.
passes away, business will go down because the proportion of tourists most likely will decrease.\(^{378}\) She works together with her husband in their roadside stall on Temple Road. Previously they used to migrate seasonally to Goa for six months to sell their wares but now they spend the entire year in Upper Dharamsala and do not want to resume seasonal migration.\(^{379}\) Seasonality in McLeod Ganj seems strongly related to the Dalai Lama being there or not. When the Dalai Lama is in McLeod Ganj and gives teachings access to resources increase which in turn has positive effect on the respondents’ livelihood strategies. His absence results in a decrease of resources, meaning the number of tourists and pilgrims that will spend money in the market stalls, hotels and so forth decline.

However, a negative impact of tourism on the spatial formation of McLeod Ganj is that the lack of housing for locals is worsened by the building of hotels and guest houses instead of houses for the locals.\(^{380}\) Tibetans are forced to rent rooms in guest houses and many individuals share the same room because they cannot afford anything else. The prices overall are also rising due to tourism.\(^{381}\) This was something that several of the LIT students pointed out as one of the biggest problems of Dharamsala.\(^{382}\)

In Darjeeling, Sonam and Tenzin both work in market stalls along Nehru Road (called The Mall) that leads up to the square Chowrasta.\(^{383}\) They sell an assortment of clothes and souvenirs. Previously they were only allowed to have the stalls open three months per year and had to move around the country during the rest of the year.\(^{384}\) Since two years back however they have been allowed by local authorities to be open all year round in Darjeeling.\(^{385}\) Their income depends on season with May to July and September to December being the good months with more tourists in town. During this time they earn the majority of the year’s wage.\(^{386}\) Pema's business (The Snow Lion Homestay) is depending on seasonality regarding

\(^{378}\) Respondent reference Dharamsala 15: Interview with respondent in McLeod Ganj, female, Tibetan, June 2011
\(^{379}\) Respondent reference: Dharamsala 15
\(^{380}\) Respondent reference: Dharamsala 11
\(^{381}\) Respondent reference: Dharamsala 11
\(^{382}\) Group interview with students from LIT 17th June 2011
\(^{383}\) Respondent reference: Darjeeling 2
\(^{384}\) Respondent reference: Darjeeling 2
\(^{385}\) Respondent reference: Darjeeling 2
\(^{386}\) Respondent reference: Darjeeling 2
the numbers of tourists that arrive.\textsuperscript{387} She stays in Darjeeling all year around, even in the slow season, because she has to take care of her mother (88 years) and father (72 years).\textsuperscript{388}

Seasonality also affects the livelihood strategies in Samyeling. Pem-Tse La owns the travel agency Kora Travels located opposite the hotel named Wongdhen House. The livelihood strategies in the tertiary sector depends on costumers and Samyeling holds an attraction to tourists, pilgrims and Delhi-residents alike but during the summer business is slow due to the hot climate making many visitors prefer either colder places or AC malls in other parts of Delhi.\textsuperscript{389} As such, seasonality in terms of when tourists or pilgrims visit the Tibetan scattered settlements accounted for above or not seems to affect the livelihood strategies to a great extent. The process of seasonality is depending on place-specific, time-space relations in terms of both climate zones and socially constructed temporalities such as when the Dalai Lama is in residence.

4.4 Migration (Spatial Patterns or Processes and their Impact on Livelihood Strategies)

Migration is an important factor affecting change in the population of the Tibetan exile community.\textsuperscript{390} Education and seeking better livelihood opportunities are the two main reasons to migrate.\textsuperscript{391} Out of the 75\% of the exile population who is found to have migrated, 52\% changed their residence permanently due to educational or economic opportunities.\textsuperscript{392} A future trend is deemed to be additional international migration with 68\% of the adult population stating their intention to migrate to another country.\textsuperscript{393} Migration as a coping strategy is an idea that has gained acceptance which means that migration is not only a response to emergencies but integral to people’s livelihood strategies.

Pem-Tse La says that there is a scarcity of jobs within the Tibetan community and because people always look for prosperity they will migrate if necessary.\textsuperscript{394} He thinks that especially young people have a hard time finding employment within the Tibetan community even though he has no statistics of it. He says that older people in the south of India work in

\begin{flushleft}
\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{387} Respondent reference: Darjeeling 3  \\
\textsuperscript{388} Respondent reference: Darjeeling 3  \\
\textsuperscript{389} Personal observations in Delhi in May 2011  \\
\textsuperscript{390} D. Bernstoff & H. von Welck, p. 202.  \\
\textsuperscript{391} D. Bernstoff & H. von Welck, 2004.  \\
\textsuperscript{392} TDS'09, 2010, p. 15.  \\
\textsuperscript{393} TDS'09, 2010, p. 15.  \\
\textsuperscript{394} Respondent reference: Delhi 5
\end{footnotesize}
\end{flushleft}
agriculture but younger people need, and want, other jobs. Dr. Kunchok Tsundue confirms this when I visit the office of the Planning Commission of the CTA in Gangchen Kyishong. He says that it is especially hard for educated people to get jobs within the exile community. The CTA tries to create jobs for them but until then, they will have to take jobs offered from Indian employers. One respondent in Dharamsala described her feelings regarding the exile community’s inability to absorb the university educated youth as though they just disappear forever in the vastness of India when they get sucked into the Indian corporate world. When there is a lack of certain kinds of jobs people who want them are forced to migrate if they do not want to change occupation. This was also pointed out by a respondent in Darjeeling. He refers to his own daughter and says that she has already migrated to study product design in Bangalore but she might have to move somewhere else than Darjeeling afterwards because that kind of profession might not be possible to practice in Darjeeling. Namgyel from the Planning Commission of CTA says that educated people do not want to live in Dharamsala. She says they need engineers for construction projects but educated Tibetan engineers will go and work for Indian companies or the Government of India where the salary is better. “We want the highly skilled to stay in the Tibetan community, we would like to be able to absorb them.” She says that the CTA are planning to start programs through which to absorb highly qualified people and they have thought about starting call centers but such programs take time to implement and are very capital intensive. We need to take advantage of India’s booming technology but it is hard to get sponsors interested. For many people, migration can be implemented as a spatial strategy when the opportunities in one place are not enough they will seek opportunities and/or resources someplace else.

Related to migration are remittances and as has been accounted for in the theoretical framework, migration abroad usually means enhanced possibilities of higher remittances. Migration to the west is a lure for many according to Dr. Kunchok Tsundue. Sonam wants

395 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 2
396 Respondent reference Dharamsala 9: Informal talk with owner of a coffee shop in McLeod Ganj, male, Tibetan, 15th June 2011
397 Respondent reference Darjeeling 1: Interview with respondent in Darjeeling, male, Tibetan, 9th April, 2011
398 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
399 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
400 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
401 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
402 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 2
403 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 2
404 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 2
to work in the USA to earn a higher income. He wishes that his family had somebody in the USA who could remit money to them. Dr. Kunchok Tsundue stated that remittances are very important on the household and individual level. Remittances make it possible for people to build new houses and acquire an education. Private sponsorships are common but corporate funds do not receive as much support. Namgyal goes as far as stating that; remittances are very important, you could call the Tibetan economy in exile a ‘remittances economy’.

Palden, 20, walked to India in year 2000 with 15 other people though none of them were from her family. She migrated to India in order to get an education. After attending high school she received a scholarship to attend a university in Bangalore where she will study commerce for 3 years. She wants to go back to Tibet but does not know if it will be possible. If she stays in India she wants to work in banking and says she would move anywhere in India where she can get a job. She will not be able to work with banking in Tibet since she cannot speak Chinese. While she is in India she sometimes receive remittances from her parents in Tibet. Also Gelek who lives in McLeod Ganj has relatives abroad, in Belgium and Canada, who sometimes can remit money to him but otherwise he tries to arrange parties and concerts to earn his living. These parties are usually attended by foreign tourists making it clear that also this livelihood strategy depends upon the seasonality discussed above.

Namgyal estimates that about 50% of the Tibetans have family abroad and receiving remittances is of great help for survival and to be able to pay for education. Few went for higher education in the 1990’s but the numbers have increased largely thanks to remittances. Seeing that it is important for households and individuals to receive remittances from members of the family, migration could possibly be called a version of spatial dispersion of livelihood strategies where one or more of the members of a family take advantage of the economic opportunities abroad while others stay in India.

405 Respondent reference: Darjeeling 2
406 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 2
407 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
408 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 7
409 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 7
410 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 7
411 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 7
412 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 7
413 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
414 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
Chendon wants to migrate from Samyeling in the future; she is looking for a higher living standard than what is available in Samyeling where she thinks it is dirty and that there is a lack of employment possibilities for people with a higher degree. She has been awarded a scholarship to Delhi University with the main subject being commerce and believes that if she works hard enough she can obtain a job within banking and leave Samyeling. She states that most young people want to leave Samyeling and find better jobs and housing in other places. Chendon says that many Tibetan families receive remittances from relatives who live in other parts of India and abroad. As such, she is an example of how, according to the SL-framework, people use livelihood assets and capabilities to create and implement their livelihood strategy and how they will try to increase both assets and access to these. In her case she has applied for, and received, a scholarship to university which in time will give her the capability and assets in terms of a degree, probably a network outside the ethnic enclave and so on making it possible for her to migrate from Samyeling.

Eshi used migration as a spatial livelihood strategy when she moved from Bangalore and her relatively well-paid (15 000 INR/m) job as a hairdresser because she wanted a change of place. She used her assets in terms of language skills (human capital) in order to get a job in Delhi. She speaks Tibetan, Hindi, English, Kannada, Orya and Bengali. She works in the front desk at a guest house in Samyeling. She points out the problems for newly arrived Tibetans (refugees/migrants from Tibet) regarding language skills. They neither know Hindi nor do they speak the same dialect of Tibetan that is predominantly used in Samyeling.

When Tenzin Yangzom was elected an executive member of Tibetan Youth Congress (TYC) she moved from her birthplace Dhera Dun (India) to Dharamsala. Three years later she was reelected and therefore stayed in Dharamsala to work as Information Secretary at TYC. Before that she lived in Delhi while studying at University at which she received a scholarship. She states that young people do not want to work with sweater selling, they

---

415 Respondent reference: Delhi 1  
416 Respondent reference: Delhi 1  
417 Respondent reference: Delhi 1  
418 Respondent reference: Delhi 1  
419 Respondent reference: Delhi 2: Interview with respondent in Samyeling, female, Tibetan, 30th May, 2011  
420 Respondent reference: Delhi 2  
421 Respondent reference: Delhi 2  
422 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 14: Interview with respondent from Tibetan Youth Congress, female, Tibetan, June 2011  
423 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 14  
424 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 14
want to acquire an education and a better job but seeing as there is a shortage of positions for
the educated many educated people end up working with small businesses such as having a
small store anyway.\textsuperscript{425} Even if people move abroad and procured higher education, they
usually end up with jobs that require lower qualifications than their level of education.\textsuperscript{426}

Both migration and remittances are important for the exile community. People seem to want
to increase their assets and access to these and many deem migration the best, or the only
available, option to achieve this. As mentioned above, spatial dispersion of members in a
household makes it possible to take advantage of economic opportunities in multiple places.
As such, migrating and sending remittances seem closely related to the phenomenon denoted
as spatial dispersion, a strategy that will be further analyzed below.

4.5 Spreading out or Diversify? (Spatial Dispersion, Diversification and the
Impact on Livelihood strategies)

Livelihood diversification refers to the process by which households construct a diverse
portfolio of activities and social support capabilities in order to survive and improve their
standard of living.\textsuperscript{427} Livelihood diversification can be found on the level of the individual,
the household or any larger social grouping. Occurring on the household level it could mean
that each member has a single occupation.\textsuperscript{428} This way the strategy does not take away the
advantages of specialization.\textsuperscript{429}

Most Tibetans plan their economy on the household level even though some plan their
economy individually and others might have their own savings within the family economy.\textsuperscript{430}
When it comes to diversification, it seems rare on the individual level. Chendon claims that
diversification does not exist on the individual level in her community (Samyeling). Rather
people have a single occupation which they do all year around.\textsuperscript{431} Her thoughts are supported
by the Planning Commission of the CTA which states that diversification on the individual
level is rare.\textsuperscript{432} Neither the anonymous representative from the Department of Home of the

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{425} Respondent reference: Dharamsala 14
\item \textsuperscript{426} Respondent reference: Dharamsala 14
\item \textsuperscript{427} F. Owusu, 2009.
\item \textsuperscript{428} F. Ellis, 2000.
\item \textsuperscript{429} F. Ellis, 2000.
\item \textsuperscript{430} Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
\item \textsuperscript{431} Respondent ref: Delhi 1, female, 19 years
\item \textsuperscript{432} Respondents Dharamsala 3
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
CTA believes that diversification of livelihood strategies are common on the individual level. Steady employment in India is scarce and Dorjee Dolma states that it is unusual but diversification happens in McLeod Ganj and that people who do not have a permanent employment use diversification as their strategy.

Linked to livelihood diversification is the proliferation of multi-local livelihoods which includes nontraditional household living arrangements and transnational networks. Livelihood diversification often requires a more spatially extended understanding of the household. Through spatial dispersion of members in a household, advantage can be taken of economic opportunities in multiple rural and urban places or multiple countries. These households are referred to as divided households and comprise of members working in urban centers or abroad. It is common for families to part and work in different cities when they do not think the income is enough. Still most of them have shared economy.

Chendon’s family practices multi-local livelihoods. She lives in Samyeling with her mother while her father lives and works in Dharamsala. In Samyeling,Chendon’s mother manages a small store selling groceries such as rice and eggs where Chendon also helps out. Chendon’s father manages a similar store in Dharamsala.

Tenzin and his wife also implement spatial dispersion as a livelihood strategy. Tenzin lives in Samyeling and has changed his occupation from being a teacher for young children to managing a guesthouse which he rents from a monastery for 7500 INR/month. His wife runs a restaurant in eastern India. Tenzin’s son studies engineering at the university.

Pema Tenzin has a daughter with an MBA who works in Bangalore in Karnataka state with human resources but she does not send any remittances nor do they have a shared economy.

---

433 N. DeVotta, pp. 124.
434 Respondent reference Dharamsala 5: Interview with respondent Dorjee Dolma, Tibetan Settlement Officer in McLeod, female, Tibetan, 7th June 2011
436 Respondent reference: Dharamsala 3
437 Respondent ref: Delhi 1, female, 19 years
438 Respondent ref: Delhi 1, female, 19 years
439 Respondent reference: Delhi 4
440 Respondent reference: Delhi 4
441 Respondent reference: Delhi 4
442 Respondent reference: Delhi 4
443 Respondent reference: Darjeeling 3
Pema, her husband and their son can sustain themselves in Darjeeling because they own a hotel.\textsuperscript{444} They seem to have implemented spatial dispersion in order to create individual economies independent of each other and use spatial dispersion since both the ownership of a hotel with Tibetan profile and the profession of Pema’s daughter was not able to co-exist in the same place.

Also Kunsang and her husband implement spatial dispersion without sharing their economy. Kunsang rents a store space in Darjeeling while her husband works as a secretary for the Tibetan Welfare Association in Dharamsala.\textsuperscript{445} They have separate economies and she is saving money in her own bank account.\textsuperscript{446} She also has two sisters who work in the USA remitting money every month.\textsuperscript{447} Before she came to Darjeeling she lived in Bhutan.\textsuperscript{448} In accordance to McSweeney, Kunsang creates her livelihood cross-nationally since she buys the clothes she sells in Darjeeling from Nepal.\textsuperscript{449} Same goes for Pasang who says she and her sister buy a lot of their wares such as yak bone and turquoise necklaces directly from Tibetans who have carried them from Tibet.\textsuperscript{450} The Clean Upper Dharamsala Project gives an additional example of how the construction of livelihoods in networks is bigger than the local community. At Clean Upper Dharamsala Project, which is contracted by Tibetan Welfare Office and which has a contract from Indian authorities of taking care of garbage in Upper Dharamsala (McLeod Ganj, Bhagsu, Daramkot, Narit and Forsyth Ganj), both Tibetans and Indians work as street sweepers and so called greenworkers. The garbage collected is sold to Sitram who in turn sells it to someone else, thus connecting local sustainment possibilities to other scales.\textsuperscript{451}

\textbf{Part 5. Conclusions and Discussion}

The purpose of this thesis was to highlight possible reciprocal links between space and livelihoods in specific places in the Tibetan exile-community in India. The research questions asked whether such relationships existed, and if they did how space and livelihoods are interconnected in Upper Dharamsala, Samyeling and Darjeeling. Through a qualitative field

\textsuperscript{444} Respondent reference: Darjeeling 3
\textsuperscript{445} Respondent reference Darjeeling 4: Interview with respondent in Darjeeling, female, Tibetan, April, 2011
\textsuperscript{446} Respondent reference: Darjeeling 4
\textsuperscript{447} Respondent reference: Darjeeling 4
\textsuperscript{448} Respondent reference: Darjeeling 4
\textsuperscript{449} Respondent reference: Darjeeling 4
\textsuperscript{450} Respondent reference: Dharamsala 12
\textsuperscript{451} Respondent reference Dharamsala 4: Interview with respondent from Clean Upper Dharamsala Project, female, Swedish, June 2011
study, using semi-structured, in-depth interviews as the primary method of data collection, answers to the research questions was sought. The analysis of the empirical material and secondary sources was made using the theoretical framework on space, place and livelihoods. With regards to the ontological and epistemological assumptions, generalizations are not deemed possible from the results but I believe that it is possible to draw a few place-specific conclusions from data collected.

The first research question asked whether it was possible to distinguish reciprocal relationships in the places of study. Concluding on the fact that it was possible to present no less than four examples of such a connection I state that; yes, reciprocal relationships between space and livelihoods exist in Upper Dharamsala, Samyeling and Darjeeling.

These relationships are believed to be place-specific and subjective and it was possible to highlight specific examples of the phenomena. Four examples of how space and livelihood strategies are interconnected have been found:

1. Spatial congregation into an ethnic enclave connects space and the livelihoods created and implemented there, as well as their outcome regarding for example the possibility to attract customers.

2. Altering of place specific time-space relations impact livelihood strategies through for example the seasonality of tourism and socially constructed temporal changes, such as when the Dalai Lama is in residence in McLeod Ganj.

3. Place-specific constraints or possibilities affect migration which in turn is a spatial pattern.

4. Spatial dispersion of livelihoods in order to take advantage of the income opportunities in more than one place exist and this is an example of the relationship between space and livelihoods.

Through highlighting these examples of how livelihoods and space are interconnected I have answered the second research question. Therefore, I argue that spatial relations between space and livelihoods were possible to distinguish in the context of Tibetan livelihood strategies in
the exile community in three specific places. Supporting these claims is the fact that apart from the analysis of empirical data this thesis has taken both historical and contemporary spatial patterns into account when analyzing livelihoods.452

The conclusions of this thesis agree with Brian King’s in terms of showing how the production and reproduction of livelihoods are interlinked with the processes producing and reproducing space.453 Differentiating from King is the specific examples of the phenomena (the reciprocal relationships) that have been highlighted in this thesis compared to King’s research. Based on the conclusions of this thesis I strongly believe that means of livelihood is correlative with place of residence and if the place of residence lacks sufficient possibilities people will implement strategies such as migration or spatial dispersion in order to take advantage of assets/access to assets in other places. I believe this is something that needs to be taken into account when utilizing the SL-framework’s asset pentagon and as such, the importance of spatializing livelihoods emerge as something that ought to be integral to livelihood research seeing that assets/access to assets is spatially defined as is the strategies people implement in order to get hold of assets/access to assets. My belief is that the livelihood approaches would benefit profoundly from integrating considerations on spatiality in the research design. A reasonable point of departure for future research would be the construction of a hypothesis stating that reciprocal relationships between space and livelihoods exist in other places as well. Perhaps even delimiting the study to one of the four examples of the phenomena presented above. Reconnecting to this thesis in particular I argue that it has indeed fulfilled its purpose although there are naturally things I could have done differently.

It would have been possible to make delimitations differently which might have benefitted the purpose of the thesis. If I had chosen to conduct fieldwork in a single location, for example Samyeling in Delhi, I could quite possibly been able to deepen my results on place-specific relations between space and livelihoods. Seeing they are place-specific I did not need to go to several places. There were of course advantages with this as well, my understanding of the exile community was broadened and statistical material from CTA could only be obtained in Dharamsala. I could also have constructed a hypothesis regarding ethnic enclaves and then focused solely on this single example of the phenomenon.

452 B. King, pp. 297-313.
453 B. King, p. 309.
Part 6. Summary
The purpose of this thesis has been to find out whether reciprocal links between space and livelihoods exist in specific places the Tibetan exile-community in India and if such relationships exist, highlight specific examples of them through analysis of the phenomena. In order to fulfill the purpose, two research questions were constructed:

1. Is it possible to distinguish a reciprocal relationship between space and livelihoods in certain places in the Tibetan exile community?

2. If yes, how are space and livelihoods interconnected in the Tibetan exile-community in India?

Livelihood strategies have been researched extensively within several fields of the academia but much of this research has neglected detection and analysis of the interconnected relationships between space and livelihoods. This thesis has investigated these relationships from a place-specific point of view utilizing the Tibetan exile community in India as a case study. Delimitations were made regarding which geographical locations in India that were to be studied and the choice fell upon the scattered settlements Samyeling Settlement in New Delhi, McLeod Ganj and Gangchen Kyishong in Dharamsala and Darjeeling. Importantly however, the study took into account both historical and contemporary spatial patterns such as the relationship between China and India, and the different contemporary geographies, such as economic and political geography, taking place in India today.

Based on ontological and epistemological assumptions drawn from the humanistic approach of human geography, emphasizing especially the subjectivity of the researcher and the observed phenomena, the study focused upon the respondents’ subjective perception of reality. The thesis has accentuated place and the social relations within as something which is constantly produced and reproduced through the changing and interdependent relationships between people and place. Trying to objectively measure place and the people dwelling within was deemed not to further the purpose of this thesis. Therefore, qualitative research methods were utilized. Drawing inspiration from literature on the field study approach the research design was outlined to incorporate semi-structured, in-depth interviews as the primary method of data gathering. The selection process of respondents was made with the overall objective of finding participants that could help explaining people’s experiences in relation to the research topic. As such, the selection of respondents has been opportunistic.
while also drawing on the iterative approach. The selection process in field consisted partly of cold calling, recruiting on site and snowballing. Taking into account the awareness among many contemporary human geographers that no single method of conducting fieldwork provides unmediated, unbiased, and privileged access to the topic of investigation this thesis embraces the importance of accounting for the positionality and reflexivity of the researcher in the generation of geographic data and knowledge.

Theoretically, the thesis primarily draws upon the human geographic perspectives on space and place while also broadening the use of the conceptual frame called the Sustainable Livelihood framework with regards to the critique put forward by Brian King. He points out the inability of livelihood approaches to appreciate and take into account the interconnected relationship between space and livelihoods. Space was in the thesis perceived as relational, meaning space was conceived to be contingent and active. Places were in turn conceptualized as a particular geographical location that has acquired a set of meanings and attachments. As such, place is seen as a meaningful site that combines location, locale and sense of place. Places were understood to be practiced by people and commonly to be connected with a particular identity which sometimes leads to spatial divisions which in turn can create social divisions. Places were seen as especially important because they provide a site where socio-cultural processes play themselves out. Therefor a place-specific and subjective point of view was used throughout the thesis.

This thesis argues that, grounded in the data collected, it is possible to distinguish four reciprocal relationships between space and livelihoods in the places studied. These are spatial congregation into an ethnic enclave, the altering of place specific time-space relations which alters livelihood possibilities over time, migration and spatial dispersion of livelihoods. These results are, because of the ontology, epistemology and method used deemed case specific and not generalizable.

The thesis ended with a discussion regarding the relation between place and the asset pentagon from the SL-framework which in turn affects the preference to migrate. Also, the

454 R. Longhurst, pp. 580-584.
456 B. King, 2011.
457 B. King, 2011.
459 N.M. Coe, P. F. Kelly & H.W.C. Yeung, p. 27.
discussion put emphasis on the importance integrating analysis of the spatiality of livelihoods into livelihood research.

**List of References**

**Literature**


Articles


P. Knutsson, The Sustainable Livelihoods Approach: A Framework for Knowledge Integration Assessment

F. Ellis, Rural Livelihoods and Diversity in Developing Countries, Oxford University Press, Oxford, 2000.


Reports and statistics
Central Tibetan Administration- Planning Commission Tibetan Community in Exile-Integrated Development Plan- IV 2009-2013, Dharamsala, 2010

Department of Information and International Relations, Introduction to the Central Tibetan Administration, Dharamsala, 2011.


Internet

http://www.ccsr.ac.uk/methods, Retrieved 10th December 2011


http://www.ne.se/lang/delhi/151880, Retrieved 4th December 2011


Interviews

Interviews conducted in the Dharamsala-area:
Respondent reference Dharamsala 2: Interview with respondent from Chief Planning Officer of the Planning Commission of the CTA Dr. Kunchok Tsundue, male, Tibetan, 16th June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 3: Interview with respondent from Planning Commission of the CTA, female, Tibetan, 16th June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 4: Interview with respondent from Clean Upper Dharamsala Project, female, Swedish, June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 5: Interview with respondent Dorjee Dolma, Tibetan Settlement Officer in McLeod, female, Tibetan, 7th June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 7: Group interview with 4 respondents in McLeod, males and females, Tibetan, 17th June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 9: Informal talk with owner of a coffee shop in McLeod Ganj, male, Tibetan, 15th June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 11: Interview with respondent from Learning and Ideas for Tibet, western women, volunteer, 10th June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 12: Interview with respondent in McLeod Ganj, female, Tibetan, June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 14: Interview with respondent from Tibetan Youth Congress, female, Tibetan, June 2011

Respondent reference Dharamsala 15: Interview with respondent in McLeod Ganj, female, Tibetan, June 2011

Group interview with students from LIT 17th June 2011

Interviews conducted in the Samyeling-area of Delhi:

Respondent reference Delhi 1: Interview with respondent in Samyeling, female, Tibetan, 1June, 2011

Respondent reference Delhi 2: Interview with respondent in Samyeling, female, Tibetan, 30th May, 2011

Respondent reference Delhi 3: Interview with respondent in Samyeling, female, Tibetan, 30th May, 2011
Respondent reference Delhi 4: Group interview with 2 respondents in Samyeling, male, Tibetan, 30th May, 2011

Respondent reference Delhi 5: Interview with respondent Pem-Tse La, secretary of Dorjee Dhondup president of New Aruna Nagar Colony Resident Welfare Association and owner of Kora Travels, in Samyeling, male, Tibetan, 31th May, 2011

**Interviews conducted in the Darjeeling-area:**

Respondent reference Darjeeling 1: Interview with respondent in Darjeeling, male, Tibetan, 9th April, 2011

Respondent reference Darjeeling 2: Group interview with 2 respondents in Darjeeling, male and female, Tibetan, April, 2011

Respondent reference Darjeeling 3: Interview with respondent in Darjeeling, female, Tibetan, 9th April, 2011

Respondent reference Darjeeling 4: Interview with respondent in Darjeeling, female, Tibetan, April, 2011

**Observations**
Personal observations in Delhi in February 2011

Personal observations in Delhi in May 2011